

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 22, 2011 8:47 AM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** Re: RECOMMENDATION: Short North Streetscape Improvements

I recommend that the top 2 highest scored companies be called in to provide us an oral presentation thanks  
Mark Kelsey sent from my blackberry

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuinness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Sent:** Fri Nov 18 08:57:36 2011  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Short North Streetscape Improvements

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** November 17, 2011

**Subject:** Short North Streetscape Improvements

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Short North Streetscape Improvements project. The budget is \$500,000. The final, to be negotiated dollar amount, shall be funded by 2011 Department of Development Bond Funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Department of Public Service, additional resources for preparation of a Preliminary Engineering document to recommend streetscape improvements to High Street from Convention Center Drive to King Avenue/E. Seventh Avenue. The primary stakeholders' key objectives are to improve safety, improve aesthetics of the streets (public right-of-way), improve pedestrian accessibility and mobility, build on the brand and reputation as an "Arts District" destination, and minimize business disruption during actual construction.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from September 30, 2011, to November 3, 2011. The city received five (5) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on November 17, 2011. The responding firms were:

**CONSULTANT/**

<b>Subconsultant</b>	<b>BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS</b>	<b>CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.</b>	<b>ACTIVE</b>	<b>% OF WORK</b>	<b>% MAJORITY</b>	<b>% OTHER</b>
<b>STANTEC CONSULTING SERVICES</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>112167170</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>45%</b>	<b>9%</b>	<b>Majority</b>
						<b>5% Other</b>
		<b>AECOM Technical</b>				
	<b>Services</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>952661922</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>5%</b>	
			<b>Kinzelman Kline</b>			
	<b>Gossman</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311654496</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>45%</b>	
			<b>Columbus</b>			
<b>Engineering</b>						
<b>Consultants (CEC) AS1</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>5%</b>		
<b>KORDA/NEMETH ENGINEERING INC</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310922991</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>43%</b>	<b>88%</b>	<b>Majority 12% Other</b>
	<b>Kinzelman Kline</b>					
	<b>Gossman</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311654496</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>42%</b>	
	<b>E.P. Ferris</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311194974</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>3%</b>	
	<b>Dynotec</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>311319961</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>8%</b>	
	<b>Resource</b>					
<b>International</b>	<b>FBE</b>	<b>310669793</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>4%</b>		
<b>MS CONSULTANTS, INC.</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>346546916</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>90%</b>	<b>Majority</b>
						<b>10% Other</b>
	<b>Resource</b>					
<b>International</b>	<b>FBE</b>	<b>310669793</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>9%</b>		
	<b>Kinzelman Kline</b>					
	<b>Gossman</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311654496</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>35%</b>	
	<b>ASC Group</b>	<b>FBE</b>	<b>311167506</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>1%</b>	
	<b>Ralph &amp; Curl</b>					
<b>Engineers</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311067613</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>5%</b>		
<b>ORCHARD, HILTZ &amp; MCCLIMENT</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>381691323</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>48.50%</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>Majority</b>
						<b>30% Other</b>
	<b>Burgess &amp; Niple</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310885550</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>3.50%</b>	
	<b>Ralph &amp; Curl</b>					
<b>Engineers</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311067613</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>15%</b>		
	<b>Columbus</b>					
<b>Engineering</b>						
<b>Consultants (CEC) AS1</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>30%</b>		
	<b>HR Gray</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311050479</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>3%</b>	
<b>TRANS ASSOCIATES</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>251634385</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>25%</b>	<b>90%</b>	<b>Majority</b>
						<b>15% Other*</b>
	<b>EMH&amp;T</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310685594</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>25%</b>	
	<b>Kinzelman Kline</b>					

Gossman Majority 311654496 Y 40%  
Resource

International FBE 310669793 Y 15%

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

Stantec Consulting Services received 86.0 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Korda/Nemeth with 85.0 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the five evaluated proposals for your final selection.

Stantec 86.00

Korda/Nemeth 85.00

MS Consultants 84.67

OHM 84.00

Trans Associates 78.33

The Committee would like to submit Stantec for the Director’s review and recommendation. The Committee felt that Stantec submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. The committee felt Stantec’s proposal had the strongest project manager and good team composition.
2. Stantec had very good, relevant experience.
3. Stantec’s proposal had the best and most innovative suggestions for public involvement.
4. Stantec offered the most realistic schedule based on the challenges involved with the stakeholder group.
5. Stantec’s project manager has direct experience dealing with challenging stakeholders.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee’s recommendation, Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.
2. Reject the committee’s recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

**Alex Cofield**

Capital Fiscal Manager

City of Columbus

Department of Public Service

Office of Support Services

109 N. Front St. Ground Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549

[aacofield@columbus.gov](mailto:aacofield@columbus.gov)