

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
BID EVALUATION FORM  
(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

**ORD# 1024-2006**

Department: Public Utilities  
Division: Electricity

Project: St. Ltg. Impr's. for Sharon Woods Coll. Sts.  
Funding Source: Funds 553 & 580, OCA 670617 & 580987  
Bid Opening Date: 15-Mar-06

Low Bid at Opening: \$ 253,987.58  
Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ 258,193.26

Company Name:	<u>Jess Howard Electric Co</u>	<u>US Utility Contr Co</u>	<u>Comp Gen Constr Co</u>	<u>MP Dory Co</u>
Original Bid Amount:	\$ 253,987.58	\$ 258,193.26	\$ 272,139.00	\$ 309,634.50
Local Company?	yes	no	yes	yes

**FACTORS**

**Tier I - Mandatory Factors (must have yes for all for bid to qualify)**

<b>M-1</b>	Bid is responsive and meets technical requirements met, affidavit signed (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
<b>M-2</b>	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
<b>M-3</b>	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
<b>M-4</b>	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with a govt. contracting agency (no needed)	no	no	no	no		
<b>M-5</b>	Bidder and proposed subcontractors hold valid and applicable licenses and certifications (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
<b>M-6</b>	Bidder and proposed subcontractors have a valid contract compliance no. or application is attached (yes needed)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
	<b>Proceed to Tier II?</b>	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no

**Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)**

<b>C-1</b>	Bidder is eligible for local business credit (yes gives credit)	yes	no	yes	yes		
<b>C-2</b>	Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	no		
<b>C-3</b>	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	no		
<b>C-4</b>	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
<b>C-5</b>	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit (yes gives credit)	yes	yes	yes	yes		
	<b>Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$100,000 in total)</b>	5.00%	4.00%	5.00%	3.00%	0.00%	0.00%
	<b>Dollar Value of Credits</b>	12,741	10,160	12,741	7,662	-	-
	<b>Bid Total:</b>	\$ 241,246.14	\$ 248,033.76	\$ 259,397.56	\$ 301,972.82	\$ -	\$ -

**Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits**

**\$ 241,246.14**      \$ 248,033.76      \$ 259,397.56      \$ 301,972.82

**Percent Over Low Bid:**

0.000%      2.814%      7.524%      25.172%      -100.000%      -100.000%

**Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)**

yes      yes      yes      no      yes      yes

**Proceed to Tier III?**

yes      yes      yes      no      no      yes

**Tier III - History Experience Factors**

<b>HE-1</b>	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with the requirements of the City's affirmative action programs (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-2</b>	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with all federal, state and local affirmative action programs (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-3</b>	Bidder has a record of successful claims against performance bonds (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-4</b>	Bidder has a record of liquidated damages paid within the last 3 years (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-5</b>	Bidders principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-6</b>	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-7</b>	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:					
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-8</b>	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (yes gives debit)	no	no	yes		
<b>HE-9</b>	Bidder has a health and safety plan that is compliant with current OSHA standards (no gives debit)	yes	yes	yes		
<b>HE-10</b>	Bidder qualifies for a Bureau of Workers Compensation Experience Modification Rating (no gives debit)	yes	yes	yes		
<b>HE-11</b>	Bidder has a record of Environmental Protection Agency violations (yes gives debit)	no	no	no		
<b>HE-12</b>	Bidder has supplied satisfactory information on last three completed projects (no gives debit)	yes	yes	yes		
	<b>Total Negative History and Experience Factors:</b>	0	0	-1	0	0

**A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited**

**Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome?**

Proceed to Tier IV?      no      no      no      no      no      no

**Tier IV - Resource Factors**

Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).

<b>R1</b>	Bidder has identified adequate equipment for this project (yes gives one point credit)					
<b>R2</b>	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced management for this project (yes gives one point credit)					
<b>R3</b>	Bidder has identified an adequately experienced workforce for this project (yes gives one point credit)					
<b>R4</b>	Bidder has identified safety personnel for this project (yes gives one point credit)					
<b>R5</b>	Bidder has identified top five current public or private projects currently in progress (yes gives one point credit)					
	<b>Total Number of "Yes" Answers</b>	0	0	0	0	0

Division's Recommendation: Jess Howard Electric