

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: November 10, 2015

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$3,791,825.20</b>
		0.49%	0.97%	1.91%	5.92%	14.26%	

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
<b>a</b>	The bidder is <b>pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>b</b>	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>c</b>	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B10</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>d</b>	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an <b>active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>e</b>	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
	<b>BID IS:</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: November 10, 2015

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$3,791,825.20</b>

<b>PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors (329.20)</b>		<b>INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)</b>					
<b>a</b>	The bidder <b>provided a list of subcontractors</b> with bid or indicated there were not any subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1) <b>FORM B6</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>b</b>	If subcontractors are listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM B6 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>c</b>	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h) <b>(If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>d</b>	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) <b>(If no subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>e</b>	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(h)(5) <b>(If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>f</b>	Bidder <b>stated, via affidavit</b> , that its proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(h)(3) <b>Form B10 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>g</b>	Bidder <b>did not bid</b> subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city. (329.20)(h)(4) <b>(see links on Tab 5)</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>BID IS:</b>		<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: November 10, 2015

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$3,791,825.20</b>

<b>PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)</b>		<b>INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)</b>					
<b>a</b>	Bidder <b>did not</b> submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>b</b>	Bidder <b>acknowledged</b> addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) <b>BID SIGNATURE PAGE, page 2</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>c</b>	Bidder <b>complied</b> with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>d</b>	The bid <b>contains</b> no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(f)(1)(d)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>e</b>	Bidder added <b>no</b> provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>f</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) <b>FORM B2, FORM B3</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>g</b>	Bidder <b>did not submit</b> an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) <b>FORM B2, FORM B3</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>h</b>	Bid prices <b>are</b> materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) <b>FORM B4</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>i</b>	Bid contains <b>no</b> irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>j</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) <b>FORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>k</b>	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) <b>FORM B4 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>l</b>	Bidder <b>has complied</b> with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) <b>FORM B6</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>m</b>	Bid <b>does not</b> contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it <b>does</b> respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>n</b>	Bid <b>responds</b> to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>o</b>	Bid is complete. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: November 10, 2015

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$3,791,825.20</b>
	<b>BID IS:</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>	<b>RESPONSIVE</b>

**TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness**

version: November 10, 2015

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$3,791,825.20</b>

<b>PART ID: Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance</b>		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to contract execution.					
<b>a</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>

<b>Bid Responsivness, Waiver Considerations:</b>	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II
<b>Proceed to Part II?</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>

<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	← <b>Manually Enter Amount</b>
<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	← <b>Manually Enter Information</b>

**TAB II: Assessing Responsibility**

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

CIP No.	690236-10060	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$ 3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$ 3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$ 3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$ 3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$ 3,791,825.20</b>

PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")					
<b>a</b>	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). <b>FORM B4, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>b</b>	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. <b>FORM B7, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>c</b>	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. <b>FORM B7, SPECIFICATIONS</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>d</b>	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. <b>FORM B8,</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>e</b>	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. <b>FORM B8</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>f</b>	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. <b>FORM B8</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>g</b>	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. <b>FORM B8</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>h</b>	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. <b>FORM B9</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>
<b>Responsibility Score:</b>		<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Continue to TAB 3?</b>		<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>

↑  
Manually Enter Information

**TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder**

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
-----------------	--	------------------	-------------------------

<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II):</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-100060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$ 3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$ 3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$ 3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$ 3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$ 3,791,825.20</b>
<b>PART III: 329.01(u) and 329.212 Local Bidder</b>							

<b>IS BID LOCAL?</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>YES</b>
----------------------	------------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	------------

To look up if a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's list located at [X:\Construction Prequalification](#)

<b>PART IIIA:</b>	
<b>step 1</b>	<p>IF <b>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL</b>, STOP. Skip steps 2-5 and enter data in Steps 6 &amp; 7 and continue to TAB IV.</p> <p>IF <b>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL</b>, CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2 (see above for apparent low bid and bidder information)</p>

<b>Part IIIB:</b>							
<b>step 2</b>	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	<b>0.000%</b>	<b>0.495%</b>	<b>1.465%</b>	<b>3.406%</b>	<b>9.524%</b>	<b>25.147%</b>
<b>step 3</b>	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NO</b>
<b>step 4</b>	If <b>step 3</b> is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
<b>step 5</b>	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)						

<b>Part IIIC:</b>	
<b>step 6</b>	<p><b>REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:</b></p> <p><b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b></p>
<b>step 7</b>	<p><b>REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:</b></p> <p><b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b></p>

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

**TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference**

<b>PROJECT:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	<b>Bid Date:</b>	<b>December 9, 2015</b>
<b>Department/Division:</b>	<b>Public Utilities / Water</b>	<b>Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Distribution</b>	<b>Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899</b>

<b>CIP No.</b>	<b>690236-10060</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<b>Bob Arnold, P.E.</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	<b>\$ 3,575,455.00</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>	<b>Bid Amount</b>
		<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$ 3,044,893.64</b>	<b>\$ 3,074,294.66</b>	<b>\$ 3,133,086.16</b>	<b>\$ 3,318,454.08</b>	<b>\$ 3,791,825.20</b>
<b>PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference</b>							
<b>Apparent Low Bid:</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>Apparent Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>				

<b>PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference</b>							
<b>step 1</b>	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer "YES" or "NO" for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input "NA"	<b>YES</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>step 2</b>	Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid?	<b>YES</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>YES</b>	<b>NO</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>step 3</b>	<b>STOP.</b> If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5.  If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.						
<b>step 4</b>	Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non-environmental low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.	<b>0.000%</b>	<b>0.495%</b>	<b>1.465%</b>	<b>3.406%</b>	<b>9.524%</b>	<b>25.147%</b>
<b>step 5</b>	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ 15,068.42</b>	<b>\$ 20,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 20,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 20,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 20,000.00</b>
<b>step 6</b>	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim environmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,825.22</b>	<b>\$ 3,054,294.66</b>	<b>\$ 3,113,086.16</b>	<b>\$ 3,298,454.08</b>	<b>\$ 3,771,825.20</b>
<b>step 7</b>	<b>Low Bid Amount:</b> <b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>	<b>Low Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>				

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information



**TAB V. Miscellaneous**

<b>Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>
<b>Project:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	

**Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)**

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

<i>Bidders</i>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>Fields Excavating</b>	<b>Underground Utilities</b>	<b>Elite Excavating</b>	<b>Beheler</b>	<b>Savko &amp; Sons</b>
<b>Bid</b>	\$ 3,029,899.42	\$ 3,044,893.64	\$ 3,074,294.66	\$ 3,133,086.16	\$ 3,318,454.08	\$ 3,791,825.20
<b>Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid</b>	0.49%	0.97%	1.91%	5.92%	14.26%	

**Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?**

YES
YES

**If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?**

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

**Bid Guarantee Requirements**

**Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.**

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

YES
YES

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

Certified/Cashier's Check

Drawn on a solvent bank

**Contract Compliance**

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

YES
-----

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

**Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp**

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

NO
N/A

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio

**This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid**

<http://www.sos.state.oh.us/>

**Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:**

<b>Project Name:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>
<b>Recommended Bidder:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>
<b>Contract Amount:</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>

Evaluator's Name:	Missy Smith 645-3776
Evaluation Completion Date:	12/11/2015

**Additional Information for Departments:**

**State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor**

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

<https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html>

<b>Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:</b>	<b>Shelly &amp; Sands</b>	<b>\$ 3,029,899.42</b>
<b>Project:</b>	<b>Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's</b>	

**Federal - System for Award Management**

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

<https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1>

**City of Columbus**

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

**State of Ohio Debarment**

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

<http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx>

**OSHA**

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

<https://www.osha.gov>

**City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications**

Pre-Qualification Office email:

[prequalification@columbus.gov](mailto:prequalification@columbus.gov)

Pre-Qualification Office phone no:

645-0359

**TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements**  
**version: April 28, 2015**

<b>PROJECT:</b>		Dering Ave. Area Water Line Imp's			<b>Bid Date:</b>		December 9, 2015	
<b>Department/Division:</b>		Public Utilities / Water			<b>Initial Apparent Low Bidder:</b>		Shelly & Sands	
<b>Section:</b>		Distribution			<b>Initial Apparent Low Bid :</b>		\$3,029,899.42	
<b>Bids from Apparent lowest to high:</b>		<b>Apparent Low</b>	<b>2nd</b>	<b>3rd</b>	<b>4th</b>	<b>5th</b>	<b>6th</b>	
<b>CIP No.</b>	690236-100060	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	<b>COMPANY NAME</b>	
<b>Project Manager:</b>	Bob Arnold, P.E.	Shelly & Sands	Fields Excavating	Underground Util.	Elite Excavating	Beheler	Savko & Sons	
<b>Engineer's Estimate:</b>	\$ 3,575,455.00	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	<b>Initial Bid Amount</b>	
		\$3,029,899.42	\$3,044,893.64	\$3,074,294.66	\$3,133,086.16	\$3,318,454.08	\$3,791,825.20	
		0.49%	0.97%	1.91%	5.92%	14.26%		
<b>Responsiveness Criteria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance</b>		A "NO" answer will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required information						
<b>FORM B11</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	
<b>FORM B12</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	
<b>FORM B13.1</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided documentation to show it has met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.2% MBE and 1.8% WBE (if "NO," Good Faith Efforts must be documented - see immediately below)	YES	NO; missing Good Faith Effort statement	YES	NO; Good Faith Effort statement not attached (said they advertised though).	YES	NO. WBE listed is only for .11% of bid. Met MBE % though.	
<b>FORM B13.2</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	YES	NO; see Form B13.1	YES	NO	YES	YES	
<b>FORM B13.3</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4	YES	NO; see Form B13.1	YES	NO	YES	NO; missing Form B13.3.	
<b>GOOD FAITH EFFORTS</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.2% MBE and 1.8% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided.	N/A; see Form B13.1	NO	N/A; see Form B13.1	NO	N/A; see Form B13.1	no	
<b>FORM B14</b>	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	

<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB 1</b>	\$3,029,899.42	←	Manually Enter Amount
<b>LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6</b>	Shelly & Sands	←	Manually Enter Information

Shelly & Sands	Fields Excavating	Underground Utilities	Elite Excavating	Beheler	Savko & Sons
<b>Tab 1, Part IC-h: materially balanced?</b>					
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-a: statistically comparable / need further documentation?</b>					
					25.15% higher than lowest bidder. Marked "NA" on both so I could continue evaluation.
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-c: Adequate Human Resources</b>					
Form B7 blank. Marked "NA".					
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-g: Meeting deadlines/costs:</b>					
# of projects meeting costs: 2 out of 3	Info needed to evaluate not provided. Marked "N/A".	Only evaluated projects completed in 2015 as they submitted 12 pages of info. No. of projects meeting costs: 8 out of 11	# of projects meeting costs: 2 out of 3	# of projects meeting costs: 2 out of 3	# of projects meeting costs: 1 out of 3; Marked "NA"
# of projects meeting schedules: 1 out of 3; Marked "NA"; PM to evaluate.		# of projects meeting schedules: insufficient info provided; marked "NA"	# of projects meeting schedules: 2 out of 2 (no end date for 3rd project listed). Marked "NA".	# of projects meeting schedules: 3 out of 3 (only listed month & year; marked "Yes").	# of projects meeting schedules: 2 out of 3 (only listed month & year; marked "Yes").
<b>Tab 2, Part IIA-h: # of current projects:</b>					
		3rd lowest bidder, did not ask PM to evaluate. Marked "NA".			

TAB VII: Notes

Shelly & Sands	Fields Excavating	Underground Utilities	Elite Excavating	Beheler	Savko & Sons
<b>Tab 4, Part IV-step 2: Environmental Preference:</b>					
Submitted Project-Specific plan. Marked "Yes".	Submitted Fleet Policy. Marked "Yes".	Submitted weak plan so marked "no".			Submitted plan; did not evaluate since 6th lowest. Marked "NA".
<b>Tab 6, Form B13.1 thru 13.3 - MBE/WBE Goals Met:</b>					
Yes; listed M.S. Trucking (WBE) and Lionel Construction (MBE).	no	Yes; Rath Builders has EDGE certification.	no	Yes; listed K. Davis (EDGE)	No. U.S. Utility (WBE) = .11% Met MBE % though. Form B13.3 not completed though.
<b>Tab 6, Good Faith Efforts:</b>					
	No; stated no subs were needed so no reason to get one.		?, Good Faith Effort statement made but no documentation attached. Not asking for clarification since 4th lowest bidder.		no

<b>Conie Construction</b>
<p data-bbox="73 297 252 365"><b>Bid amount = \$3,818,554.33</b></p> <p data-bbox="63 418 262 722"><b>*Bid not evaluated; 26.03% higher than lowest, responsive, responsible bidder (Shelly &amp; Sands).</b></p>

Conie Construction