# Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations Effective January 1, 2015

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code section 329 as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Here is a link to City Code <u>Columbus City Code</u>

- 2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.
- 3. If you have questions about using the spreadsheet, contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.
- 4. If you print the workbook in its entirety from the print screen as opposed to printing each worksheet separately ("active sheets"), you will print this page and the evaluation will begin on page 2 and go through page 13. If you print each workbook separately, the page numbering is different.

| PROJECT:             | LOCKBOURNE INTERM | Bid Date:      | November 30, 2016 |                     |
|----------------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities  | Initial Appare | nt Low Bidder:    | Michels Tunneling   |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains | Initial Appar  | ent Low Bid :     | \$<br>40,535,000.00 |

|                      | Bids from Apparent lowest to highest: | Apparent Low       | 2nd                | 3rd                | 4th                | 5th                | 6th                 |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| CIP No.              | 650491-100002                         | COMPANY NAME        |
|                      |                                       |                    | Ward & Burke       | Southland          | Super Excavators,  | Vadnais Trenchless |                     |
| Project Manager:     | Jeremy Cawley                         | Michels Tunneling  | Tunneling, Inc.    | Contracting, Inc.  | Inc.               | Services           | James W. Fowler Co. |
| Engineer's Estimate: | \$ 65,687,892.00                      | Initial Bid Amount  |
|                      |                                       | \$ 40,535,000.00   | \$ 46,125,150.00   | \$ 61,750,704.00   | \$ 62,776,000.00   | \$ 74,724,500.00   | \$ 79,750,000.00    |
|                      |                                       | 13.79%             | 33.88%             | 1.66%              | 19.03%             | 6.73%              |                     |

| PART IA: F | Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)  | INPUT "YES" F | OR POSITIVE RESPONS | E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT | IVE RESPONSE (all "yes | s" answers needed for | responsive bid) |
|------------|---|---------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| a          | The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)   | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
| b          | The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>  | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
| С          | The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b> | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
| d          | If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)   | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
| е          | Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit  | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
| f          | There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)   | YES           | YES                 | YES                 | YES                    | YES                   | YES             |
|            | BID IS:   | RESPONSIVE    | RESPONSIVE          | RESPONSIVE          | RESPONSIVE             | RESPONSIVE            | RESPONSIVE      |

| PROJECT:             | LOCKBOURNE INTERM | ODAL SUBTRUNK PROJECT | Bid Date:      | November 30, 2016   |
|----------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|----------------|---------------------|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities  | Initial Appare        | nt Low Bidder: | Michels Tunneling   |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains | Initial Appar         | ent Low Bid :  | \$<br>40,535,000.00 |

|            |   | Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:  | Apparent Low       | 2nd                             | 3rd                            | 4th                    | 5th                            | 6th                 |
|------------|---|--|--------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|
| CIP No.    |   | 650491-100002  | COMPANY NAME       | COMPANY NAME                    | COMPANY NAME                   | COMPANY NAME           | COMPANY NAME                   | COMPANY NAME        |
| Project Ma | anager:   | Jeremy Cawley  | Michels Tunneling  | Ward & Burke<br>Tunneling, Inc. | Southland<br>Contracting, Inc. | Super Excavators, Inc. | Vadnais Trenchless<br>Services | James W. Fowler Co. |
| Engineer's | s Estimate:   | \$ 65,687,892.00   | Initial Bid Amount | Initial Bid Amount              | Initial Bid Amount             | Initial Bid Amount     | Initial Bid Amount             | Initial Bid Amount  |
|            |   |  | \$ 40,535,000.00   | \$ 46,125,150.00                | \$ 61,750,704.00               | \$ 62,776,000.00       | \$ 74,724,500.00               | \$ 79,750,000.00    |
| PART IB: R | esponsiveness Cri   | teria, Subcontractors (329.20)   | INPUT "YES" FO     | OR POSITIVE RESPONS             | E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT            | IVE RESPONSE (all "yes | s" answers needed for          | responsive bid)     |
| а          |   | d a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)  | YES                | YES                             | NA                             | YES                    | YES                            | YES                 |
| b          | licensed construction   | e listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors are in trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM B5</b> de subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")                                    | YES                | YES                             | NA                             | YES                    | YES                            | YES                 |
| С          | qualified responsibl  | ocontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre-<br>e or provisionally responsible licensed trade<br>9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are                                 | NA                 | NA                              | NA                             | YES                    | NA                             | YES                 |
| d          | work under which the  | e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of<br>ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no<br>listed, enter "NA") FORM B5  | YES                | YES                             | NA                             | YES                    | YES                            | YES                 |
| e          | subcontractor per d<br>more than one sub<br>(329.20)(h)(5) (If n<br>"NA") FORM B5 | e listed and the bidder listed more than one ivision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter | NA                 | NA                              | NA                             | NA                     | NA                             | YES                 |
| f          | trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2   | affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction<br>s are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally<br>0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade<br>e listed, enter "NA")                      | NA                 | NA                              | NA                             | YES                    | NA                             | YES                 |
|            |   | subcontractors who were currently suspended or (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)   | YES                | YES                             | YES                            | YES                    | YES                            | YES                 |
|            |   | BID IS:  | RESPONSIVE         | RESPONSIVE                      | RESPONSIVE                     | RESPONSIVE             | RESPONSIVE                     | RESPONSIVE          |

| PROJECT:             | LOCKBOURNE INTERM | LOCKBOURNE INTERMODAL SUBTRUNK PROJECT |                |    | November 30, 2016 |
|----------------------|-------------------|--|----------------|----|-------------------|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities  | Initial Apparei                        | nt Low Bidder: |    | Michels Tunneling |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains | Initial Appare                         | ent Low Bid :  | \$ | 40,535,000.00     |

|                        | Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:   | Apparent Low                         | 2nd   | 3rd   | 4th  | 5th  | 6th                                    |
|------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|--|--|
| CIP No.                | 650491-100002   | COMPANY NAME                         | COMPANY NAME  | COMPANY NAME  | COMPANY NAME                                 | COMPANY NAME   | COMPANY NAME                           |
| Project M<br>Engineer' | Janager: Jeremy Cawley 's Estimate: \$ 65,687,892.00  | Michels Tunneling Initial Bid Amount | Ward & Burke<br>Tunneling, Inc.<br>Initial Bid Amount | Southland Contracting, Inc. Initial Bid Amount \$ 61.750.704.00 | Super Excavators,<br>Inc. Initial Bid Amount | Vadnais Trenchless<br>Services<br>Initial Bid Amount<br>\$ 74.724.500.00 | James W. Fowler Co. Initial Bid Amount |
|                        |   | \$ 40,535,000.00                     | <del>+ 10/220/2000</del>                              | <del>+</del>  | <del>+ 02</del> /110/00000                   | ¥ 7 1/12 1/000100  | 7 7377 307000100                       |
| a a                    | Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)  Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a) | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | " answers needed for r   | YES                                    |
| b                      | Bidder acknowledged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)  | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| С                      | Bidder <b>complied</b> with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)                                   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| d                      | The bid <b>contains</b> no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(f)(1)(d)   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| е                      | Bidder added <b>no</b> provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)  | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| f                      | Bidder submitted a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| g                      | Bidder did not submit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| h                      | Bid prices are materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| i                      | Bid contains <b>no</b> irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)                                      | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| j                      | Bidder submitted a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")                    | NA                                   | NA  | NA  | NA   | NA   | NA                                     |
| k                      | Bidder submitted a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) FORM B3 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")   | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| I                      | Bidder has complied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5  | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| m                      | Bid <b>does not</b> contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it <b>does</b> respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)                                  | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |
| n                      | Bid <b>responds</b> to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)  | YES                                  | YES   | YES   | YES  | YES  | YES                                    |

| PROJECT:             | LOCKBOURNE INTERM | Bid Date:       | November 30, 2016 |                     |
|----------------------|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities  | Initial Apparei | nt Low Bidder:    | Michels Tunneling   |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains | Initial Appare  | ent Low Bid :     | \$<br>40,535,000.00 |

|            |                      | Bids from Appar | ent lowest to highest: |      | Apparent Low     | 2nd                             |    | 3rd                            |         | 4th              |                                | 5th            |      | 6th               |
|------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------------|------|------------------|---------------------------------|----|--------------------------------|---------|------------------|--------------------------------|----------------|------|-------------------|
| CIP No.    |                      | 650491-100002   |                        | CC   | OMPANY NAME      | COMPANY NAME                    | С  | OMPANY NAME                    | COMP    | PANY NAME        | CO                             | MPANY NAME     | CC   | OMPANY NAME       |
| Project Ma | anager:              | Jeremy Cawley   |                        | Mi   | ichels Tunneling | Ward & Burke<br>Tunneling, Inc. | C  | Southland<br>Contracting, Inc. | Super   | Excavators, Inc. | Vadnais Trenchless<br>Services |                | Jam  | ies W. Fowler Co. |
| Engineer's | s Estimate:          | \$              | 65,687,892.00          | Init | tial Bid Amount  | Initial Bid Amount              | In | nitial Bid Amount              | Initial | Bid Amount       | Init                           | ial Bid Amount | Init | tial Bid Amount   |
|            |                      |                 |                        | \$   | 40,535,000.00    | \$ 46,125,150.00                | \$ | 61,750,704.00                  | \$ 6    | 2,776,000.00     | \$                             | 74,724,500.00  | \$   | 79,750,000.00     |
| 0          | Bid is complete. (32 | 29.23)(f)(1)(e) |                        |      | YES              | YES                             |    | YES                            |         | YES              | YES                            |                |      | YES               |
|            |                      |                 | BID IS:                |      | RESPONSIVE       | RESPONSIVE                      |    | RESPONSIVE                     | RE      | SPONSIVE         |                                | RESPONSIVE     |      | RESPONSIVE        |

| PRC        | DJECT:                                  | LOCKBOURNE INTERMO                                  | ODAL SUBTRUNK I                        | PROJECT                                | Bid I                                  | Date:                                  | Novembe                                | r 30, 2016                             |
|------------|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Departmen  | t/Division:                             | Public Utilities                                    |  | Initial Appare                         | nt Low Bidder:                         |  | Michels 1                              | Tunneling                              |
| Section:   |   | Sewers and Drains                                   |  | Initial Appare                         | ent Low Bid :                          |  | \$ 40,535,000.0                        |  |
|            |   |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|            |   | Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:               | Apparent Low                           | 2nd                                    | 3rd                                    | 4th                                    | 5th                                    | 6th                                    |
| CIP No.    |   | 650491-100002                                       | COMPANY NAME                           |
| Project Ma | nager:                                  | Jeremy Cawley                                       | Michels Tunneling                      | Ward & Burke<br>Tunneling, Inc.        | Southland<br>Contracting, Inc.         | Super Excavators,<br>Inc.              | Vadnais Trenchless<br>Services         | James W. Fowler Co.                    |
| Engineer's | Estimate:                               | \$ 65,687,892.00                                    | Initial Bid Amount                     |
|            |   |   | \$ 40,535,000.00                       | \$ 46,125,150.00                       | \$ 61,750,704.00                       | \$ 62,776,000.00                       | \$ 74,724,500.00                       | \$ 79,750,000.00                       |
|            |   | iteria, Contract Compliance                         | A "no" answer in Par                   | t IE will not necessarily              | render a bid non-resp<br>contract e    |  | ave a valid contract co                | mpliance no. prior to                  |
| 2          | The "Evaluated Lo<br>number at the time | w Bidder" has an active contract compliance of bid. | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    |
|            | Bid Resp                                |   | Bid Responsive,<br>Continue to Part II |
|            |   | Proceed to Part II?                                 | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    | YES                                    |
|            | LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I            |   | \$ 40,535,000.00                       |  | Manually Enter Amou                    | nt<br>Manually Enter Inforn            |  |  |
|            | LOW                                     | EST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I                        | Michel Tunneling, Inc.                 |  | •                                      |  |  |  |

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

| PROJECT:             | LOCKBOURNE INTERM | ODAL SUBTRUNK                    | PROJECT Bid Date:  |                        | Date:              | November 30, 2016  |                     |  |
|----------------------|-------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|--|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities  |                                  | Responsive Low E   | Michel Tunneling, Inc. |                    |                    |                     |  |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains | Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I): |                    |                        |                    | \$                 | 40,535,000.00       |  |
|                      |                   |                                  |                    |                        |                    |                    |                     |  |
| CIP No.              | 650491-100002     | COMPANY NAME                     | COMPANY NAME       | COMPANY NAME           | COMPANY NAME       | COMPANY NAME       | COMPANY NAME        |  |
| Project Manager:     | Jeremy Cawley     | Michels Tunneling                | Tunneling, Inc.    | Contracting, Inc.      | Inc.               | Services           | James W. Fowler Co. |  |
| Engineer's Estimate: | \$ 65,687,892.00  | Initial Bid Amount               | Initial Bid Amount | Initial Bid Amount     | Initial Bid Amount | Initial Bid Amount | Initial Bid Amount  |  |
|                      |                   | \$ 40,535,000.00                 | \$ 46,125,150.00   | \$ 61,750,704.00       | \$ 62,776,000.00   | \$ 74,724,500.00   | \$ 79,750,000.00    |  |
|                      |                   |                                  |                    |                        |                    |                    |                     |  |

| PART IIA: | 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria  | INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no") |     |     |     |     |     |  |  |  |
|-----------|---|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|--|--|--|
| а         | Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS | NO   | NO  | YES | YES | NO  | NO  |  |  |  |
| b         | The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS          | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| С         | The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS                | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| d         | The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7   | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| е         | The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7   | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| f         | The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7  | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| g         | The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. <b>FORM B7</b>  | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
| h         | The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8  | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |
|           | Responsibility Score:   | 7  | 7   | 8   | 8   | 7   | 7   |  |  |  |
|           | Continue to TAB 3?  | YES  | YES | YES | YES | YES | YES |  |  |  |

Manually Enter Information

### TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

| PROJECT: LOCKBOURNE INTERMO                                      |  |  |         | AL SUBTRUN                                       | NK PROJECT Bid Date:       |                            |                      |                 |             | ):                             | November 30, 2016                          |                     |                    |               |
|--|--|--|---------|--|----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------|--------------------------------|--|---------------------|--------------------|---------------|
| Department/Division: Public Utilities Section: Sewers and Drains |  |  |         | Evaluated Low Bidder (<br>Evaluated Low Bid (fro |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                | Michel Tunneling, Inc.<br>\$ 40,535,000.00 |                     |                    |               |
| CIP No.  |  | 650491-100002  | -       | COMPANY NAME COMPANY NAME                        |                            |                            | COMPANY NAME COMPANY |                 | OMPANY NAME | COMPANY NAME                   |  | COMPANY NAME        |                    |               |
| Project M<br>Engineer  | anager:<br>'s Estimate:  | Jeremy Cawley \$ 65,687,892.00   | М       | Bid Amount                                       | Tunneling, Inc. Bid Amount |                            |                      | itracting, Inc. | Sup         | er Excavators, Inc. Bid Amount |  | Services Bid Amount | James W. Fowler Co |               |
| PART III: 3  | 29.(01)(u) and 329.212   |  | \$      | 40,535,000.00                                    | \$                         | 46,125,150.00              | \$                   | 61,750,704.00   |             | 62,776,000.00                  | \$   | 74,724,500.00       | \$                 | 79,750,000.00 |
|  |  | IS BID LOCAL?  |         | NO   |                            | NO                         |                      | NO              |             | NO                             |  | NO                  |                    | NO            |
| To look up   | if a bidder is local, us   | e the Office of Construction Prequalification's lis  | st loca | ted at   | X:\Co                      | onstruction Prequali       | ification            | 1               |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| PART IIIA:   |  |  |         |  |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| step 1   | step 1  IF APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL_STOP. Skip steps 2-5 and enter data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TAB IV.  IF APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2 (see above for apparent low bid and bidder information) |  |         |  |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| Part IIIB:   |  |  |         |  |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| step 2   | Percentage difference  | e of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.   |         | 0.000%   |                            | 13.791%                    |                      | 52.339%         |             | 54.869%                        |  | 84.346%             |                    | 96.744%       |
| step 3   | Is amount in prior ste BID?  | WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW   |         | YES  |                            | NO                         |                      | NO              |             | NO                             |  | NO                  |                    | NO            |
| step 4   | DID AGENCY FOLLO   | E PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.  WY PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO  NS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)? |         |  |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| step 5   | INPUT NEW BID AM<br>(\$0)  | DUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO  |         |  |                            |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| Part IIIC:   |  |  |         |  | l                          |                            |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| step 6   | REVISED LOW B  | ID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:   | \$      | 40,535,000.00                                    | -                          |                            | Manua                | lly Enter Amoun | t           |                                |  |                     |                    |               |
| step 7   | step 7 REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB: Michels Tunneling, Inc.   |  |         |  |                            | Manually Enter Information |                      |                 |             |                                |  |                     |                    |               |

**TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference** 

| PROJECT: LOCKBOURNE INTERMODAL S |   |   | L SUBTRUNK PROJECT   |         |                        |     | Bid I                          | Bid Date: |                       |             | November 30, 2016 |                     |               |                                |               |
|----------------------------------|---|---|--|---------|------------------------|-----|--------------------------------|-----------|-----------------------|-------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------|--------------------------------|---------------|
| Departme                         | Department/Division: Public Utilities   |   | Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):  |         |                        |     | m Tabs I, II and III):         | Michels   |                       | Michels Tur | neli              | ng, Inc.            |               |                                |               |
| Section:                         |   | Sewers and Drains   | 1  |         |                        | Eva | luated Low Bid (fi             | rom '     | Tabs I, II and III) : |             |                   | \$                  |               |                                | 40,535,000    |
| OUD III                          |   | <br>  |  |         |                        |     |                                |           |                       | -           |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| CIP No.                          |   | 650491-100002   |  |         | PANY NAME              |     | UMPANY NAME<br>Junneling, Inc. | _         | OMPANY NAME           | CC          | OMPANY NAME       | C                   | OMPANY NAME   |                                | MPANY NAME    |
| Project M                        | anager:<br>s Estimate:  | Jeremy Cawley   | 65,687,892.00  |         | id Amount              |     | Bid Amount                     |           | Bid Amount            |             | Bid Amount        | Services Bid Amount |               | James W. Fowler Co. Bid Amount |               |
| Liigiileei                       | 5 LStilliate.   | 7   | 03,087,832.00  |         | 40,535,000.00          |     | 46,125,150.00                  | \$        |                       | \$          | 62,776,000.00     | \$                  | 74,724,500.00 | \$                             | 79,750,000.00 |
|                                  | 29.(17) Environmenta  | l Preference  |  | -       |                        |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| Арра                             | arent Low Bid:  | \$  | 40,535,000.00  | Apparei | nt Low Bidder:         |     | Michels Tur                    | nneli     | ng, Inc.              |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| PART IV: 3                       | 29.(17) Environmenta  | I Preference  |  |         |                        |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| step 1                           | Did apparent/evaluate   |   | nentally preferable" bid? Answer<br>er bidder's, input <b>"NA"</b>   |         | YES                    |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| step 2                           | Excluding apparent  | low bidder, did bidder submi  | it "environmentally preferable" bid?   |         |                        |     | YES                            |           | NO                    |             | NO                |                     | YES           |                                | YES           |
| step 3                           | then the apparent/eva<br>4-6, complete Step 7,  | luated low bidder is lead bidde<br>and proceed to Tab 5.<br>ted low bidder did not submit a | an environmentally preferable bid,<br>or for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps<br>an environmentally preferable bid, |         |                        |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
| step 4                           |   | tal preference for each bid. It i, for a maximum of \$20,000 pe                             | s up to five percent (5%) of the non-<br>er bid.   |         | 0.000%                 |     | 13.791%                        |           | 52.339%               |             | 54.869%           |                     | 84.346%       |                                | 96.744%       |
| step 5                           | Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied). |   | o environmental preference was   | \$      | -                      | \$  | 20,000.00                      | \$        | 20,000.00             | \$          | 20,000.00         | \$                  | 20,000.00     | \$                             | 20,000.00     |
| step 6                           |   | onmental preference, except if<br>se, both claiming EP cancels it                           |  | \$      | 40,535,000.00          | \$  | 46,105,150.00                  | \$        | 61,730,704.00         | \$          | 62,756,000.00     | \$                  | 74,704,500.00 | \$                             | 79,730,000.00 |
| step 7                           | Low Bid Amount:   | \$ 40,535,000.00  | Low Bidder:  | Miche   | els Tunneling,<br>Inc. |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |
|                                  | Manually Enter Amount Manually Enter Information  |   |  |         |                        |     |                                |           |                       |             |                   |                     |               |                                |               |

Tab 4: 9 of 16

#### TAB V. Miscellaneous

| Apparent Low Bidder/Bid: | Michels Tunneling, Inc.        | \$ 40,535,000.00 |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------|
| Project:                 | LOCKBOURNE INTERMODAL SUBTRUNK | PROJECT          |

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

| Bidders   | Michels Tunneling | Ward & Burke<br>Tunneling, Inc. | Southland<br>Contracting, Inc. | Super Excavators, Inc. | Vadnais Trenchless<br>Services | James W. Fowler Co. |  |
|---|-------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| Bid   | \$ 40,535,000.00  | \$ 46,125,150.00                | \$ 61,750,704.00               | \$ 62,776,000.00       | \$ 74,724,500.00               | \$ 79,750,000.00    |  |
| Percent Difference btwn Bid and<br>Next Highest Bid |                   | 33.88%                          | 1.66%                          | 19.03%                 | 6.73%                          |                     |  |

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

YES YES

YES

YES

YES

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting

service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: LOCKBOURNE INTERMODAL SUBTRUNK PROJECT

Recommended Bidder: Michels Tunneling

Contract Amount: \$ 40,535,000.00

Evaluator's Name: Mike Pettiford
Evaluation Completion Date: 12/4/2016

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: April 28, 2015

| PROJECT:             | Lockbourne Intermodel Subtrunk Proj |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Department/Division: | Public Utilities                    |  |  |  |  |
| Section:             | Sewers and Drains                   |  |  |  |  |

|                  |  | Bids from A   | pparent lo                 | west to high                     | nest:                |      | Apparent Low  |  |
|------------------|--|---|----------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------|------|---|--|
| CIP No.          |  | 650491-1  | 100002                     |                                  |                      | C    | OMPANY NAME   |  |
| Project Manager: |  | Jeremy Cawley   |                            |                                  | Michels<br>Tunneling |      |   |  |
| Engineer's Esti  | mate:  | \$  | _                          | 65,687,8                         | 392.00               | \$   | tial Bid Amount 40,535,000.00                       |  |
|                  |  |   |                            |                                  |                      | ų.   | 13.79%  |  |
| Responsiveness C | Criteria, WPCL   | .F/WSRLA Cor  | mpliance                   |                                  |                      | subn | O" answer will not<br>nitted prior to cont<br>dule. |  |
| FORM B12         |  | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form |                            |                                  |                      |      | Yes   |  |
| FORM B13         | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form |   |                            |                                  |                      |      | Yes   |  |
| FORM B13.3       |  | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4   |                            |                                  |                      |      | Yes   |  |
| FORM B13.2       | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor   |   |                            |                                  |                      | Yes  |   |  |
| FORM B14.1       | it has met the<br>Utilization Go   | ed Low Bidder"<br>EPA Disadvan<br>als of 1.2% MB<br>nust be docum   | itaged Busir<br>E and 1.8% | ness Enterprise<br>WBE (if "NO," | es (DBE)<br>Good     |      | Yes   |  |

Tab 6: 11 of 16

| _ | OOD FAITH<br>EFFORTS | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.2% MBE and 1.8% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided | Yes |
|---|----------------------|--|-----|
|   | FORM B15             | The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form  | Yes |
|   |                      |  |     |

| LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I    | \$ 40,535,000.00 |
|---------------------------------|------------------|
| LOWEST DESDONSIVE DIDDED TAD 6  | Michels          |
| LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6 | Tunneling        |

# TAB VI: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

# Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are department

Please follow the format of the previous tabs. If you need assistance, please contact Suzanna

| ect                  | Bid I                    | Date:                   | November 30, 2016     |                    |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
| Initial Apparen      | t Low Bidder:            | Michels 1               | Tunneling             |                    |  |  |  |  |
| Initial Appare       | nt Low Bid :             |                         | \$                    | 40,535,000.00      |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
| 2nd                  | 3rd                      | 4th                     | 5th                   | 6th                |  |  |  |  |
| COMPANY NAME         | COMPANY NAME             | COMPANY NAME            | COMPANY NAME          | COMPANY NAME       |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Southland                |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
| Ward & Burke         | Contracting,             | Super                   | Vadnais               | James W.           |  |  |  |  |
| Tunneling, Inc.      | Inc.                     | <b>Excavators, Inc.</b> | Trenchless, Inc.      | Fowler, Co.        |  |  |  |  |
| Initial Bid Amount   | Initial Bid Amount       | Initial Bid Amount      | Initial Bid Amount    | Initial Bid Amount |  |  |  |  |
| \$ 46,125,150.00     | \$ 61,750,704.00         | \$ 62,776,000.00        | \$ 74,724,500.00      | \$ 79,750,000.00   |  |  |  |  |
| 33.88%               | 1.66%                    | 19.03%                  | 6.73%                 |                    |  |  |  |  |
| ract execution. Dela | y in providing this info | ormation may result in  | n delay of loan award | and affect project |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                          |                         |                       |                    |  |  |  |  |

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

ent specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

Gussler or Alex Cofield.

### **TAB VII: Notes**

On this page, include any notes or clarification from phone calls made. Be sure to include the company you called, who you spoke with, date, time, question asked, outcome of call, and name of person who made the call.

Include any notes or clarifications from research done.

Yes

No

NA