

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					
		-100.00%					

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.18)(b)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.18)(b)(3) FORM B1	YES					
b	Bidder has acknowledged Non-Collusion Statement. FORM B9 Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
c	If applicable, the bidder listed a contractor/(sub)contractor with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license. IFB Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
d	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person signing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). IFB Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
BID IS:		RESPONSIVE					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					
PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors (329.218)(b)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	If applicable, the bidder provided a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated there were not any subcontracting opportunities. — (329.18)(b)(9) See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
b	If subcontractors are listed, bidder indicated which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed or not required, enter "NA") See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
c	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h) (329.204)(C)(2) FORM B9 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
d	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (329.20)(f)(3) (If no subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
e	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(h)(5) (329.20)(f)(3) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
f	Bidder did not bid subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city, nor on the City's Adverse Determination list by the Wage Theft Commission. Question moved to Tab 3 ODI Goals	NA					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
----------	----------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					
9	Bidder stated, via affidavit, proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors meet the Subcontractor Training and Benefits requirements (329.212)(d)(2)(c) - FORM B14 (Only applicable for contracts > \$2,000,000) N/A for Service bids.	NA					
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					
PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (For bids > \$100,000)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
b	Bidder acknowledged addenda. IFB Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
c	Bidder complied with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	NA					
d	The bid contains no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
e	Bidder added no provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
f	Bidder submitted a bid guarantee. (329.14)(b) FORM B2 Only applicable for service bids valued > \$100,000	NA					
g	Bidder did not submit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.14)(b) FORM B2 (Only applicable for service bids valued > \$100,000)	NA					
h	Bid prices are materially balanced. BID TAB Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	NA					
i	Bid contains no irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
j	Bidder submitted a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. FORM B3 Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
k	Bidder submitted a lump sum price if required. FORM B3 Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	NA					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					
I	Bidder has complied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. See Tab 3 (ODI Goals) for required subcontractor information.	NA					
m	Bid does not contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does respond to the bid documents. Not in Code for Service bids but would be found in bidder's submittal.	YES					
n	Bid responds to bid documents in all material respects. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
o	Bid is complete. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	YES					
p	Bidder agrees to purchase environmentally preferable products or services ("EPPS") (329.17) IFB	YES					
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE					

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 8/1/22

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
----------	----------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 2,535,390.00

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor					
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00					

PART ID: Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to contract execution.					
a	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid. Can we remove this Part? Only those entering into a Contract have to be active?	YES					

Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?	YES					

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 2,535,390.00	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Basement Doctor	Manually Enter Information

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):	\$ 2,535,390.00

CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00	0	0	0	0	0

PART IIA: Responsibility Criteria		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")					
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3 Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	NA					
b	Bidder is local. (329.18)(b)(8) FORM B4	YES					
	Bidder: (a) does not have a record of unsatisfactory judgments with any applicable federal, state or local laws or regulations; (b) does has affirmative action program(s); (c) is in compliance with any MBE, FBE/WBE or EBO programs or good faith efforts to comply with such programs adopted by the city. (329.18)(b8) FORM B5	YES					
	Bidder: (a) has agreed for City to access to financial statements, if required; (b) has not had any "Willful" or "Serious" OSHA judgements in the past three (3) years; (c) has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards; (d) will provide a copy of their on-site safety plan; (e) will provide a copy of their OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 years) under OSHA-29 CFR 1904; (f) does not have a record of any unsatisfactory judgements with EPA within the last three (3) years; (g) has not been debarred or suspended from doing business with any government contracting agency within the last three years. (329.18)(b8) FORM B5	YES					
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT and HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES					
e	The bidder has experience in the area of service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES					
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7 Begin/end dates are not asked for in template. Cannot evaluate.	NA					
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar service projects. FORM B7 Begin/end costs are not asked for in template. Cannot evaluate.	NA					
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES					
Responsibility Score:		5	0	0	0	0	0

LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BID, TAB II	\$ 2,535,390.00	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIBLE BIDDER, TAB II	Basement Doctor	Manually Enter Information

ORD #2324-2022

TAB III: ODI MBE/WBE Subcontracting Goals and/or Good Faith Effort

version: 6/15/22

ODI MBE/WBE Assigned Goal: **8%**

PROJECT:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	Bid Date:	July 13, 2022
----------	----------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / DOSD	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Basement Doctor
Section:	SSES	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ -

Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650876-122991	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Tim Naim	Basement Doctor	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Engineer's Estimate:	\$3,418,481.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,535,390.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		-100.00%					

APPENDICES, MBE/WBE Compliance							
Appendix A (1)	"Bid Discount /Proposal Incentive Request Form/Affidavit": Bidder qualifies for Bid Discount?	No					
Appendix A (2)	Form has been approved & signed by ODI staff.	NA					
Appendix B (1)	"Declaration of Proposed MBE/WBE Utilization": Bidder meets goal?	Yes					
Appendix C	"Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver & Documentation of GFE": The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT the MBE/WBE goal and has completed the nine (9) "Request for MBE/WBE Goal Waiver and Documentation of Good Faith Effort" forms.	NA					
	Bidder did not bid subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city, nor on the City's Adverse Determination list by the Wage Theft Commission. Not in Code for Service bids but applicable to bid.	Yes					

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB 3	\$ 2,535,390.00	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 3	Basement Doctor	Manually Enter Information

TAB 3: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are department specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

ORD #2324-2022

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Basement Doctor	\$ 2,535,390.00
Project:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Basement Doctor	0	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 2,535,390.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid						

Not in Code =>

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?
If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?
If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed. (329.14)(b) (Only req'd for Service contracts => \$100,000)

Does the IFB set forth any guarantee requirements in the IFB?
Does the bid guarantee greater than or equal to the amount set forth in the IFB?
Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

NA
NA
NA

*Bond not req'd for bid.

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form
Surety power of attorney
Most recent surety financial statement
Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.
If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

YES

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

NO

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

N/A

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid
<http://www.sos.state.oh.us/>

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name:	Volunteer Sump Pump Program 2022
Recommended Bidder:	J&D Home Improvement Inc. DBA The Basement Doctor
Contract Amount:	\$ 2,535,390.00

Evaluator's Name: M. Smith

Evaluation Completion Date: 8/1/2022

ORD #2324-2022

NOTES:

Overall bid questions:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

PM's responses:

City's technical spec for licensed plumbing incorrect; bidder met other specs.

Non-Responsive:

J&D Home Improvement Inc., DBA The Basement Doctor

Bid requirements (Standards) state all work under this contract shall be performed by a plumber licensed by the City of Columbus. Basement Doctor not registered for plumbing/sewer/water line work by Bldg. & Zoning. PM says work does not really deal with plumbing (downspouts, etc.) and if they needed a licensed plumber they would hire a sub. Because bid requirements are not clear the Atty's Office has deemed them Non-Responsive; either have to waive bids or re-bid. See e-mail chain between Wendi Bootes and Sarah Harrell attached.

8/11/22 Update:

Basement Doctor was actually licensed and now show up on City's website as having a Sewer/Water license. But since the City's specs were in error, the bids will still have to be waived to contract with them. Universe Electric is now showing up on the City's website with an electrical license (wasn't at time of bid).

PART 2: STANDARDS AND APPLICABLE PUBLICATIONS

- The Contractor shall have a minimum of 3 years continuous successful experience in installing sump pumps in existing basements.
- All work performed under this contract shall be performed by a plumber licensed by the City of Columbus. All work shall be in accordance with all applicable plumbing, electrical and building codes of the City of Columbus.
- All electrical work shall be performed by a licensed electrician.
- If during the course of this project it becomes necessary to make repair to sanitary sewer lateral the work shall be completed by a contractor who has sewer tapper's license.
- The Contractor is responsible for obtaining all necessary permits and licenses. The Contractor is responsible for paying for and obtaining all proper permits and for arranging any necessary inspections.