

## **Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations**

**Effective 9/6/22**

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code Section 329, the most current Construction & Materials Specifications (CMS), and Title 39, as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Link to Section 39, City Code: [https://library.municode.com/oh/columbus/codes/code\\_of\\_ordinances?nodeId=TIT39DIINCO](https://library.municode.com/oh/columbus/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT39DIINCO)

Link to CMS: <https://www.columbus.gov/publicservice/Design-and-Construction/document-library/2018-Construction-and-Material-Specifications/>

Link to Title 39, City Code: [https://library.municode.com/oh/columbus/codes/code\\_of\\_ordinances?nodeId=TIT39DIINCO](https://library.municode.com/oh/columbus/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT39DIINCO)

2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

ODI PROJECT GOAL: (%)	13.00%	EPA PROJECT GOAL: (%)	0.00%
-----------------------	--------	-----------------------	-------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Operating	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 1,734,700.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	The Righter Co.					
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00					
-100.00%							

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.201)(a), (329.21)(h) (Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000)	Yes					
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(e) FORM B1	Yes					
c	The bidder submitted, with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.201)(b)(1)(2) FORM B9 (329.20)(d) FORM B9	Yes					
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	NA					
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person signing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	Yes					
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(c)	Yes					
BID IS:		RESPONSIVE					

PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder provided a list of first-tier subcontractors, as well as MBE/WBE subs to meet subcontracting goals. 329.20(f)(1) FORM B5 & ODI Forms	Yes					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

ODI PROJECT GOAL: (%)	13.00%	EPA PROJECT GOAL: (%)	0.00%
-----------------------	--------	-----------------------	-------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Operating	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 1,734,700.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	The Righter Co.					
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00					
b	If subcontractors are listed, bidder indicated which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (329.201)(c)(1) FORM B5 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed or not required, enter "NA") (Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000)	Yes					
c	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.201)(C)(2) FORM B9 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") (Only applicable for contracts > \$500,000)	NA					
d	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(f)(3) (If no subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	Yes					
e	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(f)(3) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	NA					
f	Bidder and subcontractors are not suspended or debarred by the City, nor on the City's Adverse Determination list by the Wage Theft Commission. (329.20)(f)(2)	NA					
g	Bidder stated, via affidavit, proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors meet the Subcontractor Training and Benefits requirements (329.212)(d)(2)(c) FORM B14 (Only applicable for bids estimated > \$2,000,000)	Yes					
BID IS:		RESPONSIVE					

PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(a)	Yes					
b	Bidder acknowledged addenda. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	NA					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

ODI PROJECT GOAL: (%)	13.00%	EPA PROJECT GOAL: (%)	0.00%
-----------------------	--------	-----------------------	-------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Operating	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 1,734,700.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	The Righter Co.					
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00					
c	Bidder <b>complied</b> with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(c)	NA					
d	The bid <b>contains</b> no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(d)	Yes					
e	Bidder added <b>no</b> provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(f)	Yes					
f	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a bid guarantee. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	Yes					
g	Bidder <b>did not submit</b> an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	NA					
h	Bid prices <b>are</b> materially balanced. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	Yes					
i	Bid contains <b>no</b> irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(j) & (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	Yes					
j	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(g) FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")	Yes					
k	Bidder <b>submitted</b> a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(h) FORM B3 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")	NA					
l	Bidder <b>has complied</b> with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5	Yes					
m	Bid <b>does not</b> contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it <b>does</b> respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(j)	Yes					
n	Bid <b>responds</b> to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	Yes					
o	Bid is complete. (329.23)(A)(f)(1)(e)	Yes					
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 9/6/22

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

ODI PROJECT GOAL: (%)	13.00%	EPA PROJECT GOAL: (%)	0.00%
-----------------------	--------	-----------------------	-------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Operating	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 1,734,700.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	The Righter Co.					
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00					
Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:		Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?		YES					

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 1,734,700.00	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	The Righter Company	← Manually Enter Information

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

Department/Division:	FINANCE & MANAGEMENT	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):	Initial Bid Amount
Section:	CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):	\$ -

CIP No.		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:		The Righter Co.	0	0	0	0	0
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ 1,734,700.00

PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")					
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	Yes					
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	Yes					
c	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	Yes					
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	Yes					
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	Yes					
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	Yes					
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	Yes					
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	Yes					
Responsibility Score:		8	0	0	0	0	0

LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BID, TAB II	\$ 1,734,700.00	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BIDDER, TAB II	The Righter Co.	← Manually Enter Information

TAB III. U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements N/A

PROJECT:		FEM 0101.7		Bid Date:		January 22, 2025	
Department/Division:		Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOS		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II):			
Section:		Operating		Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :		\$ 1,734,700.00	
Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low		2nd		3rd	
4th		5th		6th			
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica Powell	The Righter Co.	0	0	0	0	0
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ -	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		0.00%	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!
Assigned EPA Goal (%):		0.00%	Subcontractor Name:				
		Dollar Amount:					
		EPA Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		EPA Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		EPA Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		EPA Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
Total Subcontractor Percentage:			0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%
Meets Assigned Goal (%):			YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

Responsive Criteria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance		A "NO" answer will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required information submitted prior to contract execution. Delay in providing this information may result in delay of loan award and affect project schedule.					
Form E10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form.						
Form E11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the USA EPA Certification regarding Debarment, Suspension, and other Responsibility Matters Form.Contractors Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form.						
Form E12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor.						
Form E12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-4.						
Good Faith Efforts	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has not met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilitazation Goals of 1.3\$ MBE and 1.0% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided. (329.20)(f)(4)						
From E13	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed American Iron and Steel acknowledgement.						
B14	Bidder has checked either Box A or Box B in affirmation to the Subcontractor Benefits and Training Affidavit statement.						

REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB 3:		←	Manually Enter Amount
REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB 3:		←	Manually Enter Information

TAB IV: ODI MBE/WBE Subcontracting Goals and/or Good Faith Effort

version: 3/20/23

ODI MBE/WBE Assigned Goal:

PROJECT:	FEM 0101.7	Bid Date:	January 22, 2025
----------	------------	-----------	------------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities/ DOW/DOP/DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Company
Section:	Operating	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 1,734,700.00
		Contingency:	\$1,525,000.00
		MBE/WBE Construction Amount:	\$ 209,700.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	N/A	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Monica	The Righter Co.	0	0	0	0	0
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ -	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 209,700.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
-100.00%							
Assigned ODI Goal (%):	13.00%	Subcontractor Name:	Roberts Service Group				
		Dollar Amount:	\$36,000.00				
		ODI Percentage:	17.17%				
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:	WBE				
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		ODI Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		ODI Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
		Subcontractor Name:					
		Dollar Amount:					
		ODI Percentage:					
		MBE, WBE, EDGE:					
Total Subcontractor Percentage:		17.17%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%
Meets Assigned Goal (13.0%):		YES					

Demonstrate achievement of MBE/WBE subcontracting goals or GFE.							
Appendix A (1)	"Bid Discount /Proposal Incentive Request Form/Affidavit": Bidder qualifies for Bid Discount?	No					
Appendix A (1)	Form has been approved & signed by ODI staff.	No					
Appendix B (1)	"Declaration of Proposed MBE/WBE Utilization": Bidder meets goal?	Yes					
Appendix C	"Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver & Documentation of GFE": The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT the MBE/WBE goal and has completed the nine (9) "Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver and Documentation of Good Faith Effort" forms.	NA					
	Bidder did not bid subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city, nor on the City's Adverse Determination list by the Wage Theft Commission.	Yes					
B14	Bidder has checked either Box A or Box B in affirmation to the Subcontractor Benefits and Training Affidavit statement.	Yes					

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB 3	\$ 1,734,700.00	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 3	The Righter Company	← Manually Enter Information



TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	The Righter Company	\$ 1,734,700.00
Project:	FEM 0101.7	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(A)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified. (329.23)(2)(e)

Bidders	The Righter Co.	0	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 1,734,700.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	100.00%	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

NA
NA

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

Yes
Yes

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Yes
-----

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

Yes
NA

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

<http://www.sos.state.oh.us/>

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name:	FEM 0101.7
Recommended Bidder:	The Righter Company
Contract Amount:	\$ 1,734,700.00

Evaluator's Name:	Maxers
Evaluation Completion Date:	1/24/2025



TAB VII: Notes

Examples below:

Overall bid question:

PM's responses:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

Vendor Name:

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable:  
  
X% higher than E.E. & X% lower than next lowest bidder. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

(IIA-b & c) B6 Equipment Listed

(IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines?

(IIA-h): Availability: