

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Friday, December 16, 2011 7:36 AM  
**To:** Atkinson, Jennifer L.  
**Cc:** DeLay, Susan E.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** Re: RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - 18th Street

I agree with the recommended consultant for award  
Mark Kelsey sent from my blackberry

---

**From:** Atkinson, Jennifer L.  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** DeLay, Susan E.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; McGuiness, Rory O.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Rundio, Ted; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Sent:** Wed Dec 14 15:59:55 2011  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Roadway Improvements - 18th Street

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service

**From:** Jennifer Atkinson, Management Analyst I

**Date:** December 14, 2011

**Subject:** Roadway Improvements – 18<sup>th</sup> Street

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Roadway Improvements – 18<sup>th</sup> Street Contract. The budget is \$500,000. The final, to be negotiated dollar amount, shall be funded by 2011 bond funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Planning and Operations, additional resources for final design of improvements to 18th Street including reconstruction of the pavement, curbs, and walks from the end of a recent project at Livingston Avenue to the begin point south of Mooberry Street of the I-70 project (FRA-70-14.48 – currently in design). Reconstruction will include upgrades to the traffic controls, street lighting, storm sewer system, and utilities and addition of street trees.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from October 27, 2011, to November 23, 2011. The city received seven (7) responses. All proposals were deemed minimally compliant and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on December 14, 2011. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	ACTIVE	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY % OTHER
------------------------------	----------------------------------	-------------------------------	--------	--------------	-----------------------

<b>CT CONSULTANTS</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>340792089</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>85-89%</b>	<b>85-89% Majority 11-15% Other</b>
Resource Int.	FBE	310669793	Y	3-5%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	Y	8-10%	
<b>EMH&amp;T</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>310685594</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>53.60%</b>	<b>53.6% Majority 46.4% Other</b>
Resource Int.	FBE	310669793	Y	6.90%	
Dynotec	MBE	311319961	Y	39.50%	
<b>AMERICAN STRUCTUREPOINT</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>351127317</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>63%</b>	<b>85% Majority 15% Other</b>
Resource Int.	FBE	310669793	Y	15%	
MSK2, LLC	Majority	453413259	Y	22%	
<b>ME COMPANIES</b>	<b>Majority</b>	<b>311442777</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>67%</b>	<b>96% Majority 4% Other</b>
MSK2, LLC	Majority	453413259	Y	26%	
S&ME, Inc.	Majority	560791580	Y	3%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	Y	4%	
<b>COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS</b>	<b>AS1</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>86%</b>	<b>9% Majority 91% Other</b>
W. E. Stilson	Majority	311702689	Y	9%	
CTL Engineering	AS1	310680767	Y	5%	
MSI Design Group	Majority	311310090	Y	TBD*	
<b>HDR Engineering</b>	<b>PHC</b>	<b>470680568</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>97% Majority 3% Other</b>
Resource Int.	FBE	310669793	Y	3%	
Burgess & Niple	Majority	310885550	Y	47%	
<b>RIBWAY ENGINEERING</b>	<b>MBE</b>	<b>311406579</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>75%</b>	<b>5% Majority 95% Other</b>
Gannett Fleming	Majority	232935505	Y	5%	
DHDC, Inc.	MBE	311227692	Y	10%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	Y	10%	

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman – a representative from EBOCO was invited to attend, but declined, and Jennifer Atkinson.

CT Consultants received 87.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was EMH&T with 83.67 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the seven evaluated proposals for your final selection.

CT Consultants	87.33
EMH&T, Inc.	83.67
American StructurePoint	83.33
M-E Companies	81.00
Columbus Engineering Cons.	79.00
HDR Engineering	76.00
Ribway Engineering Group	75.33

The Committee would like to submit CT Consultants for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that CT Consultants submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. CT Consultants presented the most realistic schedule.
2. CT Consultants mentioned the importance of maintenance of traffic and discussing potential issues with hospital.
3. CT Consultants offered a very strong project team.
4. CT Consultants offered a good explanation and approach to public involvement.
5. CT Consultants proposal referenced past studies done by Trans Associates.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, CT Consultants
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms
4. Other

*Jennifer Atkinson*  
Management Analyst I  
Office of Support Services  
Department of Public Service  
109 N. Front Street, Ground Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[jlatkinson@columbus.gov](mailto:jlatkinson@columbus.gov)  
614.645.7348