PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator Bu	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparen	t Low Bidder:	R. W. Setterlin
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$ 490,359.60

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th			
CIP No.	650260-102011	COMPANY NAME								
			General							
			Temperature							
Project Manager:	Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control							
Engineer's Estimate:	\$245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount								
		\$490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00							
	16.24% -100.00%									

PART IA: F	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSE	OR "NO" FOR NEGATI	VE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES				
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES				
с	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES				
d	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator B	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	R. W. Setterlin
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 490,359.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650260-102011	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
				General				
				Temperature				
Project M		Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control				
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00				
PART IB: F	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES				
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
c	qualified responsib	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade (9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors NA'')	YES	YES				
d	work under which t trade subcontractor	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of he sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed rs are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	YES	YES				
e	subcontractor per c more than one sub (329.20)(h)(5) (If n "NA") FORM B6	re listed and the bidder listed more than one livision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA				
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator B	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparer	t Low Bidder:	R. W. Setterlin
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 490,359.60

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650260-102011	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
			General Temperature				
Project M	anager: Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control				
Engineer	's Estimate: \$245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00				
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES				
b	Bidder acknowledged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE PAGE, page 2	YES	YES				
с	Bidder complied with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	YES	YES				
d	The bid contains no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. $(329.23)(f)(1)(d)$	YES	YES				
е	Bidder added no provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	YES	YES				
f	Bidder submitted a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2 , FORM B3	YES	YES				
g	Bidder did not submit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM B3	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices are materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES				
i	Bid contains no irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
j	Bidder submitted a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) FORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")	NA	NA				
k	Bidder submitted a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) FORM B4 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
I	Bidder has complied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B6	YES	YES				
m	Bid does not contain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it does respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid responds to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator Bu	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparen	t Low Bidder:	R. W. Setterlin
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Initial Appare	nt Low Bid :	\$ 490,359.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650260-102011	COMPANY NAME					
				General				
				Temperature				
Project M	anager:	Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control				
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00				
0	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator Bu	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparer	t Low Bidder:	R. W. Setterlin
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$ 490,359.60

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650260-102011	COMPANY NAME					
			General				
			Temperature				
Project Manager:	Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00				

		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to					
PART ID: Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance contract execution.							
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

Bid Responsivness, Waiver Considerations:	, ,	Continue to Part II	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	R. W. Setterlin	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	\$ 490,359.60	Manually Enter Information

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator B	uilding HVAC\BID RESULTS	Bid Date:	February 7, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Responsive Low I	Bidder (from Tab I):	\$ 490,359.60
Section:	Treatment Engineering	Responsive Low	/ Bid (from Tab I):	R. W. Setterlin

CIP No.	650260-102011	COMPANY NAME					
			General				
			Temperature				
Project Manager:	Holly Boyer	R. W. Setterlin	Control	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 245,068.80	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00	0	0	0	0

Part IIA: 🗧	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	ES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	YES				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
с	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES				

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT:	JPWWTP Generator B	uilding HVAC\BID RESULTS		Bid	Date:	February 7, 2018		
Department/Division: Section:	Public Utilities Treatment Engineering		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II): Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :			\$ 490,359.60 R. W. Setterlin		
CIP No. Project Manager:	650260-102011 Holly Boyer	COMPANY NAME R. W. Setterlin	COMPANY NAME General	COMPANY NAME NA	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 245,068.80	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	
PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 3	29.212 Local Bidder	\$ 490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA	
	IS BID LOCAL?	YES	NO	YES	NO	YES	YES	

CIP NO.	050200-102011				CONFANTINAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Manager:	Holly Boyer		R. W. Setterlin	General	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	ineer's Estimate: \$ 245,068.80		Bid Amount Bid Amount		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
			\$ 490,359.60	\$ 570,000.00	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 329.2	12 Local Bidder						

		IS BID LOCAL?	YES	NO	YES	NO	YES
1	o look up i	f a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's	s list located at	X:\Construction Prequa	alification		
F	ART IIIA:						
		IF <u>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL</u> STOP. Skip data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to T					
	step 1	IF APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTIN above for apparent low bid and bidder inform					

Part IIIB:	Part IIIB:										
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	NA	NA	NA	NA				
step 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	No n/a		NA	NA	NA	NA				
step 4	If step 3 is <u>"yes"</u> , SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?										
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)										

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 490,359.60	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	R.W. Setterlin	Manually Enter Information

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PF	ROJECT:	JP	WWTP Generator Build	ing HVAC\B	ID RES	SULTS	Bid I	Date:	February 7, 2018	
	ent/Division:	Public Utilities	incoving			Evaluated Low Bidder		:		etterlin
Section:		Treatment Eng	ineering		Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :				\$	490,360
CIP No.		650260-102011	L	COMPANY N		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M		Holly Boyer		R. W. Sett		General	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$	245,068.80	Bid Amou		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmenta	I Preference		\$ 490,3	359.60	\$ 570,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
	arent Low Bid:	\$	490,359.60	Apparent Low B	idder:	R.W. S	etterlin			
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmenta	Il Preference				Γ				ſ
step 1			ironmentally preferable" bid? Answer Il other bidder's, input "NA"	YES		YES				
step 2	bid?		ubmit "environmentally preferable"	NA		YES				
step 3	bid, then the apparen		tted an environmentally preterable ead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data Tab 5.							
	If the apparent/evalua bid_proceed to Steps		omit an environmentally preferable							
step 4		ntal preference for each bi w bid, for a maximum of \$	d. It is up to five percent (5%) of the 220,000 per bid.	0.000%	b	16.241%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	or each eligible bid (if 0, th	en no environmental preference was	\$	-	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		ronmental preference, exc se, both claiming EP cano	cept if both claim enviornmental cels it for both	\$ 490,	,359.60	\$ 550,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 490,359.60	Low Bidder:	R. W. Sette	erlin					
		1		1						

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Lo	ow Bidder/Bid:		R. W. Setterlin		\$	490,359.60					
Pr	oject:	JPWW [.]	TP Generator Bui	lding HVAC\BID	RESU	LTS					
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid information regarding performance							he bid and/or histor			
	Bidders Bid	R. W. Setterlin \$ 490,359.60	General Temperature Control \$ 570,000.00	0 \$ -	\$	0	0 \$	- \$			
	Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	16.24%	-100.00%								
	Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder? If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h? If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.										
Bid Gurantee Requirements	Below are the required documen	-	tee type allowed.				I				
	Is the guarantee greater than or eq Did the bidder submit all of the requ		upon the quarentee subm	itted?		YES YES					
				. 20							
	<u>Bid Bond</u> Bond on Citule hand form		Letter of Credit	:		ed/Cashier's Chec					
	Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney		LOC on City's LOC form	1	Drawr	n on a solvant banl	K				
	Most recent surety financial statem	lent									
	Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Ce	ertificate of Compliance									
Contract Compliance	Are all subcontractors contract con If there are not any subcontractors,	•	e the contract can be exe	cuted.		YES					
Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp	Is the corporation foreign or the ind	lividual or partnership a r	non-resident of the State	of Ohio?		NO					
	If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio										
	This is required before the contract	is awarded. "Awarded"	means before the Direct	or accepts/approves th	ne bid						
	http://www.sos.state.oh.us/										
Award recommendation: After	r evaluation of the bids, I recommen	nd the following contra	ctor be awarded the co	ntract for:							
Project Name:	JPWWTP Generator Building	HVAC\BID RESULTS	<u>-</u>								
Recommended Bidder:	R.W.Setterlin		-								
Contract Amount:	\$ 490,359.60										
Evaluator's Name:	Melinda Cunningham										
	0/0/0040										

Evaluation Completion Date:

Melinda Cunningham
2/9/2018

historical

0	
	-
YES	
NO	

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	R. W. Setterlin	\$	490,359.60	
Project:	Project: JPWWTP Generator Building HVAC\BID RESULTS			
Additional Information for Departments: State of Ohio - Ohio Audit	or			
	OI Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"			https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.ht
Federal - System for Awar	•			
This is the link to the Federal Syste	m for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery	," '		https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/
<u>City of Columbus</u>				
Contact the Purchasing Office if yo	u have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.			
State of Ohio Debarment				
This is the link to multiple state age	ncies that lists debarred companies.			http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/De
<u>OSHA</u>				
This is the link to the US Departme	nt of Labor's website for OSHA violations			https://www.osha.gov
City of Columbus Office o	f Prequalifications			
Pre-Qualification Office email:	prequalification@columbus.gov 645-0359			
Pre-Qualification Office phone no:	040-0000			

<u>s.html</u>

M/#1

Debarments.aspx

Notes: