			BID EVALUA	OLUMBUS ATION FORM IS OVER \$20,000)					
	Donartmont	Public Utilities			I		CIP Number:	690	226
		Power and Water						Case Rd & Lehner Ro	
							Funding Source:		Bond
							Bid Opening Date:	14-N	
	Low Bid at Opening:						Engineer's Estimate:	\$2,319,	707.55
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 1,225,326.14		COMPANY NAME					
		Fields Excavating	N. Savko & Sons		Geo. J. Igel & Co.	Shelly & Sands	Tata Excavating	Columbus Asphalt	Complete General
	Original Bid Amount:	\$ 1,225,326.14	\$ 1,290,719.87	\$ 1,500,855.58	\$ 1,543,519.08	\$ 1,558,044.50	\$ 1,600,110.17	\$ 1,817,202.80	\$ 2,024,228.10
	Local Company?	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	FACTORS								
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors								
	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder will make financial statements available upon request Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	yes no	yes no	yes no	yes no	yes no	yes	yes no	yes no
	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	ves	ves	yes	ves	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes					yes
\square	Tier II. Creditable Ecotore (each year array since 40/ are did)								
C-1	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit) Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based of lowest horr-local bid) Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	no		yes
	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	60.00%	80.00%	100.00%	100.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit % of retirement or pension plan provided by company	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
C-6	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	100.00%	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00% ves	100.00%	100.00%	100.00% yes
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)	3.00%	9.00%	10.00%	10.00%	10.00%	4.00%		10.00%
	Dollar Value of Credits	\$ 36,759.78							
	Bid Total:	1,188,566.36	1,221,706.82	1,419,589.27	1,462,252.77	1,476,778.19	1,551,097.12	1,755,936.49	1,942,961.79
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 1,188,566.36							
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	2.788%	19.437%	23.027%	24.249%	30.502%	47.736%	63.471%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	yes	no					no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no
	The III - Water Francisco - Francisco								
	Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pr	no	no						
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action pro-	no	no						
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no	no						
	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no	no						
	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no	no			 	1		
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 year Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no	no			 	 		
	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no			†	 		
	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no						
	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no						
	D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no ves	no yes			+	+		
HE-9	Bidder has a record of willful of serious OSHA violations within the past 3 years. Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation.	yes	yes			 	+		
HE-10	Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes	yes						
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no	yes						
	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no	no -2	0	0	0	 		
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merite		-2	- 0	- 0	0	0	0	0
	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes	yes			†	 		
	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes		no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)	or which the hid was	solicited The field a	f oligible bidders :::"!	ho dotorminad	 	1		
	Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidd					actor (s).	+		
	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g.,	yes	yes		, coloct a contre				
R-2	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project	yes	yes						
	Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes	yes			1	1		
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes	yes			!	1	1	
		VAC	VAC						
Ë	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project Total Number of "Yes" Answers	yes 5	yes 5	0	. 0	0	0	0	0
	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project				0	0	0	0	0

		CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000	0)						
	Department: Division: Low Bid at Opening: Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	Public Utilities Sewerage and Drainage \$ 554,187.00 \$ 883,207.20		CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source: Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate:	610744 Parkside Road Stormw Storm Sewer B: 08/31/20	ond Fund			
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening.	000,207.20		COMPANY NAME					
		Storts Excavation, Inc.	Double Z Constr Co.	Complete General		Trucco Construction			
		\$ 554,187.00 \$					671,967.00 \$	671,967.00 \$	671,967.00
	Local Company?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
	<u>FACTORS</u>								
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors								
M-1 M-2	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2 M-3	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes yes	yes ves	yes yes	yes yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
1	The II. Conditable Feeters (seek one seems along 40/ condition								•
C 4	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit) Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)				w		wc-	wa-	
C-1 C-2	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid) Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	no ves	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	ves	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes Ves	yes ves	ves	ves	ves	ves	ves	ves
1	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	no	yes	no			
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total) Dollar Value of Credits	5.00% 31.000	10.00% 51.000	5.00% 31.000	9.00% 45.458	3.00% 16.626	5.00% 31.000	5.00% 31.000	5.00% 31.000
	Bid Total:	523.187.45	620.967.45	646.561.85	824.522.88	866.581.59	640.967.45	640.967.45	640.967.45
	old i Stati.	020,101.40	020,007.40	040,001.00	02-1,022.00	000,001.00	040,007.40	040,007.40	040,001.40
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 523,187.45							
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	18.689%	23.581%	57.596%	65.635%	22.512%	22.512%	22.512%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier III - History Experience Factors								
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no							
HE-2		no							
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no							
	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no							
	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no							
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no							
1112-7	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no							
1	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no							
1	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no							
l	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no							
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no							
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes ves							
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no yes							
	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no							
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited								
1	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes						n-	
1	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
1	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)								
	Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The								
throug	th application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be condu	icted, following which, the City							
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes							
R-2 R-3	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes							
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes yes							
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes yes							
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1									
	Division's Recommendation:		Storts Ecavation, Inc.						