



| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|------------|
| M-1 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| M-2 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| M-3 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| M-4 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| M-5 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| M-6 |
|------------|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|------------|
| C-1 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| C-2 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| C-3 |
|------------|

| |
|------------|
| C-4 |
|------------|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|------------|
| C-5 |
|------------|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|------------|
| C-6 |
|------------|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--|
| |
|--|

| |
|--------------|
| |
| |
| |
| HE-1 |
| HE-2 |
| HE-3 |
| HE-4 |
| HE-5 |
| HE-6 |
| HE-7 |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| HE-8 |
| HE-9 |
| HE-10 |
| HE-11 |
| HE-12 |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| Note: T |
| through |
| R-1 |
| R-2 |
| R-3 |
| R-4 |
| R-5 |
| |
| |
| |



Department:

Division:

Low Bid at Opening:
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:

Original Bid Amount:
Local Company?

| <u>FACTORS</u> |
|--|
| <u>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</u> |
| Bid is responsive |
| Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits |
| Bidder will make financial statements available upon request |
| Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency |
| Bidder has requisite licenses |
| Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one |
| <i>Proceed to Tier II?</i> |
| |
| <u>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</u> |
| Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) |
| Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit |
| Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit |
| Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit |
| % of insurance provided by company |
| Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit |
| % of retirement or pension plan provided by company |
| Bidder is eligible for environmental preference |
| Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) |
| Dollar Value of Credits |
| Bid Total: |
| |
| Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits |
| Percent Over Low Bid: |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) |

| |
|---|
| Proceed to Tier III? |
| |
| <u>Tier III - History Experience Factors</u> |
| Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs |
| Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs |
| Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds |
| Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years |
| Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. |
| Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years |
| Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: |
| A. Fair Labor Standards Act |
| B. Prevailing Wage Laws |
| C. Unemployment Compensation Laws |
| D. Worker's Compensation Laws |
| Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) |
| Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation |
| Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR |
| Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years |
| The results of Bidder's references are questionable |
| Total Negative History and Experience Factors: |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited |
| Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) |
| Proceed to Tier IV? |
| |
| <u>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</u> |
| Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be c |
| Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) |
| Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project |
| Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project |
| Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project |
| Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project |
| Total Number of "Yes" Answers |
| |
| Division's Recommendation: |

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
 BID EVALUATION FORM
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Public Utilities

CIP Number:

Sanitary - SSES

Project Name:

Funding Source:

Bid Opening Date:

Engineer's Estimate:

| | |
|----|--------------|
| \$ | 2,973,312.10 |
| \$ | 3,058,111.40 |

COMPANY NAME

| <u>Reynolds Inc</u> | <u>Spiniello Companies</u> | <u>Insituform Technologies Inc.</u> |
|---------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| \$ 2,973,312.10 | \$ 3,058,111.40 | \$ 3,422,159.62 |
| YES | NO | NO |

| | | |
|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|
| | | |
| | | |
| yes | yes | yes |
| yes | yes | yes |
| yes | yes | yes |
| no | no | no |
| yes | yes | yes |
| yes | yes | yes |
| yes | yes | yes |
| | | |
| yes | no | no |
| yes | yes | no |
| no | yes | no |
| yes | yes | yes |
| 70.00% | 100.00% | 80.00% |
| yes | yes | yes |
| 4.00% | Did not fill in | 100% (1st 3%) & 50% (next 2%) |
| no | Did not fill in | no |
| 4.00% | 4.00% | 2.00% |
| \$80,000.00 | \$80,000.00 | \$40,000.00 |
| 2,893,312.10 | 2,978,111.40 | 3,382,159.62 |
| | | |
| \$ 2,893,312.10 | | |
| 0.000% | 2.931% | 16.896% |
| yes | yes | no |

| | | | |
|--|------------|------------|-----------|
| | yes | yes | no |
| | | | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | yes | yes | |
| | yes | yes | |
| | no | no | |
| | no | no | |
| | 0 | 0 | |
| | | | |
| | yes | yes | |
| | yes | yes | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

The field of eligible bidders will be determined
 onducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

| | | |
|--|----------|----------|
| | yes | yes |
| | yes | yes |
| | yes | yes |
| | yes | yes |
| | yes | yes |
| | 5 | 5 |
| | | |

| |
|--------------------------|
| CONTRACTOR's NAME |
|--------------------------|



650600.8

Franklin Main Interceptor Rehabilitation
phase II: Long St. to Fulton St.

Sanitary Sewer Revenue Bonds Fund (665)

6/4/08

\$3,520,889.30

Kokosing Construction Co.

\$ 4,339,048.00
YES

| |
|--------------|
| |
| |
| yes |
| yes |
| yes |
| no |
| yes |
| yes |
| yes |
| |
| yes |
| yes |
| yes |
| yes |
| 100.00% |
| yes |
| 100.00% |
| no |
| 5.00% |
| \$100,000.00 |
| 4,239,048.00 |
| |
| |
| 46.512% |
| no |

| no |
|----|
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |

**CITY OF COLUMBUS
BID EVALUATION FORM
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

| | | | | | |
|---|---|--------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Department: | Public Utilities | CIP Number: | 650600.8 | | |
| Division: | Sanitary - SSES | Project Name: | Franklin Main Interceptor Rehabilitation phase II: Long St. to Fulton St. | | |
| | | Funding Source: | Sanitary Sewer Revenue Bonds Fund (665) | | |
| | | Bid Opening Date: | 6/4/08 | | |
| Low Bid at Opening: | \$ 2,839,052.70 | Engineer's Estimate: | \$3,490,727.30 | | |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: | \$ 2,937,463.40 | | | | |
| | | COMPANY NAME | | | |
| | | Reynolds Inc | Spiniello Companies | Insituform Technologies Inc. | Kokosing Construction Co. |
| Original Bid Amount: | \$ 2,839,052.70 | \$ 2,937,463.40 | \$ 3,333,298.32 | \$ 4,014,867.00 | |
| Local Company? | YES | NO | NO | YES | |
| FACTORS | | | | | |
| Tier I - Mandatory Factors | | | | | |
| M-1 | Bid is responsive | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-2 | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-3 | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-4 | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency | no | no | no | no |
| M-5 | Bidder has requisite licenses | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| M-6 | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | Proceed to Tier II? | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit) | | | | | |
| C-1 | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) | yes | no | no | yes |
| C-2 | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit | yes | yes | no | yes |
| C-3 | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit | no | yes | no | yes |
| C-4 | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of insurance provided by company | 70.00% | 100.00% | 80.00% | 100.00% |
| C-5 | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company | 4.00% | Did not fill in | 100% (1st 3%) & 50% (next 2%) | 100.00% |
| C-6 | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference | no | Did not fill in | no | no |
| | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) | 4.00% | 4.00% | 2.00% | 5.00% |
| | Dollar Value of Credits | \$80,000.00 | \$80,000.00 | \$40,000.00 | \$100,000.00 |
| | Bid Total: | 2,759,052.70 | 2,857,463.40 | 3,293,298.32 | 3,914,867.00 |
| | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits | \$ 2,759,052.70 | | | |
| | Percent Over Low Bid: | 0.000% | 3.567% | 19.363% | 41.892% |
| | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) | yes | yes | no | no |
| | Proceed to Tier III? | yes | yes | no | no |
| Tier III - History Experience Factors | | | | | |
| HE-1 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs | no | no | | |
| HE-2 | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no | no | | |
| HE-3 | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds | no | no | | |
| HE-4 | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years | no | no | | |
| HE-5 | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. | no | no | | |
| HE-6 | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years | no | no | | |
| HE-7 | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: | | | | |
| | A. Fair Labor Standards Act | no | no | | |
| | B. Prevailing Wage Laws | no | no | | |
| | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws | no | no | | |
| | D. Worker's Compensation Laws | no | no | | |
| HE-8 | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) | no | no | | |
| HE-9 | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation | yes | yes | | |
| HE-10 | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR | yes | yes | | |
| HE-11 | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years | no | no | | |
| HE-12 | The results of Bidder's references are questionable | no | no | | |
| | Total Negative History and Experience Factors: | 0 | 0 | | |
| | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited | | | | |
| | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) | yes | yes | | |
| | Proceed to Tier IV? | yes | yes | | |
| Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) | | | | | |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). | | | | | |
| R-1 | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment) | yes | yes | | |
| R-2 | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project | yes | yes | | |
| R-3 | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project | yes | yes | | |
| R-4 | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project | yes | yes | | |
| R-5 | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project | yes | yes | | |
| | Total Number of "Yes" Answers | 5 | 5 | | |
| Division's Recommendation: | | CONTRACTOR'S NAME | | | |