PROJECT:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp's	Bid Date:	June 14, 2017
----------	---------------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Complete Gen'l
Section:	Street Lighting	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 257,360.80

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard		
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$257,360.80	\$275,411.43	\$305,829.31	\$363,083.92		
		7.01%	11.04%	18.72%	-100.00%		

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive					responsive bid)
a	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES	YES	YES		
С	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES	YES	YES		
d	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE		

	PROJECT:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp's	Bid Date:	June 14, 2017
--	----------	---------------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Complete Gen'l
Section:	Street Lighting	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 257,360.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard		
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$257,360.80	\$275,411.43	\$305,829.31	\$363,083.92		
PART IB: I	Responsiveness Cr	riteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
a		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated y subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
b	are licensed const	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors ruction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM I trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA	NA		
С	qualified responsib	ubcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- ple or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	NA	NA	NA	NA		
d	work under which	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed ors are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	NA	NA	NA	NA		
е	subcontractor per more than one sub	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why b is listed for the division/section of work? no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA	NA		
f	trade subcontractoresponsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction ors are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 20)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA	NA		
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or ty. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE		

PROJECT:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp's	Bid Date:	June 14, 2017
----------	---------------------------------------	-----------	---------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:		Complete Gen'l
Section:	Street Lighting	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$	257,360.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard		
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$257,360.80	\$275,411.43	\$305,829.31	\$363,083.92		
PART IC: R	Responsiveness Cr	iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for I	responsive bid)
a	referenced code se	mit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
b	Bidder acknowled PAGE, page 2	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	NA	NA	NA	NA		
С		vith technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES	YES		
d	The bid contains r invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the (29.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
e	Bidder added no pr (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES	YES		
f	Bidder submitted a B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES	YES	YES		
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2, FORM	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) B3	YES	YES	NA	YES		
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES	YES	YES		
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid (1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
j	(329.23)(f)(1)(g) F "NA")	a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES	YES		
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA	NA		
- 1		ed with section 329.20(h) regarding 29.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B6	YES	YES	YES	YES		
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it to bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
n	Bid responds to bi (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	d documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES	YES		

PROJECT:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp's	Bid Date:	June 14, 2017

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Complete Gen'l
Section:	Street Lighting	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 257,360.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME					
Project M	anager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard		
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$257,360.80	\$275,411.43	\$305,829.31	\$363,083.92		
0	Bid is complete. (3	229.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES	YES		
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE		

PR	OJECT:	Livingston Ave. S	Street Lighting Imp	o's	Bid	Date:	June 14, 2017		
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities / Power		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Complete Gen'l		
Section:	Section: Street Lighting			Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	257,360.80	
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th	
CIP No.		440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME					
Project Ma	anager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard			
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$257,360.80	\$275,411.43	\$305,829.31	\$363,083.92			
PART ID: R	_	riteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Par	rt IE will not necessaril	•	oonsive. Bidder must h execution.	ave a valid contract co	mpliance no. prior to	
a	number at the time	ow Bidder" has an active contract compliance e of bid.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	
				I.	L		ı		
	Bid Res		Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office				
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES	YES			
	LO	OWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 257,360.80		Manually Enter Amou	ınt			
	LOW	/EST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Complete Gen'l	•	Manually Enter Inform	nation			

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Livingston Ave.	Street Lighting Imp	's	Bid I	June 14, 2017				
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Power		Responsive Low E		Complete Gen'l				
Section:	Street Lighting		Responsive Low	Bid (from Tab I):		\$	257,360.80		
CIP No.	440007-100006 (UIRF)	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME		
Project Manager:	Chris Vogel	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard	NA	NA		
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 253,533.60	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount		
		\$ 257,360.80	\$ 275,411.43	\$ 305,829.31	\$ 363,083.92	0	0		

PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	YES	NA	NA		
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES	YES		
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES	YES		
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES	YES		
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES	YES		
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES	YES		
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES	YES		
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES	YES		
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	7	7	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES	YES		

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT: Livingston Ave.		Livingston Ave.	Street Lighting Ir	mp's	Bid I	Date:	June 14	June 14, 2017	
Departme Section:	ent/Division:	Public Utilities / Power Street Lighting		Evaluated Low Bidde Evaluated Low Bid	r (from Tabs I and II): (from Tabs I and II) :		Comple \$	te Gen'l 257,360.80	
PART III: 3.	's Estimate: 329.(01)(u) and 329.2	440007-100006 (UIRF) Chris Vogel \$ 253,533.60 12 Local Bidder IS BID LOCAL? use the Office of Construction Prequalification's lise	COMPANY NAME Complete Gen'l Bid Amount \$ 257,360.80	COMPANY NAME Asplundh Bid Amount \$ 275,411.43	COMPANY NAME U.S. Utility Bid Amount \$ 305,829.31	COMPANY NAME Jess Howard Bid Amount \$ 363,083.92	COMPANY NAME NA Bid Amount NA	COMPANY NAME NA Bid Amount NA	
PART IIIA:		OW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. Skip data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to T LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTIN above for apparent low bid and bidder inform	AB IV. UE TO TO STEP 2 (see						
Part IIIB:									
step 2	Percentage differen	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	7.014%	18.833%	41.080%	NA		
step 3	Is amount in prior st							NA	
		ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW	YES	NO	NO	NO	NA	NA NA	
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLI	SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?	YES	NO	NO	NO	NA		
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLI CITY CODE SECTI	SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. LOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO	YES	NO	NO	NO	NA		
	DID AGENCY FOLI CITY CODE SECTI INPUT NEW BID AI	SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?	YES	NO	NO	NO	NA		
step 5	DID AGENCY FOLI CITY CODE SECTI INPUT NEW BID AI (\$0)	SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?	\$ 257,360.80	NO	NO Manually Enter Amoun		NA		

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

DD	ROJECT:		Livingston Avo. Stro	ot Li	ahtina lmn'a				Bid I)ata	٦٠	luno 1	4, 2017	
FIN	OJECT.		Livingston Ave. Stre	et Li	gnting imp s				Diu i	Jak	5.	Julie I	4, 2017	
Departmen	nt/Division:	Public Utilities	/ Power			Eva	luated Low Bidder	(froi	m Tabs I, II and III):			Complete Gen'l		
Section:		Street Lighting				Εv	aluated Low Bid (fr	om	Tabs I, II and III) :			\$	257,361	
CIP No.		440007-100006	/LIIDE/	CO	MPANY NAME	(COMPANY NAME	C	OMPANY NAME	C	OMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Ma	anader:	Chris Vogel	(OIKF)		mplete Gen'l		Asplundh	C	U.S. Utility	-	Jess Howard	NA	NA	
	s Estimate:	\$	253,533.60		Bid Amount		Bid Amount		Bid Amount		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	
Linginioon	S Estimato.	*	255,555.55	\$	257,360.80	\$		\$	305,829.31	\$	363,083.92	NA NA	NA NA	
PART IV: 32	29.(17) Environmental	Preference				Ė	,	Ė	,		, -			
Арра	rent Low Bid:	\$	257,360.80	Appar	ent Low Bidder:		Comple	te G	en'I					
PART IV: 32	29.(17) Environmental	Preference												
step 1			onmentally preferable" bid? Answer other bidder's, input "NA"		YES		NA		NA		NA			
	Excluding apparent I bid?	ow bidder, did bidder st	ubmit "environmentally preferable"		NA		NO		YES		NO			
	bid, then the apparent/		ted an environmentally preferable ad bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data ab 5.											
	If the apparent/evaluat bid, proceed to Steps		mit an environmentally preferable											
		ral preference for each bio bid, for a maximum of \$2	I. It is up to five percent (5%) of the 20,000 per bid.		0.000%		7.014%		18.833%		41.080%	NA	NA	
	Preference amount for applied).	each eligible bid (if 0, the	en no environmental preference was	\$	-	\$	19,316.66	\$	20,000.00	\$	20,000.00	NA	NA	
		onmental preference, exce e, both claiming EP cance	ept if both claim enviornmental els it for both	\$	257,360.80	\$	256,094.77	\$	285,829.31	\$	343,083.92	NA	NA	
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 257,360.80	Low Bidder:	Co	omplete Gen'l									

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Complete Gen'l	\$	257,360.80
Project:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp'	s	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Complete Gen'l	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard	0	0
Bid	\$ 257,360.80	\$ 275,411.43	\$ 305,829.31	\$ 363,083.92	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid						
and Next Highest Bid	7.01%	11.04%	18.72%	-100.00%		

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, q, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES

Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

YES

Certified/Cashier's Check Drawn on a solvant bank

Contract Compliance

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity,

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

or both, brought in the State of Ohio

N/A NO

N/A

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp's

Recommended Bidder: Complete General Construction Co.
Contract Amount: \$ 257,360.80

Evaluator's Name: Mis
Evaluation Completion Date: 6/1

Missy Smith 645-3776

6/16/2017

Additional Information for Departments:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Complete Gen'l	\$	257,360.80
Project:	Livingston Ave. Street Lighting Imp	's	

Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

State of Ohio Debarment

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

OSHA

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

https://www.osha.gov

City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

TAB VII: Notes

Complete General	Asplundh	U.S. Utility	Jess Howard	PM's comments:
		Interested Parties		
	None listed but Signature			
	Affidavit includes 2 V.P.'s;			
	marked "yes".			
Tab 1, Par	t 1C-c: Are there Technical Prequ	ualifications (other than pre-qua	alification)?	
	None p	er Chris.		
	Tab 1. Part 1C	-b: addendum?	Т	
		Vendor listed 2 addendums but		
		are actually none. (Marked		
		"NA"not inquiring since 3rd		
		lowest bidder.)		
		,		
	Tab 1, Part 10	C-g: Bid Bond?		
		Surety 2000 didn't upload any		
		surety forms. Marked "NA"		
		since we could ask for		
		clarification.		
Tab 2	, Part IIA-a: Statistically Compar	able/Further Documentation No	eeded:	
	, ,		43.2% > E.E. & 41.1% > lowest	
		bidder. Marked "NA".	bidder. Marked "NA".	
		eeting deadlines/costs:		
of projects meeting		# of projects meeting	# of projects meeting	
adlines: 0 out of 3; marked	deadlines: 4 out of 5; marked	deadlines: 2 out of 3; marked	deadlines: 1 out of 3; marked	
es" (CO's).	"yes" (CO's).	"yes" (CO's).	"yes" (CO's).	
	Wafanaiasta wa 11			NONE
	# of projects meeting costs: 1	l.,		
of projects meeting costs: 1	• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	# of projects meeting costs: 1	# of projects meeting costs: 1	
t of 3; marked "yes" (CO's).	(1 project had insufficient info)	out of 3; marked "yes" (CO's).	out of 3; marked "yes" (CO's).	