

CIP: 650368-100003 S83  
 Bid Opening Date:07/30/ 2014

					Engineer's
					Unit Price ir
REF.	Item	Description	Estimated Quantities	Unit	Total Sum
No.	No.				Material
1	1	General Construction Center Preaeration Control Bldg (CPA)	1	Lump Sum	
2	2	General Construction Center PrimaryControl Bldg (CPC)	1	Lump Sum	
3	3	General Construction Center Primary Metering (CPM)	1	Lump Sum	
4	4	General Construction Center RAS Control Bldg (CRC)	1	Lump Sum	
5	5	General Construction Center East RAS Control Bldg (ERC)	1	Lump Sum	
6	6	General Construction Raw Sewage Pump Bldg (PMP)	1	Lump Sum	
7	7	General Construction Service Bldg (SEV)	1	Lump Sum	
8	8	General Construction Sludge Loadout Building (SLB) / Silo #1 (SS1) Bldg (PMP)	1	Lump Sum	
9	9	General Construction Tunnel (TNL)	1	Lump Sum	
10	10	General Construction Tunnel M (TNM)	1	Lump Sum	
11	11	General Construction West Aeration Control Bldg (WAC)	1	Lump Sum	
12	12	General Construction West Preaeration Control Bldg (WPA)	1	Lump Sum	
13	13	General Construction West Primary Control Bldg (WPC)	1	Lump Sum	
14					<b>Sub-Total</b>
15	Spec.	Force Account (0.10 X Sum of Items 1 through 38)			
16					<b>TOTAL</b>

**NOTES**

1.) The apparent Low Bid is Kenmore Construction









































||

**SWWTP CORROSION PREVENTION AND PROTECTIVE COATINGS SYSTEMS  
Phase 3**

		CONTRACT S83			
		CIP: 650368-100004			
<b>Estimate</b>		<b>Kenmore Construction</b>		<b>The Righter Com</b>	
in Figures		Unit Price in Figures		Unit Price in F	
Total Cost in Figures (\$)	Total Sum Material Labor	Total Cost in Figures (\$)	Total Sum Material Labor	Total Cost in Figures (\$)	Total Sum Material Labor
\$ 69,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$ 80,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$150,000.00
\$ 12,000.00	\$24,000.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$24,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$20,000.00
\$ 8,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$50,000.00
\$ 95,000.00	\$66,000.00	\$ 66,000.00	\$66,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$50,000.00
\$ 500,000.00	\$262,000.00	\$ 262,000.00	\$262,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$250,000.00
\$ 46,000.00	\$48,000.00	\$ 48,000.00	\$48,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$50,000.00
\$ 286,000.00	\$212,000.00	\$ 212,000.00	\$212,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$250,000.00
\$ 273,000.00	\$96,000.00	\$ 96,000.00	\$96,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$300,000.00
\$ 406,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$ 180,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$200,000.00
\$ 336,000.00	\$108,000.00	\$ 108,000.00	\$108,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$500,000.00
\$ 1,091,400.00	\$1,250,000.00	\$ 1,250,000.00	\$1,250,000.00	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$1,000,000.00
\$ 63,000.00	\$70,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	\$70,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$100,000.00
\$ 11,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$50,000.00
\$3,196,400.00	<b>Sub-Total</b>	\$2,433,000.00	<b>Sub-Total</b>	\$2,433,000.00	<b>Sub-Total</b>
\$319,640.00		\$243,300.00		\$243,300.00	
<b>\$3,516,040.00</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$2,676,300.00</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$2,676,300.00</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
	Bond Amount (Sec. 430 P-2)	10%	Bond Amount (Sec. 430 P-2)	10%	Bond Amount (Sec. 430 P-2)
	Bonding Company (Sec. 430 P-2)	Ohio Farmers Insurance	Bonding Company (Sec. 430 P-2)	Ohio Farmers Insurance	Bonding Company (Sec. 430 P-2)
	Proposal Bond Amount Required (Sec. 430 P-2)	\$267,630.00	Proposal Bond Amount Required (Sec. 430 P-2)	\$267,630.00	Proposal Bond Amount Required (Sec. 430 P-2)
	Contract Compliance No. (Sec. 300 P-7)	34-0802152	Contract Compliance No. (Sec. 300 P-7)	34-0802152	Contract Compliance No. (Sec. 300 P-7)
	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Sec. 430 P-24)	Yes	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Sec. 430 P-24)	Yes	Non-Collusion Affidavit Completed? (Sec. 430 P-24)

	Local Vendor? Y/N	No	Local Vendor? Y/N
	Addendum Acknowledgement Completed? (Sec. 300 P-5)	Yes	Addendum Acknowledgement Completed? (Sec. 300 P-5)
	Proposal Affidavit Completed? (Sec. 430 P-26)	Yes	Proposal Affidavit Completed? (Sec. 430 P-26)











































<b>pany, Inc.</b>
figures
Total Cost in Figures (\$)
\$ 150,000.00
\$ 20,000.00
\$ 50,000.00
\$ 50,000.00
\$ 250,000.00
\$ 50,000.00
\$ 250,000.00
\$ 300,000.00
\$ 200,000.00
\$ 500,000.00
\$ 1,000,000.00
\$ 100,000.00
\$ 50,000.00
\$2,970,000.00
\$297,000.00
<b>\$3,267,000.00</b>
10%
Ohio Farmers Insurance
\$326,700.00
31-0889208
Yes

Yes
Yes
Yes

**Department:**

**Division:**

**Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:**

**Vendor Name:**

**Bid Tab Amount:**

<b><u>FACTORS</u></b>	
<b><u>(Pgs. X-X) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. X) - Contract Compliance</u></b>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u></b>	
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp; Regulations:</u></b>	
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u></b>	
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years ( <b>verify on OSHA.gov</b> ) (Y/N)
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>

<b><u>Form 5 - Debarment</u></b>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u></b>	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u></b>	
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u></b>	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u></b>	
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u></b>	
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u></b>	
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 12 - Availability</u></b>	
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)
<b><u>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</u></b>	
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)
	<b>License and/or Certificate No:</b>
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder</b>
	<b>Percent Over Low Bid:</b>
	<b>Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Environmental Preference</u></b>	
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferable</b> bidder (%)
	Difference versus lowest <b>non-environmental preferable</b> bidder (\$)

	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest <b>non-environmentally preferred</b> bid.
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?
<b><u>Pgs. X-X - Statements and Affidavits</u></b>	
<b>Statement 1:</b>	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)
<b>Statement 2:</b>	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)
<b>Statement 3:</b>	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)
<b>Affidavit</b>	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Addenda Acknlgmt.</u></b>	<b>Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)</b>
<b><u>Proposal (Pg. X) - Proposal Signature</u></b>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
<b><u>Pg. X - Proposal Bond</u></b>	
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Grand Total Negative Factors:</b>
	<b>Division's Recommendation:</b>
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered a</b>	
<b>1)</b>	<b>Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)</b>
<b>2)</b>	<b>Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)</b>
<b>3)</b>	<b>Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)</b>
<b>4)</b>	<b>Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)</b>
<b>5)</b>	<b>Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)</b>
<b>6)</b>	<b>Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)</b>
<b>7)</b>	<b>Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)</b>
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>

## **Apparent low bidder is Kenmore Construction**

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

<u>Public Utilities</u>	CIP Number:	
<u>Sewerage and Drainage</u>	Project Name:	<u>SWWTP Corrosion P</u>
	Funding Source:	<u>Sanitary Sewer</u>
	Bid Opening Date:	
	Engineer's Estimate	

\$2,676,300.00

Kenmore Construction  
 \$2,676,300.00

The Righter Company  
 \$3,267,000.00

Yes	Yes	
No	Yes	
0	-1	0
No	No	
No	No	
No	No	
No	No	
No	No	
No	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
-1	0	0
No	No	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
No	No	
0	0	0

No	No	
0		0
80.0%	39.0%	
Yes	Yes	
100	100	
Yes	Yes	
100	100	
0	0	0
Yes	Yes	
0	0	0
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
Yes	Yes	
No	No	
P1879; SW0230		
0	0	0
\$2,676,300.00	\$3,267,000.00	
0%	22%	-100%
yes	no	yes
Yes		
0.00%	22.07%	-100.00%
\$0.00	\$590,700.00	(\$2,676,300.00)









650368-100003

Prevention and Protective Coating Systems Phase 3

General Obligation Bond Fund, Fund 664

7/30/14

\$3,516,000.00

--	--

--	--

--	--

0	0
---	---

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

0	0
---	---

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

--	--

0	0
---	---

--	--

<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>-100%</b>	<b>-100%</b>
<b>yes</b>	<b>yes</b>
<b>-100.00%</b>	<b>-100.00%</b>
<b>(\$2,676,300.00)</b>	<b>(\$2,676,300.00)</b>


0	0
---	---



0	0
---	---


0	0
---	---

0	0
---	---


--	--


0	0
---	---