

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)  |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|---|---|----------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|----|----------------|----|----------------|
| Department:   |   | Public Utilities     |                      | CIP Number:                        |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Division:   |   | (Power &) WATER      |                      | Project Name:                      |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   |   |                      |                      | University Area W.L. Imp's         |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   |   |                      |                      | Funding Source:                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   |   |                      |                      | Water Works Voted Enlargement Fund |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$                   | 2,664,046.59         | Bid Opening Date:                  |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening:   |   | \$                   | 2,664,046.59         | Engineer's Estimate:               |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   |   |                      |                      | \$3,708,000.00                     |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| COMPANY NAME  |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   |   | George J. Igel & Co. | Cols. Asphalt Paving | Tata Excavating                    | Complete General | Eramo & Sons |                |    |                |    |                |
| Original Bid Amount:  |   | \$                   | 2,664,046.59         | \$                                 | 2,727,757.74     | \$           | 3,462,649.55   | \$ | 3,789,856.51   | \$ | 3,851,060.49   |
| Local Company?  |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| FACTORS   |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Tier I - Mandatory Factors  |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                                  |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                    |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency                          |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              | no             |    | no             |    | no             |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                           |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| Proceed to Tier II?   |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)  |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)                           |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                                       |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | no             |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit  |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
|   | % of insurance provided by company  |                      | 100.00%              |                                    | 100.00%          |              | 75.00%         |    | 100.00%        |    | 80.00%         |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit  |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | yes            |    | yes            |    | yes            |
|   | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   |                      | 100.00%              |                                    | 100.00%          |              | 100.00%        |    | 100.00%        |    | 100.00%        |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | no             |    | yes            |    | yes            |
| Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)   |   |                      | 10.00%               |                                    | 10.00%           |              | 4.00%          |    | 10.00%         |    | 10.00%         |
| Dollar Value of Credits   |   |                      | \$120,000.00         |                                    | \$120,000.00     |              | \$80,000.00    |    | \$120,000.00   |    | \$120,000.00   |
| Bid Total:  |   |                      | \$2,544,046.59       |                                    | \$2,607,757.74   |              | \$3,382,649.55 |    | \$3,669,856.51 |    | \$3,731,060.49 |
| Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits   |   |                      | \$2,544,046.59       |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Percent Over Low Bid:   |   |                      | 0.00%                |                                    | 2.504%           |              | 32.963%        |    | 44.253%        |    | 46.658%        |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)  |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | no             |    | no             |    | no             |
| Proceed to Tier III?  |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | no             |    | no             |    | no             |
| Tier III - History Experience Factors   |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (OSHA.gov) |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   |                      | no                   |                                    | no               |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Total Negative History and Experience Factors:  |   |                      | 0                    |                                    | 0                |              | 0              |    | 0              |    | 0              |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited   |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)   |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Proceed to Tier IV?   |   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              | no             |    | no             |    | no             |
| Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)  |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |   |                      |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                   |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                           |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                        |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                          |                      | yes                  |                                    | yes              |              |                |    |                |    |                |
| Total Number of "Yes" Answers   |   |                      | 5                    |                                    | 5                |              | 0              |    | 0              |    | 0              |
| Division's Recommendation:  |   | George J. Igel & Co. |                      |                                    |                  |              |                |    |                |    |                |

| CITY OF COLUMBUS<br>BID EVALUATION FORM<br>(FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|---|---|----------------------------|--|-----------------------|----------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|---------------|
| Department: <u>Public Utilities</u>   |   |                            | CIP Number: <u>610744</u>                                |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Division: <u>Sewerage and Drainage</u>  |   |                            | Project Name: <u>Parkside Road Stormwater System Imp</u> |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   |   |                            | Funding Source: <u>Storm Sewer Bond Fund</u>             |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   |   |                            | Bid Opening Date: <u>08/31/2005</u>                      |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>554,187.00</u>  |   |                            | Engineer's Estimate: \$ <u>1,998,675.00</u>              |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Non-Local Low Bid at Opening: \$ <u>883,207.20</u>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| COMPANY NAME  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | <u>Storts Excavation, Inc.</u>  | <u>Double Z Constr Co.</u> | <u>Complete General</u>                                  | <u>Nickolas Savko</u> | <u>Trucco Construction</u> |            |            |            |            |               |
| Original Bid Amount:  | \$ 554,187.00   | \$ 671,967.00              | \$ 677,561.40  | \$ 869,980.56         | \$ 883,207.20              | \$         | 671,967.00 | \$         | 671,967.00 | \$ 671,967.00 |
| Local Company?  | Yes   | Yes                        | Yes  | Yes                   | No                         |            | Yes        |            | Yes        | Yes           |
| <b>FACTORS</b>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier I - Mandatory Factors</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| M-1   | Bid is responsive   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-2   | Bidder is compliant with city taxes on payroll and net profits                                  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-3   | Bidder will make financial statements available upon request                                    | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-4   | Bidder is currently debarred from doing business with any govt. agency                          | no                         | no   | no                    | no                         | no         | no         | no         | no         | no            |
| M-5   | Bidder has requisite licenses   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| M-6   | Bidder has provided a contract compliance no., or application for one                           | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| Proceed to Tier II?   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier II - Creditable Factors (each yes answer gives 1% credit)</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| C-1   | Bidder is eligible for local credit - (Based on lowest non-local bid)                           | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-2   | Bidder is eligible for local workforce credit   | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-3   | Bidder is eligible for quality training contractor credit                                       | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | no                         | no         | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
| C-4   | Bidder is eligible for health insurance credit  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
|   | % of insurance provided by company  | 100.00%                    | 100.00%  | 100.00%               | 60.00%                     | 75.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%       |
| C-5   | Bidder is eligible for retirement or pension plan credit  | yes                        | yes  | yes                   | yes                        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes        | yes           |
|   | % of retirement or pension plan provided by company   | 3.00%                      | 100.00%  | 100.00%               | 100.00%                    | 50.00%     | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%    | 100.00%       |
| C-6   | Bidder is eligible for environmental preference   | no                         | yes  | no                    | yes                        | no         |            |            |            |               |
|   | Total Credits (cannot exceed \$20,000 per factor or \$120,000 in total)                         | 5.00%                      | 10.00%   | 5.00%                 | 9.00%                      | 3.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%      | 5.00%         |
|   | Dollar Value of Credits   | 31,000                     | 51,000   | 31,000                | 45,458                     | 16,626     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000     | 31,000        |
|   | Bid Total:  | 523,187.45                 | 620,967.45   | 646,561.85            | 824,522.88                 | 866,581.59 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45 | 640,967.45    |
| Low Bid Dollar Amount After Credits \$ <u>523,187.45</u>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Percent Over Low Bid: <u>0.000%</u>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid after credits)  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Proceed to Tier III?  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier III - History Experience Factors</b>  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-1  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with City of Columbus affirmative action programs         | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-2  | Bidder has a record of non-compliance with federal, state and local affirmative action programs | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-3  | Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-4  | Bidder has paid liquidated damages in the past 3 years  | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-5  | Principals or principal employees of bidder have record of fraud, collusion, etc.               | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-6  | Bidder has been debarred from doing business with govt. agency(s) in past 3 years               | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-7  | Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following:                 |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | A. Fair Labor Standards Act   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | B. Prevailing Wage Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | C. Unemployment Compensation Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
|   | D. Worker's Compensation Laws   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-8  | Bidder has a record of "willful or "serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years            | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-9  | Bidder has an adequate health and safety plan and supporting documentation                      | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-10   | Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR                                      | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-11   | Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years                                   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| HE-12   | The results of Bidder's references are questionable   | no                         |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Total Negative History and Experience Factors:  |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| A negative score in tier III may result in further investigation of bid, if merited   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Bid investigated with satisfactory outcome? (Requires user input)   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Proceed to Tier IV?   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| <b>Tier IV - Resource Factors (yes answers desirable)</b>   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Note: Tier IV entails examining resource factors of bidder specific to the project for which the bid was solicited. The field of eligible bidders will be determined through application of Tiers I through III. In Tier IV, a review of the remaining bidders' resource factors will be conducted, following which, the City will select a contractor (s). |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-1   | Bidder has sufficient physical resources to reasonably complete this project (e.g., equipment)  | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-2   | Bidder's management has sufficient experience to ensure completion of project                   | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-3   | Bidder's workforce has sufficient experience to complete this project                           | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-4   | Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel proposed for this project                        | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| R-5   | Bidder does not have too many current projects to take on this project                          | yes                        |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Total Number of "Yes" Answers   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| 5 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0   |   |                            |  |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |
| Division's Recommendation:  |   |                            | <u>Storts Ecavation, Inc.</u>                            |                       |                            |            |            |            |            |               |