

CITY OF COLUMBUS - BID EVALUATION FORM									
Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>			CIP Number: <u>690370-100002</u>						
Division: <u>Water</u>			Project Name: <u>Upground Reservoirs Raw Water Pipeline</u>						
Lowest Bidder: <u>\$14,973,898.50</u>			Funding Source: <u>W.W. Enlargement Voted Bonds</u>						
Non-Local Lowest Bidder: <u>\$14,973,898.50</u>			Bid Opening Date: <u>9/28/11</u>						
			Engineer's Estimate: <u>\$16,704,556.00</u>						
Bid Tab Amount:			<u>S.J. Louis</u>	<u>Kokosing</u>	<u>Kenmore</u>	<u>Igel</u>	<u>Thalle</u>	<u>Complete Gen'l</u>	<u>Reynolds</u>
Local Company? (Proof s/b included.)			no	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no
Bid Tab Amount:			\$14,973,898.50	\$15,607,240.00	\$15,617,926.50	\$15,914,552.50	\$16,708,120.00	\$16,909,970.00	\$17,416,718.00
FACTORS									
Tier I - Mandatory Factors									
M-1	Bid is responsive (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-3	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency (Y or N)	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder & subs have requisite licenses (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder & subs have provided a contract compliance no., or application for one (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
Tier II - Creditable Factors									
C-1	Bidder is eligible for local credit? - (see below for clarification)	no	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no	no
If lowest bidder is local, they do receive local credit, as long as there is a non-local bidder. If the lowest bidder IS NOT local and another bidder is local, then the local bidder receives credit.									
C-2	Environmental Preference: To receive preference, bidder must include documentation								
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y or N)	yes	yes	no	yes	no	yes	no	no
	Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	NA	4.1%	4.3%	6.1%	11.6%	12.9%	16.3%	
	Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	NA	\$613,342	\$644,028.00	\$920,654	\$1,734,221.50	\$1,936,071.50	\$2,442,820	
	Does bidder receive environmental preference? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000. of the lowest bid.	NA	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Local Credit	FALSE	1.0%	FALSE	\$0.010	NA	1.0%	FALSE	
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$0.00	\$20,000.00	\$0.00	\$20,000.00	\$0.00	\$20,000.00	\$0.00	
	Evaluated Bid Total:	\$14,973,898.50	\$15,587,240.00	\$15,617,926.50	\$15,894,552.50	\$16,708,120.00	\$16,889,970.00	\$17,416,718.00	
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$14,973,898.50							
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.0%	4.1%	4.3%	6.1%	11.6%	12.9%	16.3%	
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	no	no
Tier III - Employer & History Factors									
E-1	Bidder has local workforce? (Y or N)	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	no
E-2	Bidder is a quality training contractor? (Y or N)	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
E-3	Bidder has health insurance? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
E-4	Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y or N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-2	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-3	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-4	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	yes	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-5	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-6	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-7	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes	yes
HE-8	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-9	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
HE-10	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
HE-11	The results of Bidder's references are questionable (Y or N)	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	-4	-2	-1	-1	0	-1	-2	
	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited.								
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)									
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was									
	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-1	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-2	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-3	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
R-4	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	(incomplete info)
R-5	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4
Division's Recommendation:									