TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's	Bid Date:	June 7, 2017

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Tech. Support	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 547,229.80

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690411-100001	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	C.R. Weaver, P.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$547,229.80	\$604,180.65				
		10.41%	-100.00%				

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
a	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES				
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES				
С	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES				
d	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

ORD# 1763-2017

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT: Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's Bid Date: June 7, 2017
--

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Tech. Support	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 547,229.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690411-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	C.R. Weaver, P.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis				
	's Estimate:	\$741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$547,229.80	\$604,180.65				
PART IB: R	Responsiveness Cri	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	VE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for i	responsive bid)
a		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES				
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA				
С	qualified responsible	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 19.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	NA	NA				
d	work under which the	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed are are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	NA	NA				
e	subcontractor per o	te listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA				
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction is are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade le listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA				
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES			_	
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

ORD# 1763-2017

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

Watershed Wisc. Imp's - Hoover Dail Wisc. Imp's Did Date.	PROJECT:	Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's	Bid Date:	June 7, 2017
---	----------	--	-----------	--------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.
Section:	Tech. Support	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 547,229.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690411-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	C.R. Weaver, P.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis				
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$547,229.80	\$604,180.65				
PART IC: I	Responsiveness C	riteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for i	responsive bid)
а		bmit more than one bid for same work. (See section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES				
b	PAGE, page 2	dged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES	YES				
С		with technical pre-qualification cification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES				
d	The bid contains invitation for bid. (no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES				
е	Bidder added no (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	provisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES				
f	Bidder submitted B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES				
g	Bidder did not su FORM B2, FORM	bmit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices are ma	terially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES				
i		regularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid (f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. FORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES				
k		a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) p sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
I		lied with section 329.20(h) regarding 329.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B6	YES	YES				
m		tain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it he bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid responds to b (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	oid documents in all material respects.	YES	YES				

ORD# 1763-2017

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

Tech. Support

version: 2/22/2017

Section:

PROJECT:	Watershed Misc. Imp's	s - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's	Bid Date:	June 7, 2017
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.

Initial Apparent Low Bid :

\$

547,229.80

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690411-100001	COMPANY NAME					
Project N	lanager:	C.R. Weaver, P.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis				
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount					
	o Bid is complete. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)		\$547,229.80	\$604,180.65				
0			YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT: Watershed Misc. Imp's		s - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's		Bid Date:		June 7, 2017		
Departme	Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water		Initial Apparent Low Bidder:				The Righter Co.	
Section:		Tech. Support		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	547,229.80
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:		2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690411-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	lanager:	C.R. Weaver, P.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis				
Engineer's	's Estimate:	\$741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$547,229.80	\$604,180.65				
PART ID: R	Resnonsiveness C	riteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Par	rt IE will not necessaril [,]		oonsive. Bidder must h	ave a valid contract co	mpliance no. prior to
а		w Bidder" has an active contract compliance	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
	Bid Res	sponsivness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office			
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				
	LC	OWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 547,229.80		Manually Enter Amou	ınt		
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I		The Righter Co.		Manually Enter Inform	nation		

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	CT: Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's			sc. Imp's	Bid Date:		June 7, 2017	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	/ Water	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):			The Rig	hter Co.	
Section:	Tech. Support		Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):			\$	547,229.80	
CIP No.	690411-100001	1	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	C.R. Weaver, P	.E.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$	741,488.95	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 547,229.80	\$ 604,180.65	0	0	0	0

PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	YES				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES				



TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT: Watershed Misc. Imp's		s - Hoover Dam I	Misc. Imp's	Bid l	Date:	June 7, 2017		
Departme Section:	ent/Division:	Public Utilities / Water Tech. Support		Evaluated Low Bidde Evaluated Low Bid			The Rig	hter Co. 547,229.80
	lanager: 's Estimate: 29.(01)(u) and 329.21.	690411-100001 C.R. Weaver, P.E. \$ 741,488.95 2 Local Bidder	COMPANY NAME The Righter Co. Bid Amount \$ 547,229.80	COMPANY NAME Sunesis Bid Amount \$ 604,180.65	COMPANY NAME NA Bid Amount NA			
To look up	if a bidder is local us	IS BID LOCAL?	YES	NO X:\Construction Pregua	lification			
step 1		OW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. Skip data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to Too OW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUADOVE for apparent low bid and bidder information.	AB IV. JE TO TO STEP 2 (see					
step 2	Percentage difference	e of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	10.407%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 3	Is amount in prior ste	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLLO	EE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO DNS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AM (\$0)	OUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO						
Part IIIC:								
step 6	REVISED LOW E	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 547,229.80		Manually Enter Amoun	t		
step 7	REVISED LOW E	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	The Righter Co.	Co. Manually Enter Information				

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PF	ROJECT:	Wa	atershed Misc. Imp's - H	loover Dam Misc. I	mp's	Bid l	Date:	June 7	7, 2017
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities /	' Water		Evaluated Low Bidder	·	:	The Rig	hter Co.
Section:		Tech. Support			Evaluated Low Bid (fr	om Tabs I, II and III):		\$	547,230
CIP No.		690411-100001		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	C.R. Weaver, P.I	Ε.	The Righter Co.	Sunesis	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$	741,488.95	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
				\$ 547,229.80	\$ 604,180.65	NA	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmenta				TI 5:				
Appa	rent Low Bid:	\$	547,229.80	Apparent Low Bidder:	The Rig	nter Co.			
PART IV: 32	29.(17) Environmenta	Il Preference							
step 1		ed low bidder submit "enviro oparent low bidder. For all	onmentally preferable" bid? Answer other bidder's, input "NA"	YES	NA				
step 2	Excluding apparent bid?	low bidder, did bidder su	bmit "environmentally preferable"	NA	NO				
step 3	bid, then the apparent in Steps 4-6, complete	t/evaluated low bidder is lea e Step 7, and proceed to Ta	ed an environmentally preferable and bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data ab 5.						
	bid, proceed to Steps		ilit ari erivirorimentaliy preferable						
step 4	Calculate environmer		It is up to five percent (5%) of the 0,000 per bid.	0.000%	10.407%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	or each eligible bid (if 0, the	n no environmental preference was	\$ -	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, exce se, both claiming EP cance	pt if both claim enviornmental Is it for both	\$ 547,229.80	\$ 584,180.65	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 547,229.80	Low Bidder:	The Righter Co.					
		•		•					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	The Righter Co.	\$	547,229.80
Project:	Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Mis	c. Im	p's

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	The Righter Co.	Sunesis	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 547,229.80	\$ 604,180.65	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid						
and Next Highest Bid	10.41%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for guestions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES

Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Certified/Cashier's Check

Drawn on a solvant bank

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

N/A

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity,

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

or both, brought in the State of Ohio



This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's Project Name:

Recommended Bidder: The Righter Co., Inc.

547,229.80 Contract Amount:

Missy Smith 645-3776 Evaluator's Name: 6/12/2017

Evaluation Completion Date:

Additional Information for Departments:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Proiect:	Watershed Misc. Imp's - Hoover Dam Misc. Imp's		
Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	The Righter Co.	\$ 547,229.80	

Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

State of Ohio Debarment

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

OSHA

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

https://www.osha.gov

City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

TAB VII: Notes

Righter Co.	Sunesis	PM's comments:
Tab 1, Part 1C-c: Are there Technical Prequalifi	cations (other than pre-qualification)?	
Are there any? Ma	rked "yes".	This contract has some sewer licensure requirements which were met. No additional prequalifications exist.
Tab 2, Part IIA-a: Statistically Comparable	/Further Documentation Needed:	
26.2% < E.E. Marked "Yes" for now.	Bidder is 18.52% < E.E. Marked "Yes" for now.	Several items were estimated based on the most conservative construction means necessary (instrumentation abandonment and drainage repair). There are more efficient means that the contractor may use to accomplish this work. Accounting for these changes, the bid is 1% off from the engineer's estimate.
Tab 2, Part IIA-f & g: Meeti	ng deadlines/costs:	
# of projects meeting deadlines: 0 out of 3. Marked "Yes" for now. # of projects meeting costs: 1 out of 3. Marked	Only submitted 1 reference; not on schedule, cost was. Marked "Yes" for now.	Cynthia Moorhead worked with Righter on Contract 2069. Cythia would not reject Righter based on this experience. Righter also recently awarded Contract 2145 and 2137. See executed contracts for additional
"Yes" for now.		documentation of Form B7.