# Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations Effective 2/22/2017

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code section 329 as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Here is a link to City Code <u>Columbus City Code</u>

2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.

3. If you have questions about using the spreadsheet, contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.

4. If you print the workbook in its entirety from the print screen as opposed to printing each worksheet separately ("active sheets"), you will print this page and the evaluation will begin on page 2 and go through page 13. If you print each workbook separately, the page numbering is different.

version:2/22/2017					
PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically	e-bid of SWWTP Chemically Enhanced Primary Treatment S87 Bid Date:			
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Shook Construction Co.

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
		Shook Construction		Kenmore			
Project Manager:	Troy Branson	Co.	Inc.	Construction Co, Inc.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			
		0.00%	4.03%	-100.00%			

PART IA: I	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	YES	YES	YES			
с	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>	YES	YES	YES			
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an <b>active</b> water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	YES	YES			
f	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

version:2/22/2017					
PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically Enhanced Primary Treatment S87 Bid Date:				June 7, 2017
				_	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Appare	it Low Bidder:		Shook Construction Co.

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Troy Branson	Shook Construction Co.	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Kenmore Construction Co, Inc.			
	s Estimate:	\$37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
Ű			\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			
PART IB: R	esponsiveness Crit	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а		<b>d a list of subcontractors</b> with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			
b	are licensed constru	e listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM</b> trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
с	qualified responsible	performation of the bidder proposed pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors IA")	YES	YES	YES			
d	work under which th	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
e	subcontractor per d more than one sub (329.20)(h)(5) (If no "NA") FORM B5	e listed and the bidder listed more than one ivision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? b licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	YES	YES	YES			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.20	<pre>string of the state of the</pre>	YES	YES	YES			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or r. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

version:2/22/2017				
PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically	Enhanced Primary Treatment S87	Bid Date:	June 7, 2017
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	Shook Construction Co.
Section:	Treatment Engineering DOSD	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$ 25,604,141.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager: s Estimate:	Troy Branson \$37,808,980.00	Shook Construction Co.	Kokosing Industrial, Inc. Initial Bid Amount	Kenmore Construction Co, Inc. Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
Engineer	s Estimate.	\$57,808,580.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			
PART IC: R	esponsiveness Cri	teria, Bid Specific (329.23)			E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for I	responsive bid)
а		mit more than one bid for same work. (See ction for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowled	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
с		ith technical pre-qualification fication requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid <b>contains</b> n invitation for bid. (3	o conditions or qualifications not provided in the 29.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Bidder added <b>no</b> pr (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	ovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2	mit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	rially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES	YES			
i		gularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid (1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES			
k		a lump sum price if <b>required</b> . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) <b>sum is not an option, enter "NA")</b>	NA	NA	NA			
I		ed with section 329.20(h) regarding 9.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
m		in alterations, omissions, errors, such that it <b>does</b> documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid <b>responds</b> to bi (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	d documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES			

version:2/22/2017					
PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically	Enhanced Primary Treatment S87	Bid Date:		June 7, 2017
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Shook Construction Co.
				· ·	25,604,141.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project N	lanager:	Troy Branson	Shook Construction Co.	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Kenmore Construction Co, Inc.			
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		•	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			
0	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

Proceed to Part II?

version:2/22/2017					
PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically		June 7, 2017		
Department/Division:	Department/Division: Public Utilities Initial Apparent Low Bidder:				
Section:	Treatment Engineering DOSD	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$	25,604,141.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
		<b>Shook Construction</b>	Kokosing Industrial,	Kenmore			
Project Manager:	Troy Branson	Co.	Inc.	Construction Co, Inc.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			

		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to						
PART ID:	Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance	contract execution.						
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES	YES				
		-	-	-	-	-		
		Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation	
	Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Continue to Part II	Continue to Part II				Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	

YES

YES

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 25,604,141.00	•	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Shook Construction Co	o./Kokosing Industrial	Manually Enter Information

YES

# TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically	Enhanced Primary Treatment S87	Bid Date:	Jun	e 7, 2017
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Responsive Low E	lidder (from Tab I):	ok Construction	Co./Kokosing Indus
Section:	Treatment Engineering DOSD	Responsive Low	Bid (from Tab I):	\$	25,604,141.00

CIP No.	650367-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
		Shook Construction	Kokosing Industrial,	Kenmore			
Project Manager:	Troy Branson	Co.	Inc.	Construction Co, Inc.	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00	0	0	0

PART IIA: 3	29.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	or "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. <b>FORM B6</b> , <b>SPECIFICATIONS</b>	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. <b>FORM B7</b>	YES	YES	YES			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. <b>FORM B7</b>	YES	YES	YES			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES			
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	8	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			



#### TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT:	e-bid of SWWTP Chemically	Enhanced Primary Treatment S8	Bid Date:	Jui	ne 7, 2017
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Evaluated Low Bidder (f	rom Tabs I and II):	ok Constructio	n Co./Kokosing Indust
Section:	Treatment Engineering DOSD	Evaluated Low Bid (fro	om Tabs I and II) :	\$	25,604,141.00

CIP No.	P No. 650367-100002		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Troy Branson	Shook Construction Co.	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Kenmore Construction Co, Inc.	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 37,808,980.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 329.212	2 Local Bidder						

IS BID LOCAL 2 NO VES VES						
	IS BID LUCAL?	NO	YES	YES		

To look up if a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's list located at X:\Construction Prequalification

PART IIIA:

ANT IIIA.		
	IF APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. Skip steps 2-5 and enter	
	data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TAB IV.	
step 1		
·	IF APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2 (see	
	above for apparent low bid and bidder information)	

Part IIIB:	Part IIIB:									
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	0.000%	4.032%	NA	NA	NA			
eton 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	YES	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA			
step 4	If step 3 is <u>"yes"</u> , SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?									
eton h	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00							

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 25,604,141.00	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	Kokosing Industrial	Manually Enter Information

#### TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PF	ROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP	Chemically Enha	nced Primary Trea	tment S87	Bid Date:		June 7, 2017	
)epartme Section:	nt/Division:	Public Utilities Treatment Engineering D	050	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :					Industrial 25,604,141
ection:		Treatment Engineering D	030		Evaluated Low Bid (II	rom Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	25,004,141
CIP No.		650367-100002		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
roject Ma	anager:	Troy Branson		Co.	Inc.	Construction Co, Inc.	NA	NA	NA
ngineer's	s Estimate:	\$	37,808,980.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
	20 (47) Environmente	1 Desfermente		\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmenta arent Low Bid:	\$	25,604,141.00	Apparent Low Bidder:	Kokosing	Industrial			
ip ip e		Ŧ							
ART IV: 32	29.(17) Environmenta	I Preference							
step 1		ed low bidder submit "environmentally pre oparent low bidder. For all other bidder's,		NO	YES	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent	low bidder, did bidder submit "environn	nentally preferable" bid?	NA	YES	YES			
step 3	then the apparent/eva	valuated low bidder submitted an environn aluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4 Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5.							
	If the apparent/evalua proceed to Steps 6 ar	ted low bidder did not submit an environn nd 7.	nentally preferable bid,						
		tal preference for each bid. It is up to five I, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.	percent (5%) of the non-	0.000%	0.000%	4.032%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	r each eligible bid (if 0, then no environm	ental preference was	\$-	\$-	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, except if both claim se, both claiming EP cancels it for both	environmental	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,616,480.00	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount	\$ 25,604,141.00	Low Bidder:	Kokosing Industrial					
		Manually Enter Amount	M	anually Enter Informati	00				

Manually Enter Amount

#### TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent L	ow Bidder/Bid:		Kokosing Industria	I	\$ 25,604,141.00			
Pr	oject:	Re-bid of SW	WTP Chemically E					
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid is information regarding performance an						nd/or historical	
	Bidders	Shook Construction Co.	Kokosing Industrial, Inc.	Kenmore Construction Co, Inc.	0	0	0	
	Bid Percent Difference btwn Bid and <mark>Next Highest</mark> Bid	\$ 25,604,141.00 0.00%	\$ 25,604,141.00 4.03%	\$ 26,636,480.00 -100.00%	\$-	\$-	\$ -	
Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder? If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h? If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.								
Bid Guarantee Requirements       Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.         Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?       YES         Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?       YES								
	<u>Bid Bond</u> Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statemen Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Cert							
Contract Compliance	Are all subcontractors contract comp If there are not any subcontractors, c	hoose N/A.			NO	]		
Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp	If yes, business entity shall register v service of summons, in any action in	Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio? NO If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio. This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid http://www.sos.state.oh.us/						
Award recommendation: After	evaluation of the bids, I recommend	-		ract for:				
Project Name: Recommended Bidder: Contract Amount:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically E Kokosing Industrial \$ 25,604,141.00	nhanced Primary Tr	eatment S87					
Evaluator's Name: Evaluation Completion Date:	Melinda Cunningham 6/15/2017							

# TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	Re-bid of SWWTP Chemically Enhanced Primary

Department/Division:	Public Utilities	
Section:	Treatment Engineering DOSD	

		Bids from Apparen	t lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	
CIP No.		650367-100002		COMPANY NAM	IE
Project Manager:		Troy Branson		Shook Construction (	Co.
Engineer's Esti	mate:	\$	37,808,980.00	Initial Bid Amou	nt
				\$ 25,604,141	
					00%
Responsiveness (	Criteria, WPCL	F/WSRLA Complianc	e	A "NO" answer wi information submi affect project sche	itted
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form		Yes		
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form		Yes		
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor		Yes		
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4		Yes		
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.2% MBE and 1.8% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided			Yes	

The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	Koko	sing Industrial
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	\$	25,604,141

# TAB VI: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

# Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are departme

Please follow the format of the previous tabs. If you need assistance, please contact Suzanna

Treatment S87 Bid Date:			June 7, 2017	
Initial Apparen	: Low Bidder:	Shook Construction Co.		
Initial Appare	nt Low Bid :	\$	25,604,141.00	

2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
COMPANY NAME				
	Kenmore			
Kokosing	Construction			
Industrial, Inc.	Co, Inc.			
Initial Bid Amount				
\$ 25,604,141.00	\$ 26,636,480.00			
4.03%	-100.00%			

t necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required prior to contract execution. Delay in providing this information may result in delay of loan award and

Yes	NA		
Yes	NA		

Yes	NA		

Manually Enter Amount
 Manually Enter Information

ent specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

Gussler or Alex Cofield.

Verify DBE Subcontractors here:

http://www.dot.state.oh.us/Divisions/ODI/SDBE/Pages/UCP.aspx

http://eodreporting.oit.ohio.gov/searchEDGE.aspx

# **TAB VII: Notes**

On this page, include any notes or clarification from phone calls made. Be sure to include the company you called, who you spoke with, date, time, question asked, outcome of call, and name of person who made the call.

Include any notes or clarifications from research done.

The initial bids as submitted via Bid Express indicated that Shook Construction was the low bidder. How Kokosing matched Shook's bid at \$25,604,141.00.

vever, they are non-local and the next bid, Kokosing Industrial (a local bidder) was within 1%.

Yes No NA