

From: [Davies, Tracie R.](#)
To: [Crawford, Thomas L.](#)
Cc: [Austin, Patti A.](#); [Bell, Timothy A.](#); [Bowman, Randall](#); [Cordetti, Steven R.](#); [Crabill, Melanie J.](#); [Figley, Russ U.](#); [Giffin, Benjamin M.](#); [Johnson, Daniel L.](#); [Lewis, William A.](#); [Miller Jr, Richard A.](#); [O'Callaghan, Timothy L.](#); [Palmer, Tierra L.](#); [Parks, Duane M.](#); [Roberts, Doug](#); [Stephens, Thomas H.](#); [Tilton, Rick C.](#); [Wentzel, Steve J.](#); [Zahran, Hassan Y.](#); [Bauman, Max A](#); [Cofield, Alex A.](#); [Dussault, Kathleen E.](#); [Moran, Alan P.](#); [Mackey, David B.](#); [Sexton, Michael E.](#)
Subject: RE: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Downtown General Engineering
Date: Tuesday, September 16, 2014 2:50:15 PM

I Approve of the committee's recommendation, Carpenter Marty Transportation.

Thanks,

Tracie

From: Crawford, Thomas L.
Sent: Tuesday, September 16, 2014 12:41 PM
To: Davies, Tracie R.
Cc: Austin, Patti A.; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Palmer, Tierra L.; Parks, Duane M.; Roberts, Doug; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.; Bauman, Max A; Cofield, Alex A.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Dussault, Kathleen E.; Moran, Alan P.; Mackey, David B.; Sexton, Michael E.
Subject: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - Downtown General Engineering

To: Tracie Davies, Director
Department of Public Service

From: Tom Crawford
Capital Fiscal Manager

Date: September 16, 2014

Subject: Roadway Improvements – Downtown General Engineering

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway Improvements – Downtown General Engineering contract. The recommendation is to award Carpenter Marty Transportation, the consultant that was scored the highest by the selection committee. Details concerning the recommendation are below. Please respond to this e-mail either approving the recommended consultant or approving another consultant. If you approve another consultant please provide an explanation.

TC

The contract shall be funded from DPS' 2014 CIB.

The Department of Public Service has initiated a procurement effort that will result in the award and execution of a general engineering contract. The intent of this project is to provide the Department of Public Service with continuing, contractual access to additional resources that are necessary to perform various professional engineering and surveying tasks in the Downtown Area. The contract shall be funded from DPS' 2014 CIB.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from August 14, 2014, to September 4, 2014. The city received seven (7) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on September 11, 2014. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT Sub-consultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance Number	Active	% OF WORK	% MAJ. % OTH.
CARPENTER MARTY TRANSPORTATION INC.	MAJ	46-0918246	Y	65-75%	75-85% MAJ 15-25% OTH
Lanham Engineering, LLC	FBE	46-1240018	Y	20-25%	
The EDGE Group, Inc.	MAJ	20-8054208	Y	5-10%	
Crawford, Murphy & Tilly	MAJ	37-0844662	Y	5-10%	
BURGESS & NIPLE, INC.	MAJ	31-0885550	Y	60%	88% MAJ 12% OTH
The EDGE Group, Inc.	MAJ	20-8054208	Y	3%	
EMH&T	MAJ	31-0685594	Y	25%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	2%	
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	10%	
OHM ADVISORS	MAJ	38-1691323	Y	60%	60% MAJ 40% OTH
Resource International,	FBE	31-0669793	Y	20%	

Inc.					
Eggeman Engineering & Consulting	MBR	20-0002226	Y	15%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5%	
MICHAEL BAKER JR., INC.	MAJ	25-1228638	Y	70%	70% MAJ 30% OTH
CAD Concepts Inc.	FBE	31-1390280	Y	25%	
XYZ Survey Services, LTD	MBE	04-3846618	Y	5%	
PARSONS TRANSPORTATION GROUP INC.	MAJ	31-1358938	Y	70%	70% MAJ 30% OTH
Resource International, Inc.	FBE	31-0669793	Y	20%	
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.	FBE	31-1153141	Y	5%	
CCI Engineering Services (CAD Concepts Inc.)	FBE	31-1390280	Y	5%	
DLZ OHIO, INC.	ASN	31-1268980	Y	75%	10% MAJ 90% OTH
MKSK (MSK2, LLC)	MAJ	45-3413259	Y	10%	
CCI Engineering Services (CAD Concepts Inc.)	FBE	31-1390280	Y	10%	
Engage Public Affairs	FBE	20-1593274	Y	5%	
COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS, INC.	ASN	31-0716498	Y	60%	15% MAJ 65% OTH 20% PHC
Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.	PHC	11-1531569	Y	20%	
Korda Engineering Inc. (Korda/Nemeth engineering Inc.)	MAJ	31-0922991	Y	10%	
ASC Group, Inc.	FBE	31-1167506	Y	5%	

Professional Service Industries, Inc.	MAJ	37-0962090	Y	4%	
Drier & Maller, Inc.	MAJ	34-1681027	Y	1%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service (Patti Austin, Randall Bowman, and Hassan Zahran). Non-voting members, but attendees, included Tierra Palmer and Tom Crawford. Duane Parks, a representative from EBOCO, also attended.

Carpenter Marty Transportation received 89.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Burgess & Niple with 87.33 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the seven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Carpenter Marty Transportation	89.33
Burgess & Niple	87.33
OHM Advisors	86.67
Michael Baker Jr.	84.00
Parsons Transportation Group	81.33
DLZ Ohio	81.00
Columbus Engineering Consultants	78.67

The Committee would like to submit Carpenter Marty Transportation for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Carpenter Marty Transportation submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Carpenter Marty Transportation described the working relationship that exists between the proposed project manager and the principal traffic modeler.
2. The traffic modeler possesses strong experience utilizing the modeling software that will be employed during this project.
3. Their proposed project team includes the lead consultant for the Downtown Standards project.
4. Carpenter Marty Transportation explained how it planned to utilize each of its proposed sub-

consultants.

5. Carpenter Marty Transportation provided a superior explanation of its sensitivity to cost containment.
6. Carpenter Marty Transportation also was the only firm to include ODOT consultant evaluation scores in its proposal.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Carpenter Marty Transportation
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

Tom Crawford
Fiscal Manager



DEPARTMENT OF
PUBLIC SERVICE

50 W. Gay Street, 5th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Direct: 614.645.1687
Fax: 614.645.7549
www.columbus.gov