

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

ORD# 1041-2006

Department: Public Utilities  
Division: Sewerage & Drainage

Project: Southgate/Landers Stormwater System Impr  
Funding Source: Storm & Sanitary Bond Fund  
Bid Opening Date: 24-May-06  
Engineer's Estimate: \$643,442.28

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 461,567.48  
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ -

	<u>Tata Excavating, Inc.</u>	<u>Nicholas Savko</u>	<u>George J. Igel</u>	<u>McDaniels</u>
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 461,567.48	\$ 476,559.84	\$ 522,746.40	\$ 599,534.23
Local Company?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

M-1 Bid is responsive	Yes	yes	yes	yes	Yes
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	Yes	yes	yes	yes	Yes
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	Yes	yes	yes	yes	Yes
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	Yes	yes	yes	yes	Yes
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	Yes	yes	yes	yes	Yes
<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	no	yes	yes	yes
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
% of insurance provided by company	75.00%	60.00%	100.00%	100.00%	75.00%
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	3.00%	100.00%	75.00%
<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>	4.00%	4.00%	5.00%	5.00%	5.00%
<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	13,847	13,847	18,463	18,463	18,463
<b>Bid Total:</b>	447,720.46	462,712.82	504,283.70	532,236.74	581,071.53

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

**Percent Over Low Bid:**

**Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)**

**Proceed to Tier III?**

\$ <u>447,720.46</u>	0.000%	3.349%	12.634%	18.877%	29.784%
<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	
<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no			
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no			
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no			
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no			
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no			
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no			
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:					
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no			
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no			
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no			
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no			
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	yes			
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	yes			
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	no	yes			
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	yes			
HE-12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no			
<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-2</b>			<b>0</b>
<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>					
<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>			
<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>			<b>no</b>

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes	yes	yes	
R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes	yes	yes	
<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>

Division's Recommendation: Tata Excavating, Inc.

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Division: \_\_\_\_\_

Project: Betterments  
 Funding Source: Sewer Enterprise  
 Bid Opening Date: 26-Jan-05  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$ 525,000.00

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 500,000.00  
 Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 490,000.00

	COMPANY NAME				
	Company A	Company B	Company C	Company 4	Company 5
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 490,000.00	\$ 525,000.00	\$ -	\$ -
Local Company?	yes	no	yes	no	no

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors**

M-1 Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes		
M-2 Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes		
M-3 Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes	yes		
M-4 Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no		
M-5 Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes		
M-6 Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes		
<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

C-1 Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	yes	no	yes	no	no
C-2 Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes	no	yes		
C-3 Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	no	no	yes		
C-4 Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes		
% of insurance provided by company	50.00%	50.00%	50.00%		
C-5 Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes		
% of retirement or pension plan provided by company					
<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>	<b>4.00%</b>	<b>3.00%</b>	<b>4.00%</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	<b>19,900</b>	<b>15,000</b>	<b>19,900</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>Bid Total:</b>	<b>480,100.00</b>	<b>475,000.00</b>	<b>505,100.00</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits** \$ 475,000.00

<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>	1.074%	0.000%	6.337%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (Le., within 10% of low bid after credits)</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>#VALUE!</b>	<b>#VALUE!</b>
<b>Proceed to Tier III?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>#VALUE!</b>	<b>#VALUE!</b>

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

HE-1 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-2 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs	no	no	no		
HE-3 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no	no		
HE-4 Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no	yes		
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no	no		
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	yes	yes		
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no		
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no		
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no	no	no		
HE-8 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no	no	no		
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	yes	no	no		
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes	no		
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	no	no		
HE12 The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no	no		
<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>	<b>-3</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited</b>					
<b>Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>
<b>Proceed to Tier IV?</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>	<b>no</b>

**Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).					
R1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes	yes			
R2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes			
R3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes			
R4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes			
R5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes	yes			
<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

Division's Recommendation: \_\_\_\_\_

Bidder's management resources have sufficient experience