## CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)

Department: Public Utilities
Division: Water

CIP Number: Project Name: Funding Source: Bid Opening Date: Engineer's Estimate:

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,499,998.79

	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,499,998.79		Engineer's Estimate:
	Vendor Name:	Beheler Excavating	Shelly & Sands	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,499,998.79	\$2,961,890.21	\$3,085,096.92
	FACTORS			
Pgs. 6-7) &				
Form 1 (Pg. 25) - Contract	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or			
Compliance	submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	no	y
Form 2 -				•
Claims &	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or			
<u>Liquidated</u> Damages	has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	r
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	
Compliance				
vith Various	D:11 1 1 14: 4 10 6:14: 31			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	1
	Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	
	Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	r
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	1
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any			
	governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs			
	(Y/N)	no	no	r
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation			
	EMR (Y/N)	no	yes	ye
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	¥100	Yan	***
	Negative Factors:	yes -1	yes 0	y <sub>1</sub>
	rieguire I uctors.	1	· ·	
Form 4 - Stat	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA			
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	yes	y
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current			
	OSHA standards (Y/N)  3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yo yo
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)  4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)	yes	yes	y v
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years			•
	(Y/N)	no	no	r
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	
	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business			
<u>Form 5 - </u>	with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years			
<u>Debarment</u>	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	0	0	n
	regative Pactors.	U	U	
Form 6 -				
Local	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from			
Workforce	Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	52.0%	82.0
	Negative Factors:			
Form 7 - Hea	lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 80% - EE: 20
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
				-
Apprenticeship	1 Diddon has hone fide amment: 1: 0 (X/A)			1
Apprenticeship	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)  Negative Factors:  Negative Factors:    Negative Factors   Page 1   Page 2   Page	no -1	yes	
Apprenticeship	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)     Negative Factors:	no -1	0	
Apprenticeship Programs				
Apprenticeship Programs	Negative Factors:			
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	Negative Factors: erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED	-1	0	ye
Apprenticeship Programs Form 9 - Exp	Negative Factors:  erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED  Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	-1	0	

## ORD# 0251-2014

	Vendor Name:	Beheler Excavating	Shelly & Sands	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,499,998.79	\$2,961,890.21	\$3,085,096.92
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
<u>Form 11 - D</u>	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see commen
Form 12 - A		see comment	see comment	see commen
•	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	PM to evaluate	yes
Form 13 - Ti	rade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	ves	no	ne
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0196	no City license # listed	SW0004
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,499,998.79	10.101	
	Percent Over Low Bid: Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	0.0% yes	18.48% no	23.40%
	Fundamentary Equivalent Bid (1.e., within 10 % of low bid)	yes	110	IIO
Pg. 53 - Envi	ironmental Preference			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid		did not evaluate since not	did not evaluate since no
	book? (Y/N)	no	within 5% or \$20k	within 5% or \$20k
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	0.00%	18.48%	23.40%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$461,891.42	\$585,098.13
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark			
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-envionmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita	,		
	Musser been notified?	n/a		
Pgs. 54-57 -	Statements and Affidavits			
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes	no
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized			
Affidavit	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	yes -1
Pg. 66 - Addenda Acknlgmt.	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	7/0	77/0	- (-
Proposal (Pg. 67) - Proposal	(1714)	n/a	n/a	n/a
Signature	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
D (0 D				
Pg. 68 - Prop	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name			
	(Y/N)	ves	yes	ves
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of			
	Compliance (Y/N)  Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	yes
	Negative ractors:	U	U	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-2	-2	-4
	Division's Recommendation:			Beheler Excavating, Inc
	A			
Additional <b>E</b>	Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Sectio	n 102.08, not covered abo	ove in RED.	
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under			
1) 2)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N) Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
<u>~)</u>	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not	no	no	no
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)  Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all	no	no	no
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	****	saa oommont	200
4)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to	yes	see comment	no
4)				
<u>4)</u> <u>5)</u>	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no
<ul><li>4)</li><li>5)</li><li>6)</li></ul>	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)  Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no no	no no	no
<ul><li>4)</li><li>5)</li><li>6)</li><li>7)</li></ul>	accept or reject an award? (Y/N) Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract			

	Department: _	690236-100043	
	Division:	Cooke Rd. Area	WL Imp's
	<del>-</del>	Water Bonds 1/22/14	
Lo	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,837,91	
			~ .
	Vendor Name: Bid Tab Amount:	Elite Excavating \$3,120,521.55	<u>Conie</u> \$3,339,485.00
		. , ,	
	<u>FACTORS</u>		
Pgs. 6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 5) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	
orm 2 - laims & iquidated amages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)  Negative Factors:	no O	
	regative Pactors.	U	
ompliance ith Various	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with		
	the following (Y/N):  1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	
	Unemployment Compensation Laws     Workers' Compensation Laws	no	
	Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	no	
	(Y/N)  6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	no yes	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request		
	(Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	
	, and the second		
orm 4 - Stat	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:  1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	
	Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	
	Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan     Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes yes	
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	
	Negative Factors:	-1	
<u>Form 5 -</u> Debarment	Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		
ерш теп	Negative Factors:	0	
orm 6 <u>-</u> ocal orkforce	What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	0.0%	43
	Negative Factors:		
orm 7 - Hea	lth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs		
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	mn s
	If yes, percentage paid into plan:     Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	see comment yes	ER: 10
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 4% match, EE: up to 15%	see com
	Negative Factors:	0	
orm 8 <u>-</u>			
rograms	Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)     Negative Factors:	yes 0	
	negative ractions.		
O E	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED		
orm 9 - Exp		TIOC	
orm 9 - Exp	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	

## ORD# 0251-2014

Sendor Name:  Bid Tab Amount:  atte specialized equipment for project (Y/N)  Control eadlines & controlled costs on similar ects (Y/N)  ave substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)  Certificates  provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	Elite Excavating \$3,120,521.55  yes  see comments  yes  yes  SW0088, G4169	See comment  yes  yes  yes  See Sw0035
ate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)  Control eadlines & controlled costs on similar ects (Y/N)  nave substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)  Certificates provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes see comments yes yes yes SW0088, G4169	see comment yes yes
Control eadlines & controlled costs on similar ects (Y/N)  nave substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)  Certificates provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	see comments yes yes Sw0088, G4169	see comment yes yes
eadlines & controlled costs on similar ects (Y/N)  nave substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)  Certificates provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	yes yes
ects (Y/N)  nave substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)  Certificates  provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N)  ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	yes yes
Certificates provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	yes
Certificates provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	yes
provide licensed workforce (Y/N) ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	no
ge subcontractors to comply w/licensing N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes SW0088, G4169 24.82%	no
N) ertificate No:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	SW0088, G4169 24.82%	
Regative Factors:  Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	SW0088, G4169 24.82%	
Negative Factors:  llar of non-environmental preferred bidder  Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	24.82%	S W 0033
llar of non-environmental preferred bidder Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)		
Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)		
Percent Over Low Bid: quivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)		
		33.58%
ence	no	no
ence		
umentation meet guidelines stated in bid		did not evaluate since not
s lowest non-environmental preferrable	within 5% or \$20k	within 5% or \$20k
s lowest non-environmental preferrable	24.82%	33.58%
s lowest non-environmental preferrable	24.02 /0	33.36 / 0
	\$620.522.76	\$839,486.21
ive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark	ψ-0-0,022a,70	ψου <b>2,100.21</b>
nmentally preferred bid.	no	no
fied?		
		yes
		yes yes
	yes	ycs
in may been signed by unimit to nothinged	ves	yes
Negative Factors:	,	0
and a district and a second district and a second as a second as		
owiedged any addendums issued on project	n/o	7/0
	II/a	n/a
	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0
lated Proposal Pand including Surety name		
icted Proposal Bolid including Surety liame	ves	ves
ed Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	*	yes
		yes
	700	7
N)	yes	yes
Negative Factors:	0	0
Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-2
District Decrees of the		
Division's Recommendation:		
one for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section		
	no	no
		no
	no	no
	see comment	yes
an award? (Y/N)	no	no
to submit a unit price for each Contract	no.	
to submit a unit price for each Contract	no	no
to submit a unit price for each Contract	no	
the hard of the ha	owledged any addendums issued on project  bleted the Proposal Signature (Y/N)  Negative Factors:  bleted Proposal Bond including Surety name  hed Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)  hed Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)  hed Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of N)	\$620,522.76  sive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark inthin 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the bommentally preferred bid.  or is environmentally preferable, has Anita ified?  ffidavits  to on City income taxes (Y/N)  pas been initialed/dated (Y/N)  pes has been completed (Y/N)  pes has been signed by affiant & notarized  yes  Negative Factors:  Outleded any addendums issued on project  n/a  bleted Proposal Signature (Y/N)  pes Negative Factors:  Outleded Proposal Bond including Surety name  pet Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)  pes hed Surety Financial Statement (Y/N)  pes Megative Factors:  Outleded Proposal Signature (Y/N)  pes hed Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of N)  yes  Negative Factors:  Outleded Total Negative Factors:  Outleded Total Negative Factors:  Juvision's Recommendation:  Ons for Non-Responsive Proposals per Sections submitted more than one proposal under subsidiary? (Y/N)  pes material unbalanced? (Y/N)  pes material unba