

## Steege, Jerry K.

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Monday, June 25, 2012 4:35 PM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** Popa, Nicholas J.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

I approve of the recommended consultant for award

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Monday, June 25, 2012 3:50 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Popa, Nicholas J.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Kelsey, Mark; Lewis, William A.; Lundine, Mark A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuise E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** June 25, 2012

**Subject:** Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

On June 25, 2012, Orchard, Hiltz and McCliment and TranSystems each delivered 30 minute presentations. The Committee consisted of Director Mark Kelsey, Deputy Director Jennifer Gallagher and Administrators Patti Austin and Randall Bowman. The following is a list of results of the Evaluation Committee's assessment of the two presentations.

TranSystems	90.00
OHM	87.00

The Committee felt that TranSystems submitted the strongest overall for the following reasons:

1. TranSystems brought a large staff with availability to complete the project in a year.
2. TranSystems offered a very professional and compelling presentation, with good details on traffic engineering and curb replacement.
3. TranSystems did the original Hilltop plan and understands the specific public involvements needs.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Three options include:

1. Approve of the Committee’s recommendation, TranSystems
2. Reject the Committee’s recommendation and designate a firm
3. Other

---

**From:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Sent:** Monday, June 18, 2012 11:33 AM  
**To:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Cc:** Wentzel, Steve J.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.  
**Subject:** RE: RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

I would like an oral presentation from the top 2 highest scoring firms

---

**From:** Cofield, Alex A.  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 12, 2012 5:03 PM  
**To:** Kelsey, Mark  
**Cc:** Popa, Nicholas J.; Atkinson, Jennifer L.; Austin, Patti A.; Bauman, Max A; Bell, Timothy A.; Bowman, Randall; Cofield, Alex A.; Cordetti, Steven R.; Crabill, Melanie J.; Figley, Russ U.; Gallagher, Jennifer L.; Giffin, Benjamin M.; Johnson, Daniel L.; Lewis, William A.; Miller Jr, Richard A.; O'Callaghan, Timothy L.; Poindexter, Kaelyn C.; Roberts, Doug; Robinson, Valuse E.; Steege, Jerry K.; Stephens, Thomas H.; Tilton, Rick C.; Wentzel, Steve J.; Zahran, Hassan Y.  
**Subject:** RECOMMENDATION: Pedestrian Safety Improvements - Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

**To:** Mark Kelsey, Director  
 Department of Public Service

**From:** Alex Cofield, Capital Fiscal Manager

**Date:** June 12, 2012

**Subject:** Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Hilltop Community Mobility Plan

The Department of Public Service solicited Requests for Proposals for the Pedestrian Safety Improvements – Hilltop Community Mobility Plan Contract. The budget is \$250,000; amount of the contract shall be \$250,000 funded by a 2012 Bonds Funds.

The intent of this project is to provide the City of Columbus, Division of Mobility Options, additional resources for engineering services to preliminary engineer and design recommendations from the Hilltop Community Mobility Plan (HCMP). Work will include detailed design of several features throughout the Greater Hilltop area and will include various engineering design, traffic engineering analysis, education, and surveying tasks.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services web site from May 2, 2012, to May 31, 2012. The city received six (6) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on June 7, 2012. The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	Business Enterprise Status	Contract Compliance No.	Active	% of work	% Majority % Other
------------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------	--------	--------------	-----------------------

<b>COLUMBUS ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS</b>	<b>AS1</b>	<b>310716498</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>60%</b>	<b>100% Other</b>
DLZ Corp.	ASN	311268980	Y	25%	
Edsall & Associates	FBE	311022019	Y	5%	
CTL Engineering	AS1	310680767	Y	5%	
ASC Group	FBE	311167506	Y	5%	
<b>ORCHARD, HILTZ &amp; McCLIMENT</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>381691323</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>55%</b>	<b>85% Majority 15% Other</b>
Burgess & Niple	MAJ	310885550	Y	30%	
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	10%	
Resource International	FBE	310669793	Y	5%	
<b>PARSONS BRINCKERHOFF</b>	<b>PHC</b>	<b>111531569</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>89%</b>	<b>89% Majority 11% Other</b>
CTL Engineering	AS1	310680767	Y	3%	
Canter Surveying	MBR	300161572	Y	4%	
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	3%	
Columbus Engineering Consultants	AS1	310716498	Y	1%	
<b>TRANS ASSOCIATES</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>251634385</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>70% Majority 30% Other</b>
Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	10%	
Resource International	FBE	310669793	Y	10%	
MSK2, LLC	MAJ	311654496	Y	20%	
Dynotec	MBE	311319961	Y	10%	
<b>TRANSYSTEMS CORP.</b>	<b>PHC</b>	<b>430839725</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>70% Majority 30% Other</b>
DLZ Corp.	ASN	311268980	Y	12%	
Resource International	FBE	310669793	Y	5%	
Prime Engineering	AS1	260546656	Y	13%	
<b>WOOLPERT</b>	<b>MAJ</b>	<b>201391406</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>65%</b>	<b>85% Majority 15% Other</b>
HDR Engineering	PHC	470680856	Y	20%	

Lawhon & Associates	FBE	311153141	Y	15%	
---------------------	-----	-----------	---	-----	--

This RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members from the Department of Public Service – Jennifer Gallagher, Patti Austin, and Randall Bowman. Non-voting members, but attendees, included Duane Parks and Kaelyn Poindexter from the EBO office, and Jennifer Atkinson.

Orchard Hiltz & McCliment received 89.33 points from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was TranSystems, Inc. with 83.0 points.

The following is a list of the results of the Evaluation Committee’s assessment of the six evaluated proposals for your final selection.

OHM	89.33
TranSystems	83.00
Woolpert	80.33
Trans Associates	80.00
Parsons-Brinckerhoff	79.67
CEC	76.67

The Committee seeks the Director’s recommendation.

The Committee felt that OHM submitted a strong proposal for the following reasons:

1. OHM offered a strong team, including the Project Manager from the original Hilltop study.
2. The OHM proposal placed a strong emphasis on public involvement and offered exactly what was needed for projects involving public involvement.
3. The OHM team had great bikeway and complete streets experience.

The Committee felt that TranSystems submitted a strong proposal for the following reasons:

1. The TranSystems team include the Deputy Project Manager from original study.
2. The public involvement section in the TranSystems proposal was very good.
3. TranSystems has significant, relevant experience with Safe Routes to Schools and assisted the City with obtaining ODOT funding on a recent Safe Routes to Schools project.

Per City Code 329.14(h), please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Three options include:

1. Offer a recommendation of one of the firms
2. Call for an oral presentation of two or three of the highest scoring firms
3. Other

**Alex Cofield**

Capital Fiscal Manager  
City of Columbus  
Department of Public Service  
Office of Support Services  
109 N. Front St. Ground Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

(p) 614-645-1557

(f) 614-645-7549  
[aacofield@columbus.gov](mailto:aacofield@columbus.gov)