

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)					
Department: Public Utilities		CIP Number: 690527			
Division: Water		Project Name: 2014 Fire Hydrant Replacements			
		Funding Source: Water Bonds			
		Bid Opening Date: 6/25/14			
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$915,832.50		Engineer's Estimate: \$901,670.00			
Vendor Name: Darby Creek		Eramo & Sons	Conie	Travco	
Bid Tab Amount: \$915,832.50		\$929,786.00	\$964,700.00	\$988,182.25	
FACTORS					
(Pgs. 8-9) & Form 1 (Pg. 1) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	yes	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations					
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with					
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no	no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no	no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no	no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no	no	no
governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EN		yes	yes	yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request		yes	yes	yes	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	-1
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:					
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)		no	no	no	no
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA		yes	yes	yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years		no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Form 5 - Debarment					
with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce					
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		100.0%	82.0%	50.0%	71.0%
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs					
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	no
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 58% - EE: 42%	ER: 80% - EE: 20%	ER: 100%	0%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	no
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		"Varies"	ER: 100%	see comment	0%
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	-2
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs					
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		yes	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	-1	-1	-1
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED					
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED					
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	TBD	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	PM to evaluate
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control					
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects		yes	see comment	yes	See Attachment A
Form 12 - Availability					
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes

Vendor Name:		Darby Creek	Eramo & Sons	Conie	Travco
Bid Tab Amount:		\$915,832.50	\$929,786.00	\$964,700.00	\$988,182.25
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates					
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requi	no	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW0075	SW0004	SW0035	SW00037
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder	\$915,832.50			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	0.0%	1.5%	5.3%	7.9%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	yes	yes	yes	yes
Pg. 29 - Environmental Preference					
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no	yes	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	0.00%	1.52%	5.34%	7.90%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	\$0.00	\$13,953.50	\$48,867.50	\$72,349.75
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?				
Pgs. 30-33 - Statements and Affidavits					
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes, initialed, not dated	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	Initialed, not dated	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	Initialed, not dated	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. 42 - Addenda Acknlgmt.					
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Proposal (Pg. 43) - Signature					
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
Pg. 44 - Proposal Bond					
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Co	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1	-2	-4
	Division's Recommendation:	Darby Creek Excavating, Inc.			

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0	0	0

Department: Division:			
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:			
Vendor Name:		Columbus Asphalt	Downing
Bid Tab Amount:		\$1,016,070.00	\$1,390,963.48
FACTORS			
<u>(Pgs. 8-9) & Form 1 (Pg. 1) - Contract Compliance</u>	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
<u>Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages</u>	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations</u>			
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with			
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no
governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EN		yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:</u>			
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)		no	no
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA		yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan (Y/N)		yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years		no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 5 - Debarment</u>			
with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 6 - Local Workforce</u>			
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		75.0%	75.0%
<u>Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs</u>			
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 100%	ER: 5% - EE: 95%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 100%	ER: 100%
Negative Factors:		0	0
<u>Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs</u>			
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		yes	no
Negative Factors:		0	-1
<u>Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED</u>			
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	PM to evaluate
<u>Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED</u>			
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	PM to evaluate
<u>Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control</u>			
Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects		yes	see comment
<u>Form 12 - Availability</u>			
Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes

Vendor Name:		Columbus Asphalt	Downing
Bid Tab Amount:		\$1,016,070.00	\$1,390,963.48
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requi	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	SW00079	SW0401
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		
	Percent Over Low Bid:	10.9%	51.9%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid ('Le., within 10% of low bid)	no	no
Pg. 29 - Environmental Preference			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (%)	10.94%	51.88%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferrable bidder (\$)	\$100,237.50	\$475,130.98
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		
Pgs. 30-33 - Statements and Affidavits			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes, initialed, not dated	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	Initialed, not dated	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	Initialed, not dated	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 42 - Addenda Acknlgmt.	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	n/a	n/a
Proposal (Pg. 43) - Proposal Signature	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 44 - Proposal Bond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Co	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1
Division's Recommendation: arby Creek Excavating, Inc.			
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Secti			
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0