ORD# 0236	6-2014				
	CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)				
	Department:	Public Utilities	× •		
	Division:	Water			
Lo	owest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,274,496.95			
	<u>Vendor Name:</u> Bid Tab Amount:	Elite Excavating \$2,274,496.95	Beheler Excavating \$2,334,481.59	<u>Conie</u> \$2,436,390.00	Shelly & Sands \$2,480,452.26
	FACTORS				
Pgs. 6-7) & orm 1 (Pg. 2) - Contract ompliance		yes	yes	yes	y
orm 2 <u>-</u> laims & quidated amages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors:	no 0	no 0	yes -1	
orm 3 - Cor	mpliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &				
egulations:					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N): 1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	
	 Unemployment Compensation Laws Workers' Compensation Laws 	no	no no	no no	
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs				
	(Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation	no	no	no	
	EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	no	yes	
	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes -1	yes 0	:
	Ť	0	-1	U	
orm 4 - Sta	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws: 1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA				
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	no	no	2
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	Vec	Voc	Vec	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	0	
<u>orm 5 -</u>	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years				
<u>ebarment</u>	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	0 0	0 no	0 no	
orm 6 <u>-</u> ocal orkforce	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	5.0%	0.0%	50.0%	52.0
	Negative Factors:				
orm 7 - Hea	alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	у
	 If yes, percentage paid into plan: Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 	ER: 100% office, EE: union yes	ER: 100% yes	ER: 100% yes	ER: 100
	5. Didder has retrement of pension plan: (1/14)	ER: up to 4% match, EE:	yes	yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	union designated amount	ER: 100%	see comment	ER: 100
	integrative ratelers.		•		
pprenticeship					
pprenticeship	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	no -1	no -1	
pprenticeship rograms	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:				
pprenticeship rograms	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)				
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	0	-1	-1	

ORD# 0236-2014

	-2014 <u>Vendor Name:</u> Bid Tab Amount:	Elite Excavating \$2,274,496.95	Beheler Excavating \$2,334,481.59	<u>Conie</u> \$2,436,390.00	<u>Shelly & Sands</u> \$2,480,452.26
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	\$2,274,490.95 yes	\$2,554,461.59 yes	\$2,430,390.00 yes	\$2,400,432.20 Ve
	adlines and Cost Control	<i>/</i>	7		/-
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar				
	construction projects (Y/N)	see comments	see comment	see comment	see commer
orm 12 - Av					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	ade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing				
	requirements (Y/N)	yes	no	no	n
	License and/or Certificate No: Negative Factors:	SW0088, G4169	SW0196	SW0035	no City license # liste
	Negative Factors:		0		
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,334,481.59	\$2,334,481.59	\$2,334,481.59	\$2,334,481.5
	Percent Over Low Bid:	<u>\$2,554,481.59</u> -2.6%	<u>\$2,534,481.59</u> 0.0%	4.37%	6.25%
F	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	-2.070 yes	yes	4.5776 yes	0.237 ye
	undamentary Equivalent Did (1.e., within 1070 of 10% Did)	yes	<i>y</i> cs	yes	je
Po 30 - Envir	conmental Preference				
<u><u><u>x</u>. 50 Entra</u></u>	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid				did not evaluate since no
	book? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	within 5% or \$20
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable			•	
	bidder (%) Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	-2.57%	0.00%	4.4%	6.3%
	bidder (\$)	(\$59,984.64)	\$0.00	\$101,908.41	\$145,970.67
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark				
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no; already lowest bidder	no	no	n
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita	no, aready lowest bluder	10	10	
	Musser been notified?	n/a			
Dag 21 24 S	Statements and Affidavits				
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	100	100	100	
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes yes	yes yes	yes yes	ye ye
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
datement 3.	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes	yes	yc
Affidavit	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
iiiidu vit	Negative Factors:	yes	0	0	Je
	rieguerre r uctoror		Ū	Ŭ	
Pg. 42 -					
ddenda	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project				
cknlgmt.	(Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	ye
<u>Proposal</u> Pg. 43) -					
<u>roposal</u> lignature	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	ves	ves	yes	ve
ignature.	Negative Factors:	yes	0	0	Je
	- Cogation Pactorial		v	Ū	
29. 44 - Prope	osal Bond				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name				
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of				
	Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-2	-2	-
	Division's Recommendation:			Elite	Excavating Co. of Ohio
Additional Ev	valuation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Sectior	1 102.08, not covered abov	e in <mark>RED.</mark>		
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under				
)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	n
3)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	n
	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not				
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	n
	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all				
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or				
l)	deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	ye
	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to				
6	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	n
·	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract				
í l					
6)	item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	n
5) 	item listed? (Y/N) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where				n
6) 7)	item listed? (Y/N)	no no 0	no no 0	<u>no</u> 0	Т

	Department:	CIP Number:	690236-1		
	Division:	Project Name:	Chase Rd. Are		
		Funding Source: Bid Opening Date:	Water 1 1/15/		
Lov	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	Engineer's Estimate:	\$2,659,4		
	<u>Vendor Name:</u> Bid Tab Amount:	John Eramo \$2,540,376.30	Cols. Asphalt Paving \$2,876,663.90	Fields Excavating \$2,982,080.20	
	FACTORS	\$2,3 4 0,370.30	\$2,870,003.90	\$2,982,080.20	
<	<u>IACIONS</u>				
	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes		
	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no		
	Negative Factors:	0	0		
	pliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &				
1	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
	Fair Labor Standards Act Prevailing Wage Laws	no yes	no		
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no		
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no		
1	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no		
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation				
ŕ	EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request	yes	yes		
	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes -1	yes 0		
	Negative ractors:	-1	0		
	and Federal Health and Safety Laws:				
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA				
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current	yes	no		
	OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes		
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan 4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)	yes	yes		
	(Y/N)5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years	yes	yes		
	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	no -1	<u>no</u>		
<u>5 -</u>	 Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N) 	no	no		
	Negative Factors:	0	0		
	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties Negative Factors:	82.0%	75.0%	(
	Negative Factors:				
	th Care and Pension/Retirement Programs				
	Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) If was, persentage prid into plan:	yes	yes	ED: 100% (up	
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan: 3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	ER: 80% - EE: 20% yes	ER: 100% yes	ER: 100% (un	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100% (un	
	Negative Factors:	0	0		
<u>8 -</u> nticeship					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	no -1	yes 0		
	ž		0		
	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED				
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project	yes	yes		
	(Y/N) perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes	yes		

ORD# 0236-2014

	Vendor Name:	John Eramo	Cols. Asphalt Paving	Fields Excavating
F	Bid Tab Amount: Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	\$2,540,376.30 yes	\$2,876,663.90 yes	\$2,982,080.20 ve
	dlines and Cost Control	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar			
	construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	yes	see commen
Form 12 - Avai	1 5		<i>j</i> - <i>v</i>	
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	ves	yes	ve
	de Licenses and Certificates	,	,	,
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	ve
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing			
	requirements (Y/N)	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0004	no City license # listed	SW0013
	Negative Factors:	0	0	(
]	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,334,481.59	\$2,334,481.59	\$2,334,481.59
	Percent Over Low Bid:	8.82%	23.22%	27.74%
Fu	indamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	no	no
	nmental Preference			
Γ	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid	did not evaluate since not	did not evaluate since not	did not evaluate since no
	book? (Y/N)	within 5% or \$20k	within 5% or \$20k	within 5% or \$201
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	8.8%	23.2%	27.7%
E	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable			
	bidder (\$)	\$205,894.71	\$542,182.31	\$647,598.61
Γ	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark	,	,	. ,
	'Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the			
10	owest non-envionmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no
	f awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita			
Ν	Musser been notified?			
Pgs. 31-34 - Sta	atements and Affidavits			
Statement 1: E	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye:
Statement 2: 1	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	not dated	ye:
Statement 3: A	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	not dated	ye:
P	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized			
Affidavit (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	(
Pg. 42 -				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project			
	Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a
Proposal				
(<u>Pg. 43)</u> - Proposal				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	ves	ves	ve
<u>Signume</u>	Negative Factors:	90	yes 0	<u> </u>
	fitgative Pactors.	U	0	
Pg. 44 - Propos	sal Rond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name			
	Y/N)	Vec	Vec	Ve
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of	yes	yes	ye
	Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes	ye
	regative Factors.			
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-3	0	(
	Grand Fotal regative Factors:			
	Division's Recommendation:	Inc.		
	Division 5 Accommentation.			
Additional Eva	aluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section	1		
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under		Ĩ	
1	he same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)			
1) 4	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
		no	no	no
2) A				
2) <u>A</u> [Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not	-		
2) <u>A</u> I 3) p	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2) A I 3) P L	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all	no	no	nc
2) A I 3) P I n	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all naterial respects, and does not contain irregularities or			
2) A I 3) P L 4) d	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	no yes	no yes	
2) A I 3) p I 4) d I I I I I I I I I I I I I	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all naterial respects, and does not contain irregularities or leviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to	yes	yes	ye
2) A I 3) P I 4) d 5) a	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or leviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)			ye
2) A I 3) P 4) d 5) a I I I I I I	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract	yes no	yes no	ye: no
2) A I 3) P 4) d 5) a 6) it	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all naterial respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract tem listed? (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye: no
2) A I 3) P 4) d 5) a 6) if	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or leviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract tem listed? (Y/N) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where	yes no no	yes no no	ye: no
2) A I 3) P 4) d 5) a 6) if	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N) Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all naterial respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N) Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract tem listed? (Y/N)	yes no	yes no	ye: no