PROJECT:	Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House Demolition	Bid Date:	December 29, 2021

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Kenmore
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 285,200.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690473-100016, CT No. 2343	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Erik Briedis, PE	Kenmore	Righter	Downing			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$296,585.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25			
		20.16%	22.45%	-100.00%			

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
	The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	YES	YES	YES			
С	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>	YES	YES	YES			
d	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Westgate West Tank Footer R	Repairs & Valve House Demolition	Bid Date:	mber 29, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		Kenmore
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	285,200.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690473-100016, CT No. 2343	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Erik Briedis, PE	Kenmore	Righter	Downing			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$296,585.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25			
PART IB: R	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for I	responsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	NA			
С	qualified responsible	bcontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	YES	YES	NA			
d	work under which the	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of he sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed rs are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	YES	YES	NA			
e	subcontractor per o	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? to licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally (0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	NA			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	NA			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House Demolition	Bid Date:	December 29, 2021

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Kenmore
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 285,200.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690473-100016, CT No. 2343	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Erik Briedis, PE	Kenmore	Righter	Downing			
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$296,585.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25			
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Cr	iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
a	referenced code se	omit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowled PAGE, page 2	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES	YES	YES			
С		vith technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid <b>contains</b> invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added <b>no</b> p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2, FORM	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES	YES			
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid $(1)(j)$ and $(329.23)(f)(1)(e)$	YES	YES	YES			
j	(329.23)(f)(1)(g) F	a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES			
k		a lump sum price if <b>required</b> . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) o sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
I		ied with section 329.20(h) regarding 29.23)(f)(1)(k) <b>FORM B6</b>	YES	YES	YES			
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it ne bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	NA			
n	Bid <b>responds</b> to be (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	NA			

PROJECT:	Westgate West Tank Footer R	epairs & Valve House Demolition	Bid Date:	D	December 29, 2021
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		Kenmore
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	285,200.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690473-100016, CT No. 2343	COMPANY NAME					
Project M	anager:	Erik Briedis, PE	Kenmore	Righter	Downing			
Engineer's Estimate:		\$296,585.00	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25			
o	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	NA			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PR	PROJECT: Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House D		use Demolition	Bid Date:		December 29, 2021			
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities / Water		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Ken	Kenmore	
Section:		Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	285,200.00			
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th	
CIP No.		690473-100016, CT No. 2343	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Ma	anager:	Erik Briedis, PE	Kenmore	Righter	Downing				
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$296,585.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	
			\$285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25				
PART ID: R		riteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Par	rt IE will not necessarily	•	oonsive. Bidder must h	ave a valid contract co	mpliance no. prior to	
а	number at the time	ow Bidder" has an active contract compliance e of bid.	YES	YES	YES				
			Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES				
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I \$ 285,200.00				Manually Enter Amou	ınt			
	LOW	VEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Kenmore		Manually Enter Inform	nation			

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House Demolition					Bid Date:			December 29, 2021			
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / W	Vater	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):						Kenmore			
Section:	Distribution				Re	sponsive Low	Bid (fro	om Tab I):	1 Tab I): \$ 285,2			
CIP No.	690473-100016, C	T No. 2343	COMPA	NY NAME	COME	PANY NAME	COM	PANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	CO	MPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Erik Briedis, PE		Ken	more	F	Righter	D	owning	NA		NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$	296,585.00	Initial Bi	id Amount	Initial	Bid Amount	Initia	I Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amoun	Init	tial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
	\$ 285,2			285,200.00	\$	342,700.00	\$	419,629.25	0		0	0

PART IIA:	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	NA	NA			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	NA			
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	NA			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. <b>FORM B7</b>	YES	NA	NA			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	NA	NA			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES			
	Responsibility Score:	8	5	3	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			

Manually Enter Information

### TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT: Vestgate West Tank Footer R		Repairs & Valve I	House Demolition	Bid [	Date:	December 29, 2021			
Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water Section: Distribution			Evaluated Low Bidde Evaluated Low Bid (	(from Tabs I and II): rom Tabs I and II) :		\$ 285,200.00			
	anager: 's Estimate: 29.(01)(u) and 329.2	690473-100016, CT No. 2343  Erik Briedis, PE \$ 296,585.00  12 Local Bidder	COMPANY NAME  Kenmore  Bid Amount  \$ 285,200.00	COMPANY NAME Righter Bid Amount \$ 342,700.00	COMPANY NAME Downing Bid Amount \$ 419,629.25	COMPANY NAME  NA  Bid Amount  NA	COMPANY NAME  NA  Bid Amount  NA	COMPANY NAME  NA  Bid Amount  NA	
To look up i	if a bidder is local, u	IS BID LOCAL?	YES t located at	YES X:\Construction Prequal	NO lification				
step 1		OW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. Skip data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TALOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUADOVE for apparent low bid and bidder information.	AB IV.  JE TO TO STEP 2 (see						
		above to apparent tow bid and bidder informe	auoii)						
Part IIIB:	Percentage differen	ice of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	20.161%	47.135%	NA	NA	NA	
			,	20.161% NO	47.135% NO	NA NA	NA NA	NA NA	
step 2	Is amount in prior st BID?  If step 3 is "yes", SDID AGENCY FOLL	ice of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%						
step 2	Is amount in prior st BID?  If step 3 is "yes", S DID AGENCY FOLL CITY CODE SECTI	tice of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.  Rep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW  SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.  LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO	0.000%						
step 2 step 3 step 4	Is amount in prior st BID?  If step 3 is "yes", S DID AGENCY FOLL CITY CODE SECTI	tice of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.  Itep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW  SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.  LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?	0.000%						
step 2 step 3 step 4 step 5	Is amount in prior st BID?  If step 3 is "yes", S DID AGENCY FOLL CITY CODE SECTI  INPUT NEW BID AT (\$0)	tice of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.  Itep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW  SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.  LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?	0.000%	NO		NA			

**TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference** 

Pl	ROJECT:	Westgate V	est Tank Footer Repa	airs & Valve House	Demolition	Bid Date:		Decembe	r 29, 2021
Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water			Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):	om Tabs I, II and III):		0		
Section:		Distribution			Evaluated Low Bid (f	rom Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	-
CIP No.		690473-100016, 0	T No. 2343	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Erik Briedis, PE		Kenmore	Righter	Downing	NA	NA	NA
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$	296,585.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
				\$ 285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25	NA	NA	NA
	329.(17) Environment								
Арр	arent Low Bid:	\$	-	Apparent Low Bidder:	\$	-			
PART IV: 3	329.(17) Environment	al Preference							
step 1	Did apparent/evalua		nentally preferable" bid? Answer er bidder's, input "NA"	YES	NA	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparential	t low bidder, did bidder subm	it "environmentally preferable"	NA	YES	NO			
step 3	bid, then the appare in Steps 4-6, comple	ete Step 7, and proceed to Tab stated low bidder did not submit a	oidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data 5.						
step 4	Calculate environme		s up to five percent (5%) of the 00 per bid.	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount applied).	for each eligible bid (if 0, then no	o environmental preference was	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 6		rironmental preference, except in ase, both claiming EP cancels in		#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amoun	t: \$ 285,200.00	Low Bidder:	Kenmore					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

#### TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Kenmore	\$ 285,200.00
Project:	Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve Hou	se Demolition

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Bidders Kenmore		Downing	0	0	0	
Bid	\$ 285,200.00	\$ 342,700.00	\$ 419,629.25	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	
Percent Difference btwn Bid							
and Next Highest Bid	20.16%	22.45%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES

Bid Bond
Bond on City's bond form
Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

YES

Certified/Cashier's Check Drawn on a solvant bank

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

pe executed. YES

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity,

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

or both, brought in the State of Ohio

N/A

NO

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House Demolition

Recommended Bidder: Kenmore Construction Co.
Contract Amount: \$ 285,200.00

Evaluator's Name: M. Smith
Evaluation Completion Date: 1/3/2022

**Additional Information for Departments:** 

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Kenmore	\$	285,200.00	
Project:	Westgate West Tank Footer Repairs & Valve House Demolition			

### Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

### City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

### **State of Ohio Debarment**

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

**OSHA** 

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

https://www.osha.gov

### **City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications**

Pre-Qualification Office email: <a href="mailto:prequalification@columbus.gov">prequalification@columbus.gov</a>

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

# ORD 0178-2022

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

**TAB VII: Notes** 

Overall bid questions: PM's responses:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so,

does the lowest bidder meet them?

**Bidder Meets Requirements** 

Kenmore

(IIA-f & g): Meet deadlines/costs?

Deadlines: met 2 of 3 Costs: met 1 of 3

Marked "Yes" since all 3 projects had CO's

Righter:

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable to other Bidders:

Bid is 15.6% higher than E.E. and 20% higher than lowest bidder.

Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

(IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines?

Did not meet either for 3 projects listed but did have CO's.

**Downing Construction** 

(IC- m thru o) Bid was marked "Non-Responsive" by Bid Express as Section B7 was

not completed, nor did they upload any data. Marked "NA" as we are

allowed to ask for clarification & also to continue evaluation.

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable to other Bidders:

(IIA-d): Bid is 41.5% higher than E.E. and 47% higher than lowest bidder.

Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.