

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000) |   |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
|--|---|-------------------|----------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------------------|
|  | Department:   | Public Utilities  |                | CIP Number:          | 610734            |                     |
|  | Division:   | Stormwater        |                | Project Name:        | Midland/Eakin SSI |                     |
|  |   |                   |                | Funding Source:      |                   |                     |
|  |   |                   |                | Bid Opening Date:    | 3-Oct-07          |                     |
|  | Low Bid at Opening:   | \$                | 2,254,251.84   | Engineer's Estimate: | \$                | 3,221,874.00        |
|  | Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:   | \$                | 2,162,747.72   |                      |                   |                     |
|  |   | COMPANY NAME      |                |                      |                   |                     |
|  |   | Fields Excavating | Nickolas Savko | Elite Excavating     | Shelly & Sands    | Trucco Construction |
|  | Original Bid Amount:  | \$                | 2,162,747.72   | \$                   | 2,254,251.84      | \$ 2,272,256.40     |
|  | Local Company?  |                   | no             |                      | yes               | no                  |
|  | FACTORS   |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
|  | Tier I - Mandatory Factors  |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
| M-1  | Bid is responsive   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| M-2  | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| M-3  | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| M-4  | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency  |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| M-5  | Bidder has requisite licenses   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| M-6  | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Proceed to Tier II?   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)  |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
| C-1  | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)   |                   | no             | yes                  | no                | yes                 |
| C-2  | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit   |                   | no             | yes                  | no                | yes                 |
| C-3  | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit   |                   | yes            | no                   | no                | yes                 |
| C-4  | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | % of insurance provided by company  |                   | 100.00%        | 60.00%               | 100.00%           | 100.00%             |
| C-5  | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   |                   | 100.00%        | 100.00%              | 4.00%             | 100.00%             |
| C-6  | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference   |                   | no             | yes                  | yes               | no                  |
|  | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)   |                   | 3.00%          | 9.00%                | 7.00%             | 5.00%               |
|  | Dollar Value of Credits   |                   | \$60,000.00    | \$100,000.00         | \$60,000.00       | \$100,000.00        |
|  | Bid Total:  |                   | 2,102,747.72   | 2,154,251.84         | 2,212,256.40      | 2,202,053.60        |
|  | Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits   | \$                | 2,102,747.72   |                      |                   |                     |
|  | Percent Over Low Bid:   |                   | 0.000%         | 2.449%               | 5.208%            | 4.723%              |
|  | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Proceed to Tier III?  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Tier III - History Experience Factors   |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
| HE-1   | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-2   | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-3   | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-4   | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-5   | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-6   | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-7   | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:   |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
|  | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
|  | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
|  | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
|  | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
| HE-8   | Bidder has a record of "wilful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| HE-9   | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| HE-10  | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | no                  |
| HE-11  | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years   |                   | no             | yes                  | no                | no                  |
| HE-12  | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   |                   | no             | no                   | no                | no                  |
|  | Total Negative History and Experience Factors:  |                   | -1             | -2                   | -1                | -2                  |
|  | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited   |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
|  | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Proceed to Tier IV?   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)  |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
|  | Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |                   |                |                      |                   |                     |
| R-1  | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| R-2  | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| R-3  | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project   |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| R-4  | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
| R-5  | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project  |                   | yes            | yes                  | yes               | yes                 |
|  | Total Number of "Yes" Answers   |                   | 5              | 5                    | 5                 | 5                   |
|  | Division's Recommendation:  | CONTRACTOR'S NAME |                |                      |                   |                     |

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|---|---|----------------------------|--|-----------------------|----------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|---------------|
| Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>   |   |                            | CIP Number: <u>610744</u>                                |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Division: <u>Sewerage and Drainage</u>  |   |                            | Project Name: <u>Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp</u> |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   |   |                            | Funding Source: <u>Storm Sewer Bond Fund</u>             |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   |   |                            | Bid Opening Date: <u>08/31/2005</u>                      |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>554,187.00</u>  |   |                            | Engineer's Estimate: \$ <u>1,998,675.00</u>              |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>883,207.20</u>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| COMPANY NAME  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | <u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u>  | <u>Double Z Constr Co.</u> | <u>Complete General</u>                                  | <u>Nickolas Savko</u> | <u>Trucco Construction</u> |            |            |            |            |               |
| Original Bid Amount:  | \$ 554,187.00   | \$ 671,967.00              | \$ 677,561.40  | \$ 869,980.56         | \$ 883,207.20              | \$         | 671,967.00 | \$         | 671,967.00 | \$ 671,967.00 |
| Local Company?  | Yes   | Yes                        | Yes  | Yes                   | No                         |            | Yes        |            | Yes        | Yes           |
| <b>FACTORS</b>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                                  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                    | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency                          | no                         | no   | no                    | no                         | no         | no         | no         | no         | no            |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                           | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| Proceed to Tier II?   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)                           | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                                       | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | no                         | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
|   | % of insurance provided by company  | 100.00%                    | 100.00%  | 100.00%               | 60.00%                     | 75.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%       |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
|   | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   | 3.00%                      | 100.00%  | 100.00%               | 100.00%                    | 50.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%       |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference   | no                         | yes  | no                    | yes                        | no         |            |            |            |               |
|   | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)                         | 5.00%                      | 10.00%   | 5.00%                 | 9.00%                      | 3.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%         |
|   | Dollar Value of Credits   | 31,000                     | 51,000   | 31,000                | 45,458                     | 16,626     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000        |
|   | Bid Total:  | 523,187.45                 | 620,967.45   | 646,561.85            | 824,522.88                 | 866,581.59 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45    |
| Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | \$ 523,187.45   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | Percent Over Low Bid:   | 0.000%                     | 18.689%  | 23.581%               | 57.596%                    | 65.635%    | 22.512%    | 22.512%    | 22.512%    | 22.512%       |
|   | Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (i.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)                        | yes                        | no   | no                    | no                         | no         | no         | no         | no         | no            |
| Proceed to Tier III?  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | Total Negative History and Experience Factors:  | 0                          | 0  | 0                     | 0                          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0             |
|   | A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited             |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)                               | yes                        | no   | no                    | no                         | no         | no         | no         | no         | no            |
| Proceed to Tier IV?   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                   | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                           | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                        | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                          | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | Total Number of "Yes" Answers   | 5                          | 0  | 0                     | 0                          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0             |
| Division's Recommendation:  |   |                            | <u>Storts Ecavation, Inc.</u>                            |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |