

CITY OF COLUMBUS BID EVALUATION FORM (FOR CONTRACTS OVER \$20,000)					
Department: Public Utilities					
Division: Power					
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount: \$331,322.97					
Vendor Name: U.S. Utility		Asplundh	Jess Howard	J. Ranck Electric	
Bid Tab Amount: \$331,322.97		\$389,919.09	\$467,122.63	\$566,317.40	
FACTORS					
(Pgs. 9-10) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes	no	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	-1	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:					
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):					
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no	no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no	no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no	no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no	no	no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:					
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)		yes	no	no	yes
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan		yes	yes	yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		-1	0	0	-1
Form 5 - Debarment					
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce					
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		65.0%	18.0%	90.0%	drawn from local union halls
Negative Factors:					
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs					
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 75, EE: 25%	ER: 100%	ER: 32%	ER: 75, EE: 25%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		ER: 3%, EE: 1-10%	ER: 100%	ER: 3%, EE: 3-12%	ER: 10%
Negative Factors:		0	0		0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs					
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED					
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED					
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes

		Vendor Name:	U.S. Utility	Asplundh	Jess Howard	J. Ranck Electric
		Bid Tab Amount:	\$331,322.97	\$389,919.09	\$467,122.63	\$566,317.40
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control						
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)		see comments	see comment	see comment	see comment
Form 12 - Availability						
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates						
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:		License # 24800	no license # listed	no license # listed	no license # listed
	Negative Factors:			0	0	0
	Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder		\$389,919.09			
	Percent Over Low Bid:		-15.0%	0.0%	19.80%	45.24%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)		yes	yes	no	no
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference						
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)		yes	no	no	no
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferred bidder (%)		-15.03%	0.00%	19.8%	45.2%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferred bidder (\$)		(\$58,596.12)	\$0.00	\$77,203.54	\$176,398.31
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.		no; already lowest bidder	no	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		N/A			
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits						
	Statement 1: Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 2: Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Statement 3: Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Affidavit: Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:			0	0	0
Pg. 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.						
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
Proposal (Pg. 41) - Proposal Signature						
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:			0	0	0
Pg. 44 - Proposal Bond						
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:		-1	0	-1	-1
Division's Recommendation:						

Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section 102.08, not covered above in RED.

1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)		yes	yes	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)		no	no	no	no
	Negative Factors:		0	0	0	0

Department:		440007-100005	440007-100005
Division:		South Linden Alleys SL	South Linden Alleys SL
		8/13/14	8/13/14
Lowest, Best, Most Responsive, Responsible Bid Tab Amount:		\$531,672.90	\$531,672.90
Vendor Name:		Miller Cable	Complete General
Bid Tab Amount:		\$644,050.00	\$1,035,990.23
FACTORS			
(Pgs. 9-10) & Form 1 (Pg. 12) - Contract Compliance	Bidder (& subs) have active Contract Compliance No., or submitted on-line (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 2 - Claims & Liquidated Damages	Bidder has a record of claims against performance bonds or has paid liquidated damages, in the past 3 years (Y/N)	no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
Form 3 - Compliance with Various Local, State, and Federal Laws & Regulations:			
Bidder has a record, within the past 3 years, of violations with the following (Y/N):			
1. Fair Labor Standards Act		no	no
2. Prevailing Wage Laws		no	no
3. Unemployment Compensation Laws		no	no
4. Workers' Compensation Laws		no	no
5. Bidder has a record of non-compliance with any governmental agency regarding affirmative action programs (Y/N)		no	no
6. Bidder qualifies for an Bureau of Workers Compensation EMR (Y/N)		yes	yes
7. Bidder will make financial statements available upon request (Y/N)		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Form 4 - State and Federal Health and Safety Laws:			
1. Bidder has a record of "Willful or "Serious" OSHA violations within the past 3 years (verify on OSHA.gov)		no	yes
2. Bidder has a health and safety plan compliant w/current OSHA standards (Y/N)		yes	yes
3. Would bidder provide copy of their on-site safety plan		yes	yes
4. Would bidder provide OSHA 200-300 log (up to 3 yrs.) (Y/N)		yes	yes
5. Bidder has a record of EPA violations within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no
Negative Factors:		0	-1
Form 5 - Debarment			
1. Has bidder been debarred/suspended from doing business with any govt. contracting agency within the last 3 years (Y/N)		no	no
Negative Factors:		0	0
Form 6 - Local Workforce			
1. What percentage of bidder's employees is drawn from Columbus, Franklin Co., or contiguous counties		0.0%	59.0%
Negative Factors:			
Form 7 - Health Care and Pension/Retirement Programs			
1. Bidder has health insurance? (Y/N)		yes	yes
2. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		union	ER: 100%
3. Bidder has retirement or pension plan? (Y/N)		yes	yes
4. If yes, percentage paid into plan:		union	ER: 100%
Negative Factors:		0	0
Form 8 - Apprenticeship Programs			
1. Bidder has bona-fide apprenticeship program? (Y/N)		yes	yes
Negative Factors:		0	0
Form 9 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - NON-SPECIALIZED			
Bidder has adequate qualified safety personnel (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has adequate non-specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes
Form 10 - Experience, Competency, and Resources - SPECIALIZED			
Bidder has adequate project management team (Y/N)		yes	yes
Bidder has adequate specialized equipment for project (Y/N)		yes	yes

Vendor Name:		Miller Cable	Complete General
Bid Tab Amount:		\$644,050.00	\$1,035,990.23
Form 11 - Deadlines and Cost Control			
	Bidder has met deadlines & controlled costs on similar construction projects (Y/N)	see comment	yes
Form 12 - Availability			
	Bidder does not have substantial uncompleted projects (Y/N)	yes	yes
Form 13 - Trade Licenses and Certificates			
	Bidder agrees to provide licensed workforce (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Will bidder engage subcontractors to comply w/licensing requirements (Y/N)	no	no
	License and/or Certificate No:	no license # listed	no license # listed
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Lowest Bid Dollar of non-environmental preferred bidder			
	Percent Over Low Bid:	65.18%	165.69%
	Fundamentally Equivalent Bid (I.e., within 10% of low bid)	no	no
Pg. 30 - Environmental Preference			
	Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	no	yes
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferred bidder (%)	65.2%	165.7%
	Difference versus lowest non-environmental preferred bidder (\$)	\$254,130.91	\$646,071.14
	Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest non-environmentally preferred bid.	no	no
	If awarded vendor is environmentally preferable, has Anita Musser been notified?		
Pgs. 31-34 - Statements and Affidavits			
Statement 1:	Bidder is current on City income taxes (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 2:	Non-Collusion has been initialed/dated (Y/N)	yes	yes
Statement 3:	Affiant Signature has been completed (Y/N)	yes	yes
Affidavit	Proposal Affidavit has been signed by affiant & notarized (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 40 - Addenda Acknlgmt.			
	Bidder has acknowledged any addendums issued on project (Y/N)	yes	yes
Proposal (Pg. 41) - Proposal Signature			
	Bidder has completed the Proposal Signature (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
Pg. 44 - Proposal Bond			
	Bidder has completed Proposal Bond including Surety name (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety Power of Attorney (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Surety's Financial Statement (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Bidder has attached Ohio Dept. of Insurance's Certificate of Compliance (Y/N)	yes	yes
	Negative Factors:	0	0
	Grand Total Negative Factors:	0	-1
Division's Recommendation:			
Additional Evaluation Questions for Non-Responsive Proposals per Section			
1)	Has the bidder submitted more than one proposal under the same name/subsidiary? (Y/N)	no	no
2)	Are the bid prices material unbalanced? (Y/N)	no	no
3)	Does the proposal contain conditions or qualifications not provided in the bid documents? (Y/N)	no	no
4)	Does the proposal respond to the bid documents in all material respects, and does not contain irregularities or deviations? (Y/N)	yes	yes
5)	Did the bidder add any provision reserving the right to accept or reject an award? (Y/N)	no	no
6)	Did bidder fail to submit a unit price for each Contract item listed? (Y/N)	no	no
7)	Did the bidder fail to submit a lump sum price where required? (Y/N)	no	no
	Negative Factors:	0	0