

**CITY OF COLUMBUS  
 BID EVALUATION FORM  
 (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)**

Department: Public Utilities CIP Number: 690236-100052  
 Division: Water Project Name: Regina Avenue Area WL Imp's  
 Funding Source: Water Bonds  
 Bid Opening Date: 4/30/14  
 Engineer's Estimate: \$3,307,651.71

Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$2,553,515.40

	Vendor Name:	Underground Utilities	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,553,515.40	\$2,684,312.51	\$2,721,839.56	\$2,776,479.60
<b>FACTORS</b>					
<i>(Pgs. 6-7) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</i>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</i>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<i>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp;</i>					
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):				
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no	no	yes
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
<i>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</i>					
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	yes	yes	yes	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	n	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1	0
<i>Form 5 - Debarment</i>					
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<i>Form 6 - Local Workforce</i>					
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	4.0%	52.0%	0.0%	82.0%
	Negative Factors:				
<i>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</i>					
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	see comment	ER: 80% - EE: 20%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%	ER: 4%-EE: up to 15%	ER: 100%
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<i>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</i>					
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	-1
<i>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</i>					
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</i>					
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	"TBD"
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<i>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</i>					
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	see comment	see comments	see comment
<i>Form 12 - Availability</i>					
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes

	Vendor Name:	Underground Utilities	Shelly & Sands	Elite Excavating	John Eramo
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$2,553,515.40	\$2,684,312.51	\$2,721,839.56	\$2,776,479.60
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	(blank)	no	yes	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW00005	no City license # listed	SW0088, G4169	SW0004
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$2,553,515.40			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.0%	5.1%	6.6%	8.7%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes
<b>Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference</b>					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	yes	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (%)	0.00%	5.12%	6.59%	8.73%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferable bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$130,797.11	\$168,324.16	\$222,964.19
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?	n/a			
<b>Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits</b>					
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	marked "is not"	yes	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<b>Pg. 43 - Addenda Acknlsmt.</b>					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
<b>Proposal (Pg. 44) - Proposal Signature</b>					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
<b>Pg. 68 - Proposal Bond</b>					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	-1	-1	-1	-2
	Division's Recommendation:	Underground Utilities			
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.</b>					
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no; corrected subtotal & extended total	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	marked "is not" current on taxes; may be error/misunderstanding though	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0

Department: Division:			
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:			
	Vendor Name:	Cols. Asphalt Paving	Conie
	Bid Tab Amount:	\$3,078,606.85	\$3,227,400.00
<b>FACTORS</b>			
<u>(Pgs. 6-7) &amp; Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims &amp; Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws &amp;</b>			
	Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):		
	1. Fair Labor Standards Act	no	no
	2. Prevailing Wage Laws	no	no
	3. Unemployment Compensation Laws	no	no
	4. Workers' Compensation Laws	no	no
	5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)	no	no
	6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers' Compensation EMR (Y/N)	yes	yes
	7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)	yes	yes
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</b>			
	1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)	no	no
	2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)	yes	yes
	3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan	yes	yes
	4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)	yes	yes
	5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 5 - Debarment</b>			
	1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 6 - Local Workforce</b>			
	1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties	75.0%	50.0%
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>		
<b>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</b>			
	1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	ER: 100%
	3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)	yes	yes
	4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:	ER: 100%	see comment
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</b>			
	1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)	yes	no
	<b>Negative Factors:</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-1</b>
<b>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</b>			
	Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</b>			
	Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)	yes	yes
<b>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</b>			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	yes	see comment
<b>Form 12 - Availability</b>			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes

		<b>Vendor Name:</b>	<b>Cols. Asphalt Paving</b>	<b>Conie</b>
		<b>Bid Tab Amount:</b>	\$3,078,606.85	\$3,227,400.00
<b>Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates</b>				
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)		no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:		SW0010	SW0035
	Negative Factors:		0	0
<b>Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder</b>				
	Percent Over Low Bid:		20.6%	26.4%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)		no	no
<b>Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference</b>				
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		no	yes
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)		20.56%	26.39%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)		\$525,091.45	\$673,884.60
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?			
<b>Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits</b>				
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		initialed but not dated	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		initialed but not dated	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		initialed but not dated	yes
	Affidavit Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)		initialed but not dated	yes
	Negative Factors:		0	0
<b>Pg. 43 - Addenda Acknsmt.</b>				
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		n/a	n/a
<b>Proposal (Pg. 44) - Proposal Signature</b>				
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Negative Factors:		0	0
<b>Pg. 68 - Proposal Bond</b>				
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)		yes	yes
	Negative Factors:		0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:		0	-2
	Division's Recommendation:			
<b>Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section</b>				
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)		no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)		no; corrected subtotal & extended total	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)		no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)		yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)		no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)		no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)		no	no
	Negative Factors:		0	0