

CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM

Department: Public Utilities  
 Division: Water

Lowest Bidder: \$2,667,692.38  
 Non-Local Lowest Bidder: \$2,705,257.70

	George Igel	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands
Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,667,692.38	\$2,705,257.70	\$2,815,466.11
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)	yes	no	yes

<b>FACTORS</b>				
		(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)
<b>Is bidder pre-qualified with ODOT?</b>				
<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>				
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>				
	What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	54.0%	0.0%	"To be submitted separately"
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	100%/0%	see comment	100%/0%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee	100%/0%	4%/up to 15% deduct	100%/0%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>				
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>				

		George Igel	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$2,667,692.38	\$2,705,257.70	\$2,815,466.11
<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>		yes	no	yes
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	yes	see comments
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Form 14 - Local Bidder Credit</b>				
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Columbus corp. limits (1%, \$50k cap) (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Franklin Co., outside Columbus corp. limits (.5%, \$25k cap) (Y/N)	no	no	no
<b>Page 46:</b>	Is local bidder affidavit signed & notarized (Y/N)	yes	no	yes
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	1.00%	0.00%	1.00%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$27,052.58	\$0.00	\$27,052.58
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	\$2,640,639.80	\$2,705,257.70	\$2,788,413.53
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>	\$2,640,639.80		
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	0.00%	2.45%	5.60%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	yes	yes	yes
<b>Page 47 - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	yes	see comment
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	2.45%	5.60%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$64,617.90	\$147,773.73
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
<b>Pgs. 48-51 Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Page 59 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Page 60 - Proposal Signature</b>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Pages 61-62 - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	-1	-1	-2
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		<b>George J. Ige</b>		

Department: CIP Number: <b>690236-100040</b> Division: Project Name: <b>Innis Area WL</b> Funding Source: <b>Works Enlarg. Voted Bonds</b> Bid Opening Date: <b>10/31/12</b> Lowest Bidder: Engineer's Estimate <b>\$2,787,494.40</b> Non-Local Lowest Bidder:				
Bid Tab Amount: <b>Conic Constr.</b> \$3,009,550.00 <b>McDaniel's</b> \$3,141,186.54 <b>Eramo &amp; Sons</b> \$3,675,949.70 Local Company? (Proof s/b included.) <b>Conic Constr.</b> yes <b>McDaniel's</b> ??? <b>Eramo &amp; Sons</b> yes				
<b>FACTORS</b>				
<b>Is bidder pre-qualified with ODOT?</b>		(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)	(not req'd for DPU)
<b>Form 1 - Contract Compliance</b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
<b>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</b>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	yes	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</b>				
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no	yes
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no	no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>				
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) (Y/N)		yes	no	yes
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>				
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>				
What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		62.0%	64.5%	82.0%
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>				
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
2. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee		90%/10%	75%/25%	80%/20%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
4. If yes, what is the percent paid into the plan by Employer / Employee		10% of gross for EE"	"6% match-ER"	100%-ER
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>				
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		no	yes	no
<b>Negative Factors:</b>		<b>-1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>				
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>				
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	yes	"TBD"
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>				

		Conie Constr.	McDaniel's	Eramo & Sons
<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>		\$3,009,550.00	\$3,141,186.54	\$3,675,949.70
<b>Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)</b>		yes	???	yes
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see comment
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>				
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Form 14 - Local Bidder Credit</b>				
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Columbus corp. limits (1%, \$50k cap) (Y/N)	yes	???	no
	Bidder is eligible for credit for being a local business w/n Franklin Co., outside Columbus corp. limits (.5%, \$25k cap) (Y/N)	no	no	yes
<b>Page 46:</b>	Is local bidder affidavit signed & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Total Local Credit</b>	1.00%	0.00%	0.50%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	\$27,052.58	\$0.00	\$13,526.29
	<b>Evaluated Bid Total:</b>	\$2,982,497.42	\$3,141,186.54	\$3,662,423.41
	<b>Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits</b>			
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	12.95%	18.96%	38.69%
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	no	no	no
<b>Page 47 - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	12.95%	18.96%	38.69%
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	\$341,857.62	\$500,546.74	\$1,021,783.61
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	no	no	no
<b>Pgs. 48-51 Statements and Affidavits</b>				
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Page 59 - Addenda Acknlgmt.</b>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<b>Page 60 - Proposal Signature</b>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
<b>Pages 61-62 - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	0	0	0
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>	-3	0	-4
<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>		I & Co., Inc.		