

#### **MEMORANDUM**

To:

Columbus City Council

From:

Steven R. Schoeny, Development Director

Date:

August 31, 2016

RE:

2016 Tax Incentive Review Council Recommendations

Office of the Director 50 West Gay Street Columbus, OH 43215-9040 (614) 645.7795 (614) 645.6675 [FAX]

Code Enforcement Division 757 Carolyn Avenue Columbus, OH 43224-3218 (614) 645.2202

(614) 645.6675 [FAX]

Economic Development Division 150 South Front Street, Suite 220 Columbus, OH 43215-4418 (614) 645.8616 (614) 645:6675 [FAX]

Housing Division 50 West Gay Street Columbus, OH 43215-9040 (614) 645.7795 (614) 645.6675 [FAX]

Planning Division 50 West Gay Street Columbus, OH 43215-9030 (614) 645.8664 (614) 645.6675 [FAX]

Land Redevelopment Office 50 West Gay Street Columbus, OH 43215-9030 (614) 645.5263 (614) 645.6675 [FAX] Ensuring that the City of Columbus receives jobs and investment in exchange for economic development investment is fundamental to what we do. In 2015 the City of Columbus received more than triple the number of jobs created and almost triple the increase in payroll associated with those jobs that was committed to under our Enterprise Zone (EZ) and Community Reinvestment Area (CRA) programs.

Our statistics are based on fifty-nine (59) Enterprise Zone and Community Reinvestment Area Agreements active during 2015. The Tax Incentive Review Council (TIRC) evaluated the compliance status of these Agreements in sessions held August 17, 2016, and as of the end of 2015, these fifty-nine (59) projects had:

- Created 5,335 jobs (301% of goal);
- Created \$336 million in new annual payroll (297% of goal);
- Retained 5,557 jobs (111% of goal); and
- Invested over \$890 million in real property improvements (127% of goal).

The TIRC has recommended as a result of its review that:

- Fifty-five (55) Agreements recommended to Continue, and of those fifty-five (55):
  - o Forty-nine (49) with no need for staff follow-up beyond standard reporting;
  - o Three (3) recommended to Amend;
  - Two (2) recommended to Amend or Dissolve (depending on staff followup);
  - One (1) recommended to Continue or Dissolve (depending on staff followup); and
- Four (4) Agreements have expired.

The detailed recommendations of the TIRC are attached.

The Development Department supports the recommendations of the TIRC and believes implementation will improve compliance for our portfolio of Agreements and will also preserve respect for the integrity of the City's tax incentive program.

Please note that ORC Section 5709.85 (E) provides that within sixty days after receipt of the TIRC recommendations, City Council shall vote to accept, reject, or modify all or any portion of the recommendations.

Quinten Harris, Deputy Director of Jobs & Economic Development, and I, are available to respond to any questions you may have.

# 2016 COLUMBUS TIRC SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS AUGUST 17, 2016

The Columbus Tax Incentive Review Council (TIRC) evaluated the compliance status of property tax related incentives – Enterprise Zone Agreements, Post-1994 Community Reinvestment Area Agreements, Pre-1994 Community Reinvestment Areas and Tax Increment Finance Districts – for Report Year 2015 in sessions held on August 17, 2016.

Ohio Revised Code Section 5709.85 (E): A legislative authority that receives from a tax incentive review council written recommendations under division (C)(1) or (D) of this section shall, within sixty days after receipt, hold a meeting and vote to accept, reject, or modify all or any portion of the recommendations. (See Addendum final page.)

### ENTERPRISE ZONE & POST-1994 COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT AREA AGREEMENTS

The TIRC made recommendations on a total of 59 Enterprise Zone and Post-1994 Community Reinvestment Area Agreements.

The breakdown by school district of these 59 Agreements is as follows: 41 Agreements in the Columbus City School District, 1 Agreement jointly within the Columbus & Gahanna Jefferson City School Districts, 3 Agreements within the Gahanna Jefferson City School District, 2 Agreements within the Groveport Madison Local School District, 7 Agreements in the Hilliard City School District, 2 Agreements in the Olentangy Local School District, 2 Agreements in the South-Western City School District, and 1 Agreement within the Worthington City School District.

Depending on the status of the compliance of each project as per the terms of the Agreement, each project was assigned to either the Consent Agenda or on one of two Review Agendas, Review Agenda A or Review Agenda B.

- 39 Agreements were assigned to the Consent Agenda with 36 recommended to be Continued, and 3 reported to have Expired.
- 20 Agreements were assigned to the Review Agenda with 10 agreements on Review Agenda A (non-compliant filing within timeframe but otherwise compliant) and 10 agreements on Review Agenda B (out of compliance and individually reviewed); for the 10 Review Agenda A agreements, 1 had expired at the end of 2015 and 9 were recommended to Continue and be sent letters stressing the importance of timely and accurate reporting; the 10 Review Agenda B agreements were individually reviewed with 4 agreements recommended to Continue, 2 agreements recommended to either Amend or Dissolve, 3 agreements recommended to Amend, and 1 agreement recommended to allow 60 days to become tax and reporting compliant or Dissolve the agreement.

### Consent Agenda Summary – 39 Agreements

36 Agreements on the Consent Agenda were recommended to Continue

Columbus City School District (CCSD): ADS Alliance Data Systems, Inc. & NRFC Easton Holdings, LLC; Broad & High CRI LP; Capital City Group, Inc.; Carr Supply, Inc.; Clarus Solutions, LLC & Clarus Partners, LLC; Coulter Properties LLC & Coulter Ventures, LLC dba Rogue Fitness; CSE Leasing dba Contract Sweepers & Equipment Company, Inc.; DSW Inc. & 4300 Venture 34910 LLC; FlightSafety International, Inc.; Gowdy Partners III LLC; Greater Linden Development Corporation & NLR Group Ltd.; Hirschvogel Incorporated #1; Hirschvogel Incorporated #2; Jai Guru, LLC; Liberty

Place, LLC; Menard, Inc.; Orange Barrel Media, LLC & OB Franklinton Development, LLC; R. W. Setterlin Building Company; SPARC Holdings, LLC; Time Warner Cable Midwest LLC; Tower 10, LLC; Town Square LP & Heartland Bank; UPH Holdings, LLC dba University Plaza Hotel (fka Plaza Core Hotel); and Whirlpool Corporation, et al.

Columbus & Gahanna Jefferson City School Districts (C&GJCSD): NetJets Inc. & Realty Income Properties 6 LLC.

Gahanna Jefferson City School District (GJCSD): AirSide One LLC and AirSide Two LLC. Groveport Madison Local School District (GMLSD): Cloverleaf Cold Storage Co. & CCS Realty Co. #1 and Cloverleaf Cold Storage Co. & CCS Realty Co. #2.

Hilliard City School District (HCSD): Allied Mineral Products, Inc.; Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc. and Affiliates #2; Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc. and Affiliates #3; Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc. #4; PEDC Property Management, Inc. & Midwest Motor Supply Co. (aka Kimball Midwest); and South-Western City School District (SWCSD): Crafts Americana Group, Inc. and MSC Industrial Direct Co., Inc. et al.

## 3 Agreements on the Consent Agenda were noted to have Expired in Good Standing

EMH&T and Wishbone Partners, LLC; Nationwide Arena LLC; (CCSD) and VNC Bearing, Inc. & VNAC Holdings Ltd. (HCSD).

## Review Agenda Summary - 20 Agreements (10 Review A / 10 Review B)

9 Agreements on Review Agenda A were collectively reviewed and recommended to Continue and to be sent letters stressing the importance of timely and accurate reporting

Columbus City School District (CCSD): 1179 E. Main Redevelopment, LLC & Columbus Compact Corporation; Columbus Equipment Company; Gowdy Partners II LLC; King Lincoln Gateway, LLC; Knightsbridge Olentangy, LLC; MORSO Holding Co.; Pizzuti Short North Office LLC and Wood Real Estate LLC & Wood Operating Co. Worthington City School District (WCSD): SEA, Ltd.

1 Agreement on Review Agenda A was reviewed and was noted to have Expired

Hilliard City School District (HCSD): Simpson Strong-Tie Co.

4 Agreements on Review Agenda B were individually reviewed and recommended to Continue

Columbus City School District (CCSD): Cassady Gateway Partners, LLC & Mid-Ohio Oncology/ Hematology, Inc. and V&S Columbus Galvanizing LLC, et al. Olentangy Local School District (OLSD): N.P. Limited Partnership and Polaris Medical Office Development, LLC.

6 Agreements on Review Agenda B were individually reviewed and recommended for staff follow-up or City Council Action (Review Agenda Action Items)

Columbus City School District (CCSD): Black Sapphire C Columbus University 2014 Inc. (fka Continental/Olentangy Hotel, LLC); E.W. High Street LLC & E.W. Hubbard High LLC; Fireproof Partners, LLC; McDaniel's Construction Corp., Inc. and Riverview Hotel, LLC. Gahanna-Jefferson City School District (GJCSD): Amamata, LLC.

## **REVIEW AGENDA ACTION ITEMS - TIRC RECOMMENDATIONS**

City Council may accept, reject or modify these TIRC recommendations within 60 days of September 1.

NOTE: New for Report Year 2015 annual reporting was the inclusion of additional Job & Payroll Report data, namely the categorization of each reported position as full-time or part-time and the hourly equivalent wage (City policy being to only incentivize full-time jobs paying at least \$12 per hour).

## 3 Agreements individually reviewed and recommended to AMEND

- Black Sapphire C Columbus University 2014 Inc. (fka Continental/Olentangy Hotel, LLC) (EZA 023-10-01: 75%/10-years: CCSD): Project Scope: \$13.6M investment in real property improvements and the creation of 15 full-time jobs (within three (3) years after the issuance of a certificate of occupancy, i.e. by 2014) with an annual payroll of approximately \$527,000 (\$16.89 average hourly wage - 6 @ \$12; 2 @ \$13.46; 1 @ \$15; 3 between \$15 & \$20; 2 between \$20 & \$30; 1 over \$30) related to the construction of a new 4-story limited service hotel with approximately 134 rooms, associated parking and landscaping amenities on Parcel 010-077863 at 1421-1437 Olentangy River Road; This project was on the Consent Agenda last year. SITUATION: For RY2015, Enterprise was impacted by the new reporting standards - initial reporting included 62 total employee records but after part-time and sub-\$12/hour jobs were removed only 7 eligible new jobs (created as a result of the project) remained. RECOMMENDATION: The TIRC found the Agreement to not be in compliance but recommended to CONTINUE, for City Staff to contact and meet with the hotel operator and local management to determine why the jobs as reported don't coincide with the jobs from the application and fact sheet (as per above) and to AMEND as needed to "right size" the project regarding jobs and payroll for current market conditions with those jobs being full-time that pay a minimum of \$12/hour.
- E.W. High Street LLC & E.W. Hubbard High LLC (CRA 049-18000-40 / 15-100; 100%/15-years; CCSD): Project Scope: \$7.2M investment in real property improvements and the creation of 30 full-time jobs and 196 part-time jobs, a total of 226 positions, 13% full-time and 87% part-time (by 2015) with a total annual payroll commitment of \$2.95M related to the ground floor commercial retail space and 322 space parking garage (referred to as the "Exempt Facility" in the Agreement) of a new mixed-use building (the other use being apartments on the upper floors) on Parcels 010-002013 (the Garage) and 010-292794 (1st Floor Retail) at the northeast corner of N. High St. and Hubbard Ave. within the Short North CRA; This project was on the Review Agenda last year and was recommended to Continue. SITUATION: For RY2015, Enterprise was impacted by the new reporting standards initial reporting included 114 total employee records across 6 separate tenants but after part-time and sub-\$12/hour jobs were removed only 2 eligible new jobs (created as a result of the project) remained. RECOMMENDATION: The TIRC found the Agreement to not be in compliance but recommended to CONTINUE, for City Staff to contact and meet with the owners and to AMEND as needed to "right size" the project regarding jobs and payroll for current market conditions with those jobs being full-time that pay a minimum of \$12/hour.
- Riverview Hotel, LLC (EZA 393-13-07; 75%/10-years; CCSD): Project Scope: \$13.4M investment in real property improvements and the creation of 14 full-time jobs (within three years after the completion of the Project, i.e. by 2016) with an estimated annual payroll of \$502,000 (\$17.24 average hourly wage 4 @ \$12; 1 @ \$12.50; 3 @ \$14; 3 between \$14 & \$20; 3 over \$20) related to the construction of a new 95,321 square foot Hampton Inn & Suites Hotel on Parcel 010-117361 at 3160 Olentangy River Road; This project was on the Consent Agenda last year. SITUATION: For RY2015, Enterprise was impacted by the new reporting standards initial reporting included 79 total employee records but after part-time and sub-\$12/hour jobs were removed only 5 eligible new jobs (created as a result of the project) remained. RECOMMENDATION: The TIRC found the Agreement to not be in compliance but recommended to CONTINUE, for City Staff to contact and meet with the hotel operator and management to determine why the jobs as reported don't coincide with the jobs from the application and fact

sheet (as per above) and to AMEND as needed to "right size" the project regarding jobs and payroll for current market conditions with those jobs being full-time that pay a minimum of \$12/hour.

## 2 Agreements individually reviewed and recommended to AMEND or DISSOLVE

- Fireproof Partners. LLC (CRA 049-18000-40 / 14-001; 50%/15-years; CCSD): Project Scope: \$11.3M total investment in real property improvements and the creation of 24 full-time jobs (by December 31.2016) with an annual payroll of \$1M (\$20.03 average hourly wage - 4 @ \$16.25; 8 @ \$18.56; 2 @ \$20; 1 @ \$21; 3 @ \$25; 6 between \$25 & \$28) related to the redevelopment of the vacant Fireproof building into a 5-story mixed use facility connected to five 4-story newly constructed mixed-use additions converting the property into one contiguous structure; the project as per the agreement involves the ground floor commercial retail space, new construction only, of the new mixed use building(s) (the other use being apartments on the upper floors) on Parcel 010-015325 at 1024 N. High St. within the Short North CRA; This project was on the Consent Agenda last year. SITUATION: For RY2015, Enterprise was impacted by the new reporting standards - initial reporting included 51 total employee records across 3 separate tenants but after part-time and sub-\$12/hour jobs were removed only 2 eligible new jobs (created as a result of the project) remained. RECOMMENDATION: The TIRC found the agreement to not be in compliance but recommended to CONTINUE, for City Staff to meet with owners and to (1) AMEND as needed to "right size" the project regarding jobs and payroll for current market conditions with those jobs being full-time that pay a minimum of \$12/hour or (2) to DISSOLVE the Agreement should ownership decide that the significant forgone tax benefit being received from the residential new construction and renovation portion of the overall project outweigh the ability to achieve and maintain job and payroll commitments - AMEND or DISSOLVE as needed (if amending, break out the investment goal for new commercial construction).
- McDaniel's Construction Corp., Inc. (EZA 000-15-X1; 75%/10-years; CCSD): Project Scope: \$1.1M investment in real property improvements, the creation of 2 full-time jobs (by 2017) with an annual payroll of \$90K (\$21.64 average hourly wage - 1 @ \$19.23 & 1 @ \$24.04) and the retention of 15 full-time jobs with an annual payroll of \$1.5M related to the construction of a new 10.000 square foot corporate headquarters on parcel 010-019804 at 1069 Woodland Avenue; This project is new to the portfolio this year. <u>SITUATION</u>: Per the agreement: "The project is expected to begin December 2014. All real property improvements expected to be completed by July 2015" (construction window)..."No real property exemption shall commence after 2016 nor extend beyond 2025" (abatement window). Enterprise missed the City and State reporting deadlines. Non-compliance notices were sent both before and after the State deadline. Telephone contact with Enterprise in July indicated that the Project had not yet gotten underway so the Project is out of compliance with the construction window which impacts the abatement window and the job creation window (as per the Agreement); incomplete annual reporting materials submitted in August prior to the TIRC. RECOMMENDATION: The TIRC found the agreement to not be in compliance but recommended to CONTINUE, for City Staff to meet with Enterprise to (A) determine revised construction, abatement and job creation windows for the project and AMEND the Agreement accordingly, or (B) if those parameters cannot be determined, DISSOLVE the Agreement.

## 1 Agreement individually reviewed and recommended to CONTINUE or DISSOLVE

• Amamata, LLC (EZA 023-12-04; GJCSD): Project Scope: \$3M investment in real property improvements and the creation of 40 new full-time jobs (within 3 years after execution of the agreement) with an annual payroll of \$1.4M (\$16.83 average hourly wage – 16 @ \$12.02; 7 @ \$12.72; 6 @ \$14.90; 4 @ \$20.19; 6 @ \$23.08 & 1 @ \$83.10) related to the renovation of a vacant commercial office building to result in just under 60K square feet of medical office space on parcel 520-121657 at 6400 E. Broad Street; This project was on the Review Agenda last year. SITUATION: The 2015 TIRC recommendation was to CONTINUE and amend the agreement to extend the construction window and the tax abatement application window (as unforeseen

complications had extended the construction timeframe). The City complied with the 2015 TIRC recommendation – Ordinance No. 2852-2015 was passed by Columbus City Council on November 23, 2015, authorizing that the Agreement be amended; the First Amendment to the Amamata, LLC Enterprise Zone Agreement was made and entered into effective January 15, 2016, amending the construction window to begin July 2013 and to be completed by December 31, 2015 and amending the tax abatement application window to not commencing after 2016 nor extending beyond 2025. Enterprise missed the City and State reporting deadlines. Noncompliance notices were sent both before and after the State deadline. In July City was advised by County Auditor that the parcel was tax delinquent (no payment of RY2015 taxes). Further contact attempted by email and by telephone. Incomplete annual reporting materials submitted in August the day before the TIRC. As of the TIRC, the tax delinquency amounted to \$154,667.42. <a href="RECOMMENDATION">RECOMMENDATION</a>: The TIRC recommended to CONTINUE and to send a letter to Enterprise advising of the tax delinquent status and the need to submit supplemental reporting materials; if the delinquent taxes are not paid and supplemental materials are not rec'd within 60 days of the receipt of the letter then DISSOLVE agreement.

## TAX INCREMENT FINANCE DISTRICTS, RESIDENTIAL & PRE-1994 COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT AREAS

The TIRC reviewed 68 Tax Increment Finance (TIF) Districts and 19 Residential & Pre-1994 Community Reinvestment Areas (CRAs) - 14 Residential Post-1994 CRAs, 3 Residential and Commercial Pre-1994 CRAs and 2 Pre-1994 Commercial CRAs

## **TIF Districts**

Prior to the TIRC review, in July 2016, the Franklin County Auditor's office provided a list of tax delinquent parcels to City staff.

Based on this notification, as of the TIRC reviews held on August 17, 442 parcels in 32 of the 68 TIF districts were reported to have tax delinquencies: 11 parcels in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Olentangy .40(B) TIF, 18 parcels in the AC Humko I .41 TIF, 26 parcels in the AC Humko II .40(C) TIF, 2 parcels in the Alum Creek-Watkins Rd. .40(C) TIF, 2 parcels in the Blauser-Summerlyn .40(C) TIF, 18 parcels in the Brewery District II .40(C) TIF, 2 in the Columbus Commons .41 TIF, 70 parcels in the Downtown Columbus .40(B) TIF; 19 parcels in the Hayden Run North .40(C) TIF, 15 parcels in the Hayden Run South .40(C) TIF, 62 parcels in the Italian Village (Jeffrey Place) .40(B) TIF, 2 parcels in the Jeffrey Place .41 TIF, 3 parcels in the Miranova .41 TIF, 23 parcels in the Morse Road .40(B) TIF, 6 parcels in the Nationwide Arena District .40 TIF, 9 parcels in the Nationwide Pen Site .41 TIF, 18 parcels in the Nationwide Pen West-East .40(B) TIF, 12 parcels in the Northeast Albany Crossing .40(C) TIF, 1 parcel in the Northeast New Albany West-Central College .40(C) TIF, 2 parcels in the Northeast Ulry-Central .40(C) TIF, 12 parcels in the Northeast Upper Albany West .40(C) TIF, 5 parcels in the Northland .41 TIF, 2 parcels in the Ohio Health .40(B) TIF, 27 parcels in the Rocky Fork .40(C) TIF, 42 parcels in the Short North .40(C) TIF, 2 parcels in the Easton .40 TIF, 1 in the East Broad Commercial Improvement .40(B) TIF, 7 in the East Broad Lucent Incentive .40(C) TIF, 1 parcel in the East Broad Lucent Commercial Improvement .40(B) TIF, 7 parcels in the Waggoner .40(C) TIF, 9 parcels in the Northeast Preserve .40(C) and 7 parcels in the East Broad: East Broad Dominion .40(C) TIF.

• The TIRC voted to accept the City's TIF report and found the City's TIFs to be in order.

#### Residential & Pre-1994 CRAs

Prior to the TIRC review, in July 2016, the Franklin County Auditor's Office provided City staff with CRA Status Reports for the City's Residential and Pre-1994 CRAs which included a listing of tax delinquent parcels within those CRAs to City.

As of the TIRC reviews held on August 17, 180 parcels in 9 of the 19 CRAs were reported to have tax delinquencies: 3 parcels in the Residential A (Linden) CRA, 3 in the Residential C (Southside) CRA, 7 parcels in the Residential F (Weinland Park) CRA, 1 parcel in the Residential G (Franklinton) CRA, 34 parcels in the Residential AC Humko Harrison Park CRA, 27 parcels in the Residential Near East NID CRA, 10 parcels in the Residential Short North CRA, 93 parcels in the Columbus Downtown CRA and 2 parcels in the Stelzer-Stygler CRA.

• The TIRC voted to accept the City's Residential and Pre-1994 CRA report and find the City's Residential and Pre-1994 CRAs in order provided that the City send letters to the delinquent property owners within the City's Residential and Pre-1994 CRAs.

### **ADDENDUM**

Ohio Revised Code Section 5709.85 (C)(1):

Annually, the tax incentive review council shall review all agreements granting exemptions from property taxation under Chapter 725. or 1728. or under section 3735.671, 5709.28, 5709.62, 5709.63, or 5709.632 of the Revised Code, and any performance or audit reports required to be submitted pursuant to those agreements. The review shall include agreements granting such exemptions that were entered into prior to July 22, 1994, that continue to be in force and applicable to the current year's property taxes.

With respect to each agreement, other than an agreement entered into under section 5709.28 of the Revised Code, the council shall determine whether the owner of the exempted property has complied with the agreement, and may take into consideration any fluctuations in the business cycle unique to the owner's business.

With respect to an agreement entered into under section 5709.28 of the Revised Code, the council shall consist of the members described in division (A)(2) of this section and shall determine whether the agreement complies with the requirements of section 5709.28 of the Revised Code and whether a withdrawal, removal, or conversion of land from an agricultural security area established under Chapter 931. of the Revised Code has occurred in a manner that makes the exempted property no longer eligible for the exemption.

On the basis of the determinations, on or before the first day of September of each year, the council shall submit to the legislative authority written recommendations for continuation, modification, or cancellation of each agreement.

Ohio Revised Code Section 5709.85 (D):

Annually, the tax incentive review council shall review the compliance of each recipient of a tax exemption under Chapter 725. or 1728. or section 3735.67, 5709.40, 5709.41, 5709.62, 5709.63, 5709.632, 5709.73, or 5709.78 of the Revised Code with the nondiscriminatory hiring policies developed by the county, township, or municipal corporation under section 5709.832 of the Revised Code. Upon the request of the council, the recipient shall provide the council any information necessary to perform its review. On the basis of its review, the council may submit to the legislative authority written recommendations for enhancing compliance with the nondiscriminatory hiring policies.

Ohio Revised Code Section 5709.85 (E):

A legislative authority that receives from a tax incentive review council written recommendations under division (C)(1) or (D) of this section shall, within sixty days after receipt, hold a meeting and vote to accept, reject, or modify all or any portion of the recommendations.

## ATTACHMENT A - COUNCIL MEMO SUMMARY TABLE COLUMBUS TAX INCENTIVE PROGRAM RY2015 PROJECT STATUS

				P	GREEN			JOB (	CREATI	ON			JOB	RETE	NTION	55	(or retention o	ROM JOB CREA in retained-only project gs on New or Future p	ts or	INVESTMENT IN REAL PROP				
C=2016 Consent Agenda	-			TYPE	Exemption Years (Italics if no filing as of 2016 TIRC)	Abatement # of Yrs/ Percent	Goal (Current roll-up year or overall; italics if roll-up)	Reported Jobs as of 12/31/15	Jobs Over or Under Goal N of July	Prior Years Actual Jobs (Dec. 31) AND 2016 MID-YEAR UFDATE #, IF ANY	Anticipated Date for Job Creation Goal to be Attained Date	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	Goal N of July	Reported Jobs Retained as of 12/31/15	Jobs Over or Under Goal	Prior Years Actual Jobs Dec. 31 – AND 2016 UPDATE #, IF ANY	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	Goal (Current roll-up) year or overall; italics if roll-up) Amur	Reported Payroll in 2015 (italies if construction payroll)	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15		Goal #	Reported Investment Attained as of 12/31/15 As reported by project	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15
	COL	UMBUS CITY SC	HOOL	DIST	RICT							4								8,5				
	1	Redevelopment, LLC & Columbus Compact Corporation / 023- 08-05	CCSD	EZ	2009-2018	10/75% Real	16	16	0	5.29 5.20, 20 5.70, 20 6.20, 20 7.20 7.20 Ne e.20	2013-16 2012-14 2011-12	100%	0	0 -	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012 2-3712 0 - 2011 8 - 2010 0 - 2009, 2008 Name in 2008	NA	\$ 319,000	\$ 262,166	82%	\$	2,130,000	\$ 2,460,256	116%
c	2	ADS Alliance Data Systems / 393-06- 01	CCSD	EZ	2008-2017	10/100% Real	54	945	891	706 - 20 3 265 - 20 2 205 - 20 2 200 - 20 1 185 - 20 0 173 - 20 0 75 - 20 0 0 - 20 0 Nove e 20 0	2009-54 2008-34 2007-16	1750%	529	529	0	529 - 2514, 2513, 2512, 2511, 2513 544 - 2509 529 - 2505, 2507 0 - 2505 Now in 2506	100%	\$ 2,740,000	\$ 80,795,815	2949%	\$	23,700,000	\$ 23,700,000	100%
	3	Black Sapphire C Columbus University 2014 Inc. (fka Contin/Olen Hotel) / 023-10-01	CCSD	EZ	2012-2021	10/75% Real	15	7	-8	35-2014, 2013 34-2012 30-2011 0-2010 New in 2010	2014-15 2013-10 2012-5	47%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012 10 - 2011 0 - 2010 New in 2010	NA NA	\$ 527,000	\$ 357,289	68%	\$	13,600,000	\$ 12,593,194	93%
c	4	Broad & High CRI LP / 023-05-07	ccsp		2009-2018	10/75% Real	2	3	1	4-304-309 8-309 9-301 6-300 0-300 2-300-307 0-306 here:305	2007 - 2 2006 - 0	150%	0	22	22	21 - 2014, 2013 51 - 2012 20 - 2011 21 - 2010 6 - 2009 15 - 2008	NA	\$50,000	\$ 151,910	304%		8,000,000	\$ 13,042,240	163%
		17020001	0000		2005 2010	rica		Ů		0 - 2014, 2013						444 4-20 9-20 10-20 10-20								
С		Capital City Group, Inc. / 023-08-04	CCSD	EZ	2009-2018	10/75% Real	0	0	0	2512, 2511, 2510, 2009 1 - 2008 New in 2008 7 - 2213 11 - 2512	NA 2013-7	0%	60	45	-15	444 6-20 9-20 9-20 9-20 8-20 8-20 8-20 16-20 16-20 16-20 16-20 60-20 9-20 16-2	75%	\$2,475,104	\$ 3,681,020	149%	\$	2,500,000	\$ 3,522,485	141%
c	6	Carr Supply, Inc. / 023-11-01	CCSD	EZ	2011-2017	7/65% Real	7	30	23	6-2011 New in 2011 56-2014 57-2013, 2012	2012-5 2011-2	429%	51	51	0	61-2011 New in 2011	100%	\$210,160	\$ 934,091	444%	\$	1,450,000	\$ 2,291,754	158%
	7	Cassady Gateway Partners LLC & Mid Ohio Oncology- Hernatology / 049- 18000-10 : 06-001	CCSD	CRA	2007-2016	10/50% Real	61	26	-35	52 - 2011 45 - 2010 36 - 2009 55 - 2005 54 - 2007 0 - 2006 New in 2006	AMEND 2013 61 New Jobs 2012-80 2011-68 2010-51 2000-34 2006-17	43%	130	130	0	133 - 2014 157 - 2013 153 - 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009 130 - 2006, 2007 0 - 2006 New in 2006	100%	\$ 3,927,241	\$ 1,201,287	31%	\$	21,900,000	\$ 23,216,576	106%
С	8 Future	Clarus Solutions, LLC & Clarus Partners, LLC	CCSD		2016-2025	10/75% Real	7	7	0	Now in 2014	2017-33 2016-17 2015-7	100%	39	39	0	New in 2014	100%	\$ 370,279	\$ 822,671	222%	\$	1,500,000	\$ 1,505,500	100%
	9 Future	Columbus Equipment Company / 023-13- 04 Coulter Properties	CCSD	EZ	2015-2024	10/75% Real	1	10	9	3 - 2014 0 - 2013 New in 2013	2017 - 2 2016 - 2 2015 - 1	1000%	74	74	0	75 - 2014 0 - 2013 New in 2013	100%	\$ 40,000	\$ 426,266	1066%	\$	2,000,000	\$ 1,603,725	80%
c	10 NEW	LLC & Coulter	CCSD	EZ	2017-2026	10/75% Real	0	0	0	New in 2515	2019-90 2018-60 2017-30	NA	0	0	0	New in 2014	NA	s -	\$ 143,057	NA	s	32,000,000	\$ 8,399,216	26%
C	11 NEW	Contract Sweepers	CCSD	EZ	2016-2025	10/75% Real	0	0	0	New in 2015	2019-3 2018-3 2017-2	NA	0	0	0	New in 2014	NA	s -	s 146,130	NA	\$	756,000	\$ 1,334,133	176%
c	12	DSW Inc. & 4300 Venture 34910 LLC				10/75%				497 - 2013 471 - 2012 321 - 2011 110 - 2010 1 - 2009 0 - 2008 97 - 2007 New in 2007	2010-75 2009-50					195 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009, 2008 0 - 2007	4001	\$ 4,500,000	20 750 500	00214	s	6,500,000	\$ 88,295,373	1358%
6	13	/ 023-07-03 Evans, Mechwart,	CCSD	EZ	2008-2017	Real	75	562	487	0 - 2010, 2009 38 - 8/08 0 - 2008	1/1/10-0 AMENO 2010 - No New, Total	749%	195	195	0	New in 2007 299 - 2013 332 - 2012 245 - 2011 245 - 2010 AMEND 2010 245 - 2009	100%	\$ 4,500,000	\$ 39,750,599	883%	3	6,300,000	\$ 60,293,370	1335 %
	Expire	Inc. and Wishbone Partners, LLC / 393- 05-01	ccsd	EZ	2006-2015	10/75% Real	0	0	0	38 - 2007 36 - 8/07 24 - 2006 42 - 2005 New in 2005	Only (235) 2008-85 2007-95 2006-39	NA	235	304	69	273 - 2008 329 - 2007 329 - 2006 329 - 2005 New in 2005	129%	\$ 18,270,000	\$ 29,676,122	162%	\$	10,000,000	\$ 14,565,000	146%
	14 Future		CCSD	CRA	2014-2028	15/100%	30	3	-27	11 - 2014 0 - 2013 New in 2013	2015 - 30 2014 - 0 2013 - 0	10%	0	6	6	10 - 2014 0 - 2013 New in 2013	NA	\$ 2,950,000	\$ 58,093	2%	\$	7,200,000	\$ 7,429,840	103%
	15 Future	Fireproof Partners, LLC / 049-18000-40 : 14-001	CCSD	CRA	2015-2029	15/50%	12	2	0	0 - 2014 New in 2014	2016 - 24 2015 - 12 2014 - 0	17%	0	5	5	0 - 2014 New in 2014	NA	\$ 527,540	\$ 2,973	1%	\$	11,300,000	\$ 1,338,730	12%
0	16 Future	FlightSafety International, Inc. / 023-14-02	CCSD	EZ	2015-2024	10/75%	6	19	13	5 - 2014 New in 2014 51 - 2514, 2513 55 - 2512 65 - 1712	2017 - 18 2016 - 13 2015 - 6	317%	137	137	0	137 - 2014 New in 2014 210 - 2014 204 - 2013 228 - 2012	100%	\$ 372,667	\$ 791,731	212%	\$	22,500,000	\$ 8,923,619	40%
	17	Gowdy Partners II LLC / 023-07-07	ccsd	EZ	2009-2018	10/75% Real	50	50	0	17 - 2011 40 - 2010 47 - 2000 0 - 2008 New in 2007	2011 - 50 2010 - 20 2009 - 0	100%	0	153	0	265-7/12 303-2011 288-2010 268-2009 0-2008	NA	\$ 1,750,000	\$ 2,788,511	159%	\$	9,500,000	\$ 23,544,323	248%
	18	Gowdy Partners III LLC / 023-09-04	CCSD	EZ	2011-2020	10/75% Real	33	59	26	34 - 2013 39 - 2012 46 - 2011 0 - 2019 0 - 2009 New in 2009	2013 - 33 2012 - 18 2011 - 8	179%	100	100	0	194 - 2013 195 - 2012 164 - 2011 0 - 2010 New in 2009	100%	\$ 2,870,000	\$ 2,769,723	97%	\$	20,000,000	\$ 27,966,732	140%
(	19	Greater Linden Development Corporation & NLR Group LTD / 023-00 03	6	EZ	2007-2016	10/75% 6 Real	5	7	2	7 - 2013, 2012, 2011 6 - 2010 9 - 2011 9 - 2009 4 - 2005, 2007 1 - 2006 he s c 2006	2008-5 2007-5 2006-5	140%	0	19	19	18 - 2012 18 - 2011 21 - 2010 25 - 2009 24 - 2008 23 - 2007 0 - 2006 New in 2006	NA	\$ 125,000	\$ 89,697	72%	s	2,500,000	\$ 3,144,271	126%
	20	Hirschvogel Inc. #1				10/75%				155 - 2013 123 - 2012 91 - 2011 51 - 2010 15 - 2009 40 - 2008 75 - 2007 44 - 2006 40 - 2005	2008-46 2007-46				9	134 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009, 2008, 2007, 2006, 2005								
	. 21 NEV	/ 023-05-04	ccsp		2018-2027 /(9/15-	6 Real	46	180	134	New in 2005	2006-30 2020-37 2019-24	391%	134	134	0	New in 2005	100%	\$ 1,600,000		532% NA	\$	1,500,000	\$ 2,978,398	199% NA
,	HEV	V / 1000-15-X3  Jai Guru, LLC / 023	CCSD		12/17) 2017-2026 / (10/14- 12/16)	10/75%	0	0	0	0 - 2014 Nice in 2014	2018-12 2019-5 2018-5 2017-5	NA NA	0	0	0	Now in 2014 0 - 2014 Now in 2014	NA NA	\$	\$ 747,966		\$	8,500,000		
L	-	1,401	10000	115	any	1 10108	1 1	1 0	, ,	1				, ,	, ,	•			,		. 1			

## ATTACHMENT A - COUNCIL MEMO SUMMARY TABLE COLUMBUS TAX INCENTIVE PROGRAM RY2015 PROJECT STATUS

			F	AGREEM	ENT	JOB CREATION							JOB	RETE	итіой		PAYROLL FROM JOB CREATION (or retention on retained-only projects or construction waags on New or Fature projects).					INVESTMENT IN REAL PROP			
C=2016 Consent Agenda				TYPE	Exemption Years (Italics if no filing as of 2016 TIRC)	Abatement # of Yrs/ Percent	Goal (Current roll-up) year or overall; italics if roll-up)	Reported Jobs as of 12/31/15 N of Jacs	Jobs Over or Under Goal	Prior Years Actual Jobs (Dec. 31) AND 2015 MID-YEAR UPDATE #, IF ANY	Anticipated Date for Job Creation Goal to be Attained One	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	Goal N of Julie	Reported Jobs Retained as of 12/31/15	Jobs Over or Under Goal	Prior Years Actual Jobs Dec. 31 – AND 2016 UPDATE#, IF ANY	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	(Current	Goal roll-up year or allies if roll-up)	Reported Payroll in 2015 (Italics if construction payrol)	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15		Goal 1	Reported Investment Attained as of 1273115 As reported by project	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15
	23	King Lincoln Gateway, LLC / 023- 05-10	CCSD	EZ	2007-2016	10/75% Real	3	5	2	9 - 2014 2 - 2013, 2012 2-7/12 2 - 2011 4 - 2010 0 - 2009 3 - 2007 0 - 2006, 2005 New in 2005	2009-3 2008-2 2007-1	167%	0	57	57	62 - 2014 18 - 2013 61 - 2012 67-7/12 67 - 2011 59 - 2010 79 - 8/19 15 - 2009 0 - 2008	NA	\$	62,400	\$ 112,130	180%	s	6,200,000	\$ 5,192,591	84%
	24	Knightsbridge Olentangy, LLC / 023-12-05	CCSD	EZ	2014-2023	10/75% Real	0	4	4	4 - 2014, 2013 0 - 2012 New in 2012	2015-2 2014-1	0%	Ö	74	0	85 - 2014, 2013 0 - 2012 New in 2012	NA	s	56,160	\$ 286,086	509%	\$	3,000,000	\$ 3,897,062	130%
с	25	Liberty Place LLC / 023-04-08	CCSD	EZ	2007-2016	10/75% Real	4	6	2	9-2514 8-2013 4-2012 5-2011, 2010 1-2009 1-2008 4-2007, 2006 3-2005 0-2004	2009-4 2008-0 2007-0 2006-0	150%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009 5 - 2008 0 - 2007	NA	\$	102,500	\$ 236,883	231%	\$	14,200,000	\$ 18,036,393	127%
	26 NEW	McDaniel's Construction Corp., Inc. / 000-15-X1	CCSD	EZ	2016-2025 /(12/14- 7/15)	10/75%	0	0	0	New in 2015	2018-2 2017-2 2015-1	NA	0	0	0	New in 2015	NA	s		s -	NA	\$		s -	NA
с	27	Menard, Inc. / 023- 10-06	ccsd		2011-2020	10/75% Real	49	42	-7	49 - 2013 51 - 2012 49-7/12 52 - 2011 0 - 2010 New in 2010	Amend to 49 in 2012 2011- 60	86%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011 New in 2010	NA	\$	1,750,000	\$ 2,019,578	115%	\$	6,500,000	\$ 7,846,098	121%
	28 Future	MORSO Holding Co. / 049-18000-15 / 08-001	CCSD	CRA	2003-2042 / (X/03- 12/32)	10/100% Real	200	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2008, 2008 New in 2008	23 - 200 (+ 22 3800 21 3800 (+ 32 3800 25 220 (+ 23 3800 27 2800 (+ 22 280 25 2800 (+ 22 280 25 2800 (+ 22 280 25 1800 (+ 22 1800 25 1800 (+ 22 1800 15 1800 (+ 25 1800 15 2800 (+ 15 4800 15 2800 (+ 15 4800 15 2800 (+ 15 4800	0%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009, 2008 New in 2008	NA	s	_	\$ 2,518,940	0%		47,833,331	\$ 54,879,000	115%
с	29 Expire	Nationwide Arena LLC / 049-00960-04 / 98-001	COL	CRA	1999-2015	15/100% // 1/90% // 1/96.5% Real	115	1,702	1,587	151-201 1-55-202 1-55-202 1-55-202 1-55-203 1-55	10/31/00	1480%	0	0	0	NA.	NA	\$	14,980,000	\$ 73,906,168	493%	s	120,000,000	\$ 166,948,591	139%
с	30 Future	Orange Barrel Media, LLC & OB Franklinton Development, LLC / 023-13-05	CCSD	EZ	2015-2024	10/75% - Real	4	3	-1	9-254 3-259 New n 253	2017 - 12 2016 - 8 2015 - 4	75%	18	18	0	8-24-20 tere20	100%	s	250,000	\$ 399,393	160%	\$	2,200,000	\$ 3,975,000	181%
	31 Future	Pizzuti Short North Office LLC / 023-13- 01	CCSD	EZ	2015-2024	10/75% Real	110	22	-88	0-24-20 here20	2017 - 217 2016 - 217 2015 - 110	20%	0	86	86	0-204.200 New 0:200	NA	s	6,741,935	\$ 893,078	13%	\$	20,600,000	\$ 15,435,530	75%
	32 Future	Riverview Hotel, LLC / 393-13-07	CCSD	EZ	2014-2023	10/75% Real	14	5	-9	27-354 0-250 News259 6-2013	2016 - 14 2015 - 14 2014 - 14	36%	0	4	4	11-254 3-259 New n 259 29-2514, 2513	NA	s	502,000	\$ 121,320	24%	\$	13,370,000	\$ 13,592,894	102%
С	33	RW Setterlin Building Co. / 023- 08-01	CCSD	EZ	2009-2018	10/75% Real	0	5	5	3 - 2512 5 - 2511 0 - 2510 1 - 2500 0 - 2505 New in 2508	NA 2021-20	NA	20	20	0	2012 16 - 2011 19 - 2010 25 - 2009 20 - 2008 New in 2008	100%	\$	1,400,000	\$ 1,700,549	121%	\$	1,200,000	\$ 1,860,000	155%
С	34 Future	SPARC Holdings, LLC / 023-12-02	CCSD	EZ	/ (09/18- 09/23)	10/75%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012 New in 2012 225 - 2013	2020-10 2019-5	NA	0	0	0_	0 - 2004, 2013, 2012 New in 2012 2013, 2012	NA	\$		\$ 2,682	NA	\$	12,000,000	\$ 4,059,060	34%
c	35	Time Warner Cable Midwest LLC / 023- 06-04	CCSD	EZ	2008-2017	10/75% Real	153	497	344	299 - 2512 227 - 2511 211 - 2510 235 - 2009 240 - 2008	2010-153 2009-125 2008-61	325%	450	450	0	2011, 2010, 2009 556 - 2008 450 - 2007 New in 2005	100%	\$	6,119,360	\$ 14,854,737	243%	\$	19,000,000	\$ 39,376,240	207%
С	36 Future	Tower 10, LLC / 023-12-08	CCSD	EZ	2017-2026 / (09/12- 10/16) 2014-2020 (Heartland	10/75% Real	0	0	0	0-X4-X0	2019 - 4 2018 - 3 2017 - 1	NA	0	0	0	0-214,20 tern20	NA	\$	•	\$ 675,508	NA	\$	13,000,000	\$ 11,745,546	90%
С	37 Future	& Heartland Bank / 023-13-02	ccsD	EZ	Parcel) 2015-2024 / (7/13- 7/14)	10/75% Real	1	4	3	2 - X14 0 - X10 New e X10	2017 - 2 2016 - 2 2015 - 1	400%	0	4	0	7.29 0.29 texa20	NA	S	40,000	\$ 92,443	231%	\$	930,000	\$ 604,073	65%
c	38 Future	UPH Holdings, LLC dba University Plaza Hotel (fka Plaza Core Hotel LLC) / 393-13-08	ccsp	EZ	2019-2028 / (01/16- 12/18)	10/75%	0	0	0	0-24-20 Nexa20	2020 - 15 2019 - 15 2018 - 15	NA	0	0	0	0-254 34-253 New n253	NA	\$		\$ 480,189	NA	\$	20,440,000	\$ 3,580,420	18%
	39	V&S Columbus Galvanizing, LLC et al / 023-12-03	CCSD	EZ	2014-2023	10/75%	4	1	-3	8-816 3-2014 0-2013, 2012 New in 2012	2015-4 2014-3 2013-2	25%	74	74	0	74 - 2014 73 - 2013 74 - 2012 New in 2012	100%	\$	120,000	\$ 64,178	53%	s	6,400,000	\$ 7,399,000	116%
c	40	Whirlpool Corporation, Penske			A 2009-2023		200	211	11	207 - 2014 100 - 2013 95 - 2012 108 - 2011 100 - 2010 124 - 2009 70 - 2008 New in 2008	2513 - 200 2512 - 150 2611 - 160 Amending 2510 2613 - 261 2612 - 265 2611 - 269 2610 - 259	106%	0	0	0	10 - 2014 0 - 2010 brough 2013 70 - 2009 New in 2008	NA	s	5,609,426	\$ 5,888,982	105%	s	i 46,200,000	\$ 62,297,745	135%
	41 Totals	Wood Real Estate, LLC & Wood Operating Co. / 023 10-03			2014-2023	10/75%	3 1,280	4	1 3,367	2 - 2013 5 - 2012 0 - 2011 0 - 2010 New in 2010	2014-3 2013-2 2012-0	133%	12 2,258	12	0 253	15 - 2013 11 - 2512 12 - 2011 12 - 2013 Nice in 2013	100%	s	111,300 81,469,071			s			

## ATTACHMENT A - COUNCIL MEMO SUMMARY TABLE COLUMBUS TAX INCENTIVE PROGRAM RY2015 PROJECT STATUS

	AGREEMENT					JOB (	CREATI	ON			JOB	RETE	NTION			ROM JOB CRE		INVESTMENT IN REAL PROP					
chand durant Associate			TYPE	Exemption Years (Italics if no filing as of 2016 TIRC)	Abatement # of Yrs/ Percent	Goal (Current roll-up year or overall; italics if roll-up)	Reported Jobs as of 12/31/15	Jobs Over or Under Goal	Prior Years Actual Jobs (Dec. 31) AND 2016 MD-YEAR UPDATE #, IF ANY	Anticipated Date for Job Creation Goal to be Attained Care	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	Goal N of John	Reported Jobs Retained as of 12/31/15	Jobs Over or Under Goal	Prior Years Actual Jobs Dec. 31 – AND 2016 UPDATE#, IF ATTY	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15	Goal (Current roll-up year o overall, italics if roll-up	Reported Payroll in 2015 (Italics if construction ) payroll	Percent of Goal Attained as of 12/31/15		oal s	Reported Investment Attained as of 12/31/15 As reported by project	Percent of Goal
_	HIL	LIARD CITY SCHOOL D	ISTRI	ст														3.					
•	C 1 Fabre	Allied Mineral Products, Inc. / 023- 13-03 HCSD	EZ	2017-2026 1 (7/13- 7/16)	10/75% Real	0	0	0	0-254 Neve 250 85-2013	2019-58 2018-19 2017-2	NA	0	0	0	tave 20 945-2013	NA	s -	\$ 1,029,719	NA	\$	7,000,000	\$ 9,113,445	130%
,	2	Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane Inc. (#2) / 023-03- 01 HCSD	EZ	2007-2016	10/75% Real	95	62	-33	71-2012 67-2011 64-2010 61-2009 64-2008 76-2007 81-06/50-05	2008-95 2007-51 2006-19	65%	803	803	0	1,172 - 2012 829 - 2011 816 - 2010 871 - 2009 803 - 2008 803 - 2007 900-867800-65	100%	\$ 1,600,000	\$ 3,237,520	202%	\$ 1	0,000,000	\$ 16,557,164	166%
	3	Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane Inc. (#3) / 023-09- 03 HCSD Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane	EZ	2015-2029	15/100% Real	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2011, 2012, 2011, 2010 Now in 2009	0	NA	145	145	0	1,243 - 2012 1,129 - 2011 900 - 2010 902 - 2009 New in 2009	100%	\$ 10,094,937	\$ 9,686,278	96%	\$	1,800,000	\$ 42,799,216	2378%
F	C 5	e Inc. (#4) / 023-12- 06 HCSD PEDC Property Mgt. & Midwest Motor Supply / 000-		2015-2024	10/100% Real	184	370	186	24 - 254 - 259 fee n 259 0 - 2514 New in 2514	2017-240 2016-216 2015-184 2017-60 2016-40 2015-20	201%	60	60	0	60 - 2513 New in 2512 0 - 2514 New in 2514	100%	\$ 7,900,000 \$ 749,600		189%		8,000,000 7,800,000	\$ 9,953,857 \$ 8,429,169	
	6 Expir	e Simpson Strong-Tie	EZ	2006-2015 Real	10/75% Real	0	0	0	0.0] 8 - 3764 0 - 2008 7 - 2007 23 - 8/07 9-06 9/ 13-05 New in 2005	2011-122 AMEND 2011 - No New, Total Only 2008-6 2007-4 2006-2	NA NA	122	144	22	134 - 2013 121 - 2012 123 - 2011 112 - 2010 122 - 3711 112 - 2009 127 - 7709	118%	\$ 5,080,000		205%		6,500,000	\$ 10,860,588	
	C 7 Expir	VNAC Holdings Ltd. / 023-07-05 HCSD	EZ	2010-2015	7/65% Real	21	22	1 172	42 - 2013 18 - 2012 9 - 2011 13 - 1019 - 00 15 - 708 0 - 0015 - 17 Now in 2007	2010-21 2009-6 2008-3	105%	7	36	29	25 - 2013 55 - 2012 57 - 2011 17-10/13-09 7 - 200 7 -	514%	\$ 137,000	\$ 680,719	497%		2,500,000 53,600,000	\$ 3,533,122 \$ 101,246,56	2 141%
Г	Totals 320 499 179 155% 1,423 1,474 51 104% \$ 25,561,537 \$ 40,553,444 160% \$ 53,600,000 \$ 101,248,562 15975  OLENTANGY LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT																						
,	1 NEV	00960-06/15-001 OLSD Polaris Medical Office Development, LLC / 393-10-07 OLSD		2026-2035		0 21	0 24	03	New in 2515 25 - 2014 38 - 2013 32 - 2012 0 - 2011, 2010 New in 2510	2020-708 2019-564 2018-423 2017-282 2016-141 2014-21 2013-16 2012-10	NA 114%	0	0 19	0	Nine in 2015 13 - 2014 23 - 2013 22 - 2013 0 - 2011, 2010 New in 2010	NA NA	\$ 1,029,000 \$ 1,029,00		NA 75%	\$	8,250,000 8,250,000		
	Total	S LUMBUS CITY SCHOOL	L DIST	RICT AN	D GAHAN	21 INA JEFI	24 FERSO	N CITY S	SCHOOL	DISTRICT	114%	0	19	19		0%	1,029,00	, , ,,,,,,	1574		8,230,000	0.047,73	
	C 1	NetJets Inc. & Realty Income Properties 6 LLC / CCSD 023-08-07 GJSD		2012-2021	10/75%	19	205	186	# 20 # 20 # 20 # 20 # 20 # 20 # 20 # 20	2013-19 2012-18 2011-9	1079%	1,306	1,306 1,306	0	1,306 - 2014, 2013, 2012, 2011 New in 2010	100%	\$ 1,459,533 \$ 1,459,53		589% 589%	\$ 1	5,000,000 15,000,000	\$ 20,536,880 \$ 20,536,88	
-	GA C 1 Full C 1 NE	AirSide Two LLC / G ICS	EZ	2015-2024 / (04/14- 07/15) 2017-2026 / (10/15- 10/16)	10/75%	0	0	0	0.234 No.024	2018-10 2017-6 2016-3 2019-10 2018-6 2017-3	NA NA	0	0	0	0 - 2014 New in 2014	NA NA	s	- \$ 121,417 - \$ 122,484	NA NA		6,000,000	\$ 6,460,700 \$ 1,764,02	
	2 Futu Tota	Arnamata LLC / 023- GJCS 12-04	EZ	2016-2025 / (07/12- 12/15)	10/75%	0	0	0	0-24.20 20 te-e20	2018-40 2017-20 2015-2	NA 0%	0	0	0	0 - 2014, 2013, 2012 New in 2012	-137	S	- \$ - - \$ 243,901	NA		3,000,000	s	- 0%
	C 1	Realty Co. #1 / 023- 08-06 GM	EZ			25	26	1	23 - 2013 12 - 2012 25 7m3 25 7m2 15 - 2011 20 - 2019 10 - 2009 New in 2009	2011-25 2010-10 2009-5	104%	4	4	0	4-2014, 2013, 2012, 2011, 2010, 2009 New in 2009	100%	\$ 642,00	\$ 896,805	140%	s	4,000,000	\$ 5,238,85	7 131%
	C Futu	re Realty Co. #2 / 023- 13-06 GM	EZ	2017-2026 / (06/16- 12/16)	10/75%	0 25	0 26	0	0 - 2014, 2013 Nice in 2013	2019-2 2018-2 2017-1	NA 104%	0	0	0	0 - 2514, 2513 Now in 2513	NA 100%	\$ 642.0	- \$ - 0 896,800	NA 140%	\$	4,000,000	\$ 97,92 5,336,7	
Γ	sc	OUTH-WESTERN CITY S	CHOC	OL DISTR	icT				22 - 2013 1 - 2012 13 - 2011				2		15-2014 12-2013 15-2012, 2011,								
	C 1	Crafts Americana Group, Inc. / 023-05 09	EZ	2008-2017	10/75% Real	9	31	22	13 - 2211 10 - 2510 9 - 2009 3 - 2008 4 - 2007 0 - 2008 NEW in 2008	2010-9 2009-6 2008-3 2019-300	344%	12	12	0_	2019 16 - 2009 22 - 2008 14 - 2007 6 - 2006 NEW in 2006	100%	\$ 300,54	\$ 653,744	218%	s	2,400,000	\$ 2,572,88	4 107%
	C Fun.	/ 023-12-07 SW		2015-2024 /(12/12- 06/13)		100	113	13 35	127 - 2514 0 - 2513, 2512 N∈W in 2512	2018 - 250 2017-200 2016-150 2015-100	113%	0 12	0 12	0	0-2014, 2013, 201 NEW in 2012	NA 100%	\$ 2,766,66 \$ 3,067,20		152% 158%	\$ 2	27,500,000		
[	1 Futa	ure 01 WCSI	EZ	2017-2026 /(12/14- 03/16)	10/75%	0	0 0	0	9-2514, 2513 New in 2513	2018-18 2017-10 2016-5	NA 0%	0	0 0	0	9-2514, 2513 New in 2513	NA 0%		- \$ 1,080,718 0 1,080,71	0%	\$	9,000,000	\$ 11,200,60	09 0%
	GF	RAND TOTAL (all school dist	trict are	as)		1,774	5,335	3,771			301%	5,003	5,557			111%	113,228,348	335,968,700	297%	700,	859,331	890,384,594	127%