Part	CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)												
Company   Comp					T								
Company   Comp													
Learn   Lear		DIVISION.	rower and water										
Company   Comp													
Company   Comp												\$2,251	,497.00
Company   Comp		Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	\$ 2,475,193.42										
Company of Company o					COMPANY NAME								
Communication   Company   Communication   Co			Trucco	George J. Igel &		Elite	Complete	Fields	Anderson-	John Eramo &	Loveland	Tata	Stonegate
Test					Savko Construction								
													\$ 3,345,912.90
Fig.   Company		Local Company?	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	no	yes	no
Math   Bell   Description		FACTORS											
March   Control   March   Control   March		Tier I - Mandatory Factors											
Main   State of more founded secretions opinished upon report   1989				•	yes								
Math   Store or comment determent the description design between the graph speems   10   10   10   10   10   10   10   1				•	yes					•	•	, , , ,	
March   Solidar language and a company complane in or in agriculture for the company of the co					7				•			yes	
March   Proceed of Detail Part   Proceed of												V/00	
Proceed on Tetr IP		*			yes							-	
The Completion Function (seek) assessment of the Completion (seek)   100   1					yes								
Col.   Solder is slights for four cortex*:   Solder is slights for four cortex*:   Solder is slights for four cortex*:   Solder is slights for goal for incomplete one of the solder is slights for goal for four cortex*:   Solder is slights for four more cort		Tire II. Oradisable Factors (and superior					<u> </u>		<u> </u>				
Column   Security   Column	C 4					.,	*/	,		***			
Col.   Bodies in eighbe for quality printing contractor consell.		ů ,				yes							
Col.   Solider is arginate for health insurance credit   yes   y			•		· ·								
Solid religion for implement or proteining by company   75.0%   100.00%													
S. of Reference of persons priant provisional by company   75,00%   100,00			_		60.00%			100.00%					
Col.   Display   Col.	C-5		yes	yes	yes		yes	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$130,000 in total)   \$.00000   \$.000000   \$.00000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000   \$.0000000000			75.00%		100.00%		100.00%					100.00%	
Dollar Value of Credits   \$ 8,00,000   \$ 100,000.00   \$ 100,000.00   \$ 8,000.00	C-6				yes o ooo/	NA						1000/	
Both Trailate													
Every Burd Dollar Amount After Credits   \$ 2,384,011.53   not aligned   14,300%   14,300%   16,519%   27,471%   25,513%   33,322%   37,831%   Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1-la, within 10% of low bid after credits)   yes   yes   yes   yes   WALUE   no   no   no   no   no   no   no   n													
Percent Over Low Bis:							, ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,						
Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (1/E., within 10% of low bid after credits)   yes   yes   yes   yes   yf   yes   ye							ivit			Elivii. Credit lic	t surricient		
Proceed to Tier III?				0.000%	3 167%	not signed		14 300%	16 518%			33 024%	37 831%
HE-1 Bloder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro no		Percent Over Low Bid:	0.469%			not signed #VALUE!	12.000%			21.471%	25.513%		
HE-1 Bloder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro no		Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	0.469% yes	yes	yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE2-3 Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actic no no no no no no he4-3 Bidder has a record of clama ganest performance bonds no no no no no no he4-4 Bidder has paid figuridated damages in the past 3 years no no no no no no he4-5 Principale group sed bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. no no no no no he4-5 Principale group sed bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. no no no no no no he4-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt agency(s) in past 3 years no		Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?	0.469% yes	yes	yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-5 Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds no		Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors	0.469% yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-5 Principals or principal employees of bilded rhave record of fraud, collusion, etc.  no n	HE-1	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro	0.469% yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-6 Bidder has been debarred from doing business with gort. agency(s) in past 3 years in no in	HE-1 HE-2	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action	0.469% yes yes no	yes yes	yes yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-F7 Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:  A. Fair Labor Standards Act	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programments are record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	0.469% yes yes no no	yes yes no no	yes yes no no no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
A. Fair Labor Standards Act	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prograded has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actio Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	0.469% yes yes no no no no	yes yes no no no no no	yes yes no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
B. Prevailing Wage Laws	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actio Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years	0.469% yes yes no no no no	yes yes no no no no no	yes yes no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prograde in the property of the programment	0.469% yes yes no no no no no	yes yes no	yes yes no no no no no no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-9 Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" CSHA violations within the past 3 years no no yes yes yes yes   HE-10 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation yes yes yes yes   HE-11 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes yes yes   HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years   no no no yes   HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years   no no no no   no   no   no   no   no	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosider has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actio Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act	0.469% yes yes  no no no no no no no no no	yes yes yes no	yes yes  no no no no no no no no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-9 Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation yes yes yes yes   yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actic Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes  no	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-10 Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR yes yes yes yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosided in the proceed of the proceeding of the principals of principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes yes no	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
HE-11 Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action proses as a record of con-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of 'willful or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes yes no	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
Total Negative History and Experience Factors:    Total Negative Score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actic Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation	0.469% yes yes  no yes	yes yes  no	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited  Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)  yes  yes  yes  yes  yes  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  n	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-6 HE-7 HE-8 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action proses as a record of con-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative actio Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder pulifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no yes yes	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no	no	no	21.471% no	25.513% no	no	no
Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)  Proceed to Tier IV?  Proceed to Tier IV?  Proceed to Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)  Note: Tier IV - Resource Factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined  Through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).  R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., er yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-6 HE-7 HE-8 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11 HE-11	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pro Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable	0.469% yes yes	yes yes  no yes no	yes yes yes  no yes yes yes yes yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no
Proceed to Tier IV?  yes  yes  yes  yes  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  no  n	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-7 HE-7 HE-8 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11 HE-11	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("l.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0.469% yes yes	yes yes  no yes no	yes yes yes  no yes yes yes yes yes	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no
Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)  Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).  R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., e yes yes yes Wes Wes Wes Wes Wes Wes Wes Wes Wes W	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-8 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosents as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no no no no no no no no no yes yes yes no -2	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no
Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidder's resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).  R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., et yes yes yes   yes   yes    R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project yes yes   yes   yes    R-3 Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project yes yes   yes   yes    R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project   yes   yes   yes    R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project   yes   yes   yes    Total Number of "Yes" Answers   5 5 5 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-6 HE-6 HE-7 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE-12	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action pronguider has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Bidder has peen debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has a nadequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s).  R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., e yes yes yes yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-8 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11 HE-12	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosent of the proceed of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
R-1 Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., et yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosentially a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid Investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?	0.469% yes yes	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
R-2 Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project yes yes yes yes   Second	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11 HE-12	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('l.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a precord of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or 'serious' OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the	0.469% yes yes  no	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  note::  n	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
R-4 Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project yes yes yes yes	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE-11 HE-12	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)  ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resou	0.469% yes yes	yes yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  note::  n	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
R-5 Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project yes yes yes Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 5 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-9 HE-10 HE-11 HE12 Note: 1 through R-1 R-2	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("l.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the application of Tiers it through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure complete this project (e.g., e.g.) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure complete on project (e.g., e.g.)	0.469% yes yes	yes yes yes  no	yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  note::  n	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
Total Number of "Yes" Answers 5 5 5 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE12 Note: I through R-1 R-2 R-3	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs as a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bider specific to the project for which the application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a deview of the remaining bidders' resourbidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure complete this project (e.g., e.g.) Bidder's management has sufficient experience to complete this project	0.469% yes yes	yes yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  note::  n	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE12 Note: I through R-1 R-2 R-3 R-2 R-3	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action prosentially a second of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Prinicipals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder palifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resoulidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	0.469% yes yes	yes yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  note::  n	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
Division's Recommendation: George J. Igel & Company	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE12 Note: I through R-1 R-2 R-3 R-4	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("l.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs are selected of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors of bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to ensure complete this project (e.g., e.g.) Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to ensure complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a suffic	0.469% yes yes	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  no	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no
	HE-1 HE-2 HE-3 HE-4 HE-5 HE-6 HE-7 HE-10 HE-11 HE12 Note: I through R-1 R-2 R-3 R-4	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ("l.e., within 10% of low bid after credits) Proceed to Tier III?  Tier III - History Experience Factors Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs are selected of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds Bidder has a paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc. Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following: A. Fair Labor Standards Act B. Prevailing Wage Laws C. Unemployment Compensation Laws D. Worker's Compensation Laws Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years The results of Bidder's references are questionable Total Negative History and Experience Factors: A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input) Proceed to Tier IV?  Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable) ier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors of bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to ensure complete this project (e.g., e.g.) Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to ensure complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a sufficient experience to complete this project for which the application of has a suffic	0.469% yes yes	yes yes  no	yes yes yes  no	not signed #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!  #VALUE!  no	12.000% no no	no no	no no	21.471% no no	25.513% no no	no no	no no

		CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000	0)						
	Department: Division: Low Bid at Opening: Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:	Public Utilities Sewerage and Drainage  \$ 554,187.00 \$ 883,207.20		CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source: Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate:	610744 Parkside Road Stormw Storm Sewer B: 08/31/20	ond Fund			
	Non-Local Low Bid at Opening.	000,207.20		COMPANY NAME					
		Storts Excavation, Inc.	Double Z Constr Co.	Complete General		Trucco Construction			
		\$ 554,187.00 \$					671,967.00 \$	671,967.00 \$	671,967.00
	Local Company?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
	<u>FACTORS</u>								
	Tier I - Mandatory Factors								
M-1 M-2	Bid is responsive	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-2 M-3	Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	yes yes	yes ves	yes yes	yes yes
M-4	Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
M-5	Bidder has requisite licenses	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
M-6	Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proceed to Tier II?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
1	The II. Conditable Feeters (seek one seems along 40/ condition								•
C 4	Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)  Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)				w		wc-	wa-	
C-1 C-2	Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)  Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit	yes yes	yes ves	yes ves	yes ves	no ves	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes
C-3	Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit	yes	yes	yes	no	no	yes	ves	yes
C-4	Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit	yes Ves	yes ves	ves	ves	ves	ves	yes ves	ves
1	% of insurance provided by company	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	60.00%	75.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-5	Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
	% of retirement or pension plan provided by company	3.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	50.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
C-6	Bidder is eligible for environmental preference	no	yes	no	yes	no			
	Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)  Dollar Value of Credits	5.00% 31.000	10.00% 51.000	5.00% 31.000	9.00% 45.458	3.00% 16.626	5.00% 31.000	5.00% 31.000	5.00% 31.000
	Bid Total:	523.187.45	620.967.45	646.561.85	824.522.88	866.581.59	640.967.45	640.967.45	640.967.45
	old i Stati.	020,101.40	020,007.40	040,001.00	02-1,022.00	000,001.00	040,007.40	040,007.40	040,001.40
	Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits	\$ 523,187.45							
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.000%	18.689%	23.581%	57.596%	65.635%	22.512%	22.512%	22.512%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Proceed to Tier III?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
	Tier III - History Experience Factors								
HE-1	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs	no							
HE-2		no							
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds	no							
	Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years	no							
	Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.	no							
	Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:	no							
1112-7	A. Fair Labor Standards Act	no							
1	B. Prevailing Wage Laws	no							
1	C. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no							
l	D. Worker's Compensation Laws	no							
	Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years	no							
	Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation  Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR	yes ves							
	Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	no yes							
	The results of Bidder's references are questionable	no							
	Total Negative History and Experience Factors:	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1	A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited								
1	Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)	yes						n-	
1	Proceed to Tier IV?	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
1	Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)								
	Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The								
throug	th application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be condu	icted, following which, the City							
R-1	Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)	yes							
R-2 R-3	Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project	yes							
R-4	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project	yes yes							
R-5	Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project	yes yes							
	Total Number of "Yes" Answers	5	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1									
	Division's Recommendation:		Storts Ecavation, Inc.						