ORD# 0929	-2014					
		CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM				
	Department:	Public Utilities	(FOR CONTRA CIP Number:	ACTS OVER \$20,000) 690236-1	00054	
	Division:	Water	Project Name:	Ferris Rd. Area	a WL Imp's	
			Funding Source: Bid Opening Date:	Water Bonds 4/9/14 \$2,204,062.30		
Lo	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,247,996.30	Engineer's Estimate:			
	Vendor Name: Bid Tab Amount:	<u>Danbert</u> \$2,247,996.30	Shelly & Sands \$2,320,223.18	Underground Utilities \$2,334,727.89	John Eramo \$2,377,287.00	
	FACTORS	\$2,247,990.30	\$2,320,223.18	\$2,334,727.89	\$2,377,287.00	
(Pgs. 6-7) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance Form 2 -	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N) Negative Factors:	no 0	no 0	no 0	no 0	
Form 3 - Con	<i>npliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &</i> Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):					
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no no	no	no	
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	yes	
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no	
	Workers' Compensation Laws S. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs	no	no	no	no	
	(Y/N) 6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	no yes	no yes	no yes	no	
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	ves	ves	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1	
Form A Sta	te and Federal Health and Safety Laws:					
101111 4 - 514	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA					
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	no yes	yes	yes	no	
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.)					
	(Y/N) 5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	U	
<u>Form 5 -</u> Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0	
<u>Form 6 -</u> Local Workforce	1. What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	100.0%	52.0%	4.0%	82.0%	
	Negative Factors:					
Form 7 - Hea	alth Care and Pension/Retirement Programs					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N) 2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 100%	yes ER: 80% - EE: 20%	
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	Jek: 100% yes	yes	Yes	ER: 80% - EE: 20% yes	
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	
	negative ractors:	0	0			
<u>Form 8 -</u> Apprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	nc	
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1	
Form 9 - Exp	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)					
Form 10 - Ex	(Y/N) cperience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	yes	yes	yes	yes	
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	(blank)	yes	yes	"TBD"	
Form 11 - De	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N) eadlines and Cost Control	'none required'	yes	yes	yes	
Form 12 - Av	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment	see comment	see comment	
<u>r orm 12 - A</u>)	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes	
		,03	703	,05		

ORD# 0929-2014

ORD# 0929-	-2014				
	Vendor Name:	Danbert	Shelly & Sands	Underground Utilities	<u>John Eramo</u>
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,247,996.30	\$2,320,223.18	\$2,334,727.89	\$2,377,287.00
	ade Licenses and Certificates				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing				
	requirements (Y/N)	no	yes	(blank)	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	City license # not listed	no City license # listed	SW00005	SW0004
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,320,223.18			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	-3.1%	0.00%	0.63%	2.46%
F	undamentally Equivalent Bid ('I.e., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes
D 00 D 1					
	conmental Preference				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid				
	book? (Y/N)	yes	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable		0.000/	0.500	• • • • • •
	bidder (%)	-3.11%	0.00%	0.63%	2.46%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable				
	bidder (\$)	(\$72,226.88)	\$0.00	\$14,504.71	\$57,063.82
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark				
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the	no; already the lowest			
	lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	bidder	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita				
	Musser been notified?				
Pgs. 31-34 - S	statements and Affidavits				
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	"is not"	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized				
Affidavit	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<u>Pg. 43 -</u>					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project				
<u>Acknlgmt.</u>	(Y/N)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
<u>Proposal</u>					
(Pg. 44) -					
Proposal					
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	U
D (0 D					
Pg. 68 - Propa					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name				
	(Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of				
	Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1	-2
	Division's Recommendation:				Danbert, Inc.
	valuation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Sectio	n 102.08, not covered abo	ove in RED .		
	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under				
1)	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not				
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all				
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or				
	deviations? (Y/N)	yes	no	yes	yes
	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to				
5)	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract				
6)	item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
6)	item listed? (Y/N) Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where	no	no	no	no
		no	no	no	no

ORD# 0929				
	Department:			
Ţ	Division:			
Lo	west, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Cols. Asphalt Paving	Conie
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,628,193.70	\$2,649,771.52	\$2,911,700.00
	FACTORS			
Pgs. 6-7) & Form 1 (Pg.	FACIORS			
2) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	???; can't read one of the sub's names	y
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	y
	Negative Factors:	0	0	-
Form 3 - Con	pliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	(blan
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws 3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no no	no no	(blan) (blan)
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	(blan
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	(blan
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N) 7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon	yes	yes	y
	request (Y/N)	yes	yes	y
	Negative Factors:	0	0	
Form 4 - Stat	e and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA			
	violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov) 2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	no	i
	 Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N) 	yes yes	yes yes	y y
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	1
	Negative Factors:	-1	0	
Form <u>5</u> - Debarment	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	по	по	1
	Negative Factors:	0	0	1
<u>Form 6 -</u> Local Workforce	 What percentage of bidder's emloyees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties 	0.0%	75.0%	47.0
	Negative Factors:			
Form 7 - Hea	Ith Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	ye
	 If yes, percentage paid into plan: Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N) 	see comment yes	ER: 100% yes	ER: 100
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan: Negative Factors:	ER: 4%-EE: up to 15%	ER: 100%	see comme
Form 8 <u>-</u> pprenticeship Programs	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	1
	ž			
Form 9 - Exp	erience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (V/N)		not lists I	
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N) Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes yes	not listed yes	y
Form 10 - Ex	perience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED	903	305	y
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N) Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yı V
Form 11 - De	adlines and Cost Control Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar	yes	yes	y.
Form 12 - Av	construction projects (Y/N)	see comments	see comment	see comme
orm 12 - AV	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	y
		<i>,</i> 00	500	,

ORD# 0929-2014

	-2014		Cala Assala H Dania	Courts
	Vendor Name:	Elite Excavating	Cols. Asphalt Paving	<u>Conie</u>
E 12 T.	Bid Tab Amount: ade Licenses and Certificates	\$2,628,193.70	\$2,649,771.52	\$2,911,700.00
<u>Form 13 - 11</u>	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)			
-	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing	yes	yes	yes
	requirements (Y/N)	Vac	not listed	
	License and/or Certificate No:	yes SW0088, G4169	City license # not listed	SW0035
	Negative Factors:	3 W 00 88, 04109	City license # not listed	<u> </u>
	Negative Factors:	U	U	U
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	13.27%	14.20%	25.49%
1	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	no	14.20 %	23.4970 no
	undamentarly Equivalent Did (i.e., whill 10/0 of 10% Did)	10	110	10
Pg 30 - Envi	ronmental Preference			
1 g. 50 - Envi	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid			
	book? (Y/N)	ves	no	ves
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	,		,
	bidder (%)	13.27%	14.20%	25.49%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable	1012170	112070	2011/ /0
	bidder (\$)	\$307,970.52	\$329,548.34	\$591,476.82
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark	+++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++	+	+
	"Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the			
	lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita	10	10	10
	Musser been notified?			
Pgs. 31-34 - 9	Statements and Affidavits			
	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	initialed but not dated	yes
	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized			
Affidavit	(Y/N)	ves	initialed but not dated	ves
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0
Pg. 43 -				
Addenda	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project			
Acknlgmt.	(Y/N)	N/A	N/A	N/A
<u>Proposal</u>				
(Pg. 44) -				
Proposal				
<u>Signature</u>	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N) Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	yes
	Negative Factors:	U	0	0
Pg. 68 - Prop	osal Rond			
1 g. 08 - 110p	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name			
	(Y/N)	Vac	Vac	
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (1/N) Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of	yes	yes	yes
	Compliance (Y/N)	Vac	Vac	
	Negative Factors:	yes 0	yes 0	yes
	Acgative Factors.	U	0	U
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	0	-2
	Granu Totai Negative Factors:	-1	0	-4
	Division's Recommendation:			
	Division's Recommendation.			
Additional E	valuation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Sections			
- autuonai E	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under			
n	the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no
-/	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not	10	10	110
3)	provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no
-/	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all	10	10	10
	material respects, and does not contain irregularities or			
4)	deviations? (Y/N)	yes	no	no
-/	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to	yes	10	10
5)	accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	
~/	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract	110	110	
6	item listed? (Y/N)	Po	no	
v /	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where	no	110	
7)	required? (Y/N)	no	no	
"	Negative Factors:	0	-1	-1
		U	-1	-