PROJECT:	Westgate East 2 MM	G Elevated Storage Tank	Bid Date:	May 16, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	CB&I Constr.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 5,329,500.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	<b>Caldwell Tanks</b>	<b>Landmark Struc</b>			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00			
		6.73%	3.29%	-100.00%			

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES				
b	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	YES	YES	YES				
С	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>		YES	YES				
d	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storage Tank	Bid Date:	May 16, 2018

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	CB&I Constr.		
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 5,	329,500.00	

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc			
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00			
PART IB: R	esponsiveness Cri	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSE	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
a		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1) FORM	YES	YES	YES			
b	licensed construction	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors are on trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM B6 de subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
С	qualified responsib	bcontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 19.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	YES	NA	YES			
d	work under which t	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed rs are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	YES	YES	YES			
e	subcontractor per o more than one sub	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? to licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally (0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

	PROJECT:	Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storage Tank	Bid Date:	May 16, 2018
--	----------	-------------------------------------------	-----------	--------------

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	CB&I Constr.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$ 5,329,500.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma		Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc			
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00			
PART IC: R		iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	VE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
a	referenced code se	omit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	PAGE, page 2	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES	YES	YES			
С		vith technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid contains r invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added <b>no</b> p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not suk FORM B2, FORM	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) B3	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES	YES			
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid (1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j	(329.23)(f)(1)(g) F "NA")	a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	NA	NA	NA			
k		a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
I	Bidder has compli (329.23)(f)(1)(k) F	ied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. ORM B6	YES	NA	YES			
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it does documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid responds to bi (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES			

PROJECT:	Westgate East 2 MM	G Elevated Storage Tank	Bid Date:	May 16, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	CB&I Constr.
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$ 5,329,500.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	MPANY NAME   COMPANY NAME	
Project Ma	ınager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc			
Engineer's	Estimate:	\$5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount				
			\$5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00			
0	Bid is complete. (32	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PRO.	JECT:	Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storage		e Tank	Tank Bid Date:			May 16, 2018	
Department/	/Division:	Public Utilities / Water		Initial Apparei	ent Low Bidder:		CB&I Constr.		
Section:		Distribution		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	5,329,500.00	
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th	
CIP No.		690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Mana	nager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	<b>Caldwell Tanks</b>	<b>Landmark Struc</b>				
Engineer's E	Estimate:	\$5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	
			\$5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00				
	•	iteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Par	t IE will not necessarily		onsive. Bidder must hexecution.	nave a valid contract co	ompliance no. prior to	
a	he "Evaluated Lo t the time of bid.	w Bidder" has an active contract compliance number	YES	YES	NO				
	Bid Res	sponsivness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES				
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I		\$ 5,329,500.00	-	Manually Enter Amou	nt				
	LOW	/EST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	CB&I Constr.	<b></b>	Manually Enter Inform	nation			

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Westgate East 2 MM	Bid Date:		May 16, 2018			
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water		Responsive Low E	CB&I Constr.			
Section:	Distribution		Responsive Low	\$	5,329,500.00		
CIP No.	690537-100001	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 5,252,500.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00	0	0	0

PART IIA:	PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria		YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	SPONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	or "no")
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	NA	NA			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	NA	NA			_
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	NA	_	_	
	Responsibility Score:	8	6	5	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			



TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

Department Section: CIP No. Project Mar		Westgate East 2 MM  Public Utilities / Water  Distribution	G Elevated Stor		Bid [	Date:	May 10	6, 2018
Section: CIP No. Project Mar		,		Evaluated Low Bidde				
CIP No. Project Mar		Distribution		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II): CB&I Con				
Project Mar				Evaluated Low Bid	(from Tabs I and II) :		\$	5,329,500.00
Project Mar		690537-100001	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
	inager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc	NA	NA	NA
	Engineer's Estimate: \$ 5,252		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
	(-1)()		\$ 5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 329.	9.(01)(u) and 329.21	2 Local Bidder						
		IS BID LOCAL?	NO	NO	NO			
To look up if a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's list located at				X:\Construction Prequa	lification			
PART IIIA:								
		<u>ow bid in part ii <b>IS</b> local</u> STOP. Skip						
		data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TA	AB IV.					
step 1								
step i	IF <u>APPARENT L</u>	OW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINU	JE TO TO STEP 2 (see					
		above for apparent low bid and bidder information						
				_				
Part IIIB:								
step 2	Percentage differend	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	6.729%	10.237%	NA	NA	NA
	Is amount in prior ste BID?	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW	YES	NO	NO	NA	NA	NA
If	If step 3 is "yes", S	EE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.						
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLL	OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO DNS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
	S T GODE SEGIN	SHO SENETE (INDIGNITE II 1947):						
		MOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO						
(5	(\$0)							
Part IIIC:				]				
step 6 F	REVISED LOW	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 5,329,500.00		Manually Enter Amount	t		
	DE1///CED   O1//	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	CB&I Constr.	Manually Enter Information				

**TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference** 

	201505						51.15			
PR	ROJECT:		Westgate East 2 MMG E	levated Sto	orage Ta	Fank Bid Date:		Date:	May 1	6, 2018
Department/Division: Public Utilities / Water			Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):				CB&I Constr.			
Section: Distribution				Evaluated Low Bid (f	rom Tabs I, II and III):		\$	5,329,500		
CIP No.		690537-100001		COMPANY	NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager	Phil Schmidt, P.		CB&I Co		Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc	NA	NA	NA
	s Estimate:	\$	5,252,500.00	Bid Amo		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
g	<u> </u>	1 *	0,202,000.00		,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	1 1 1 1	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmental									
Арра	arent Low Bid:	\$	5,329,500.00	Apparent Low	Bidder:	CB&I	Constr.			
PART IV: 32	29.(17) Environmental	Preference								
step 1	Did apparent/evaluate	d low bidder submit "envi	ronmentally preferable" bid? Answer other bidder's, input "NA"	NO		NA	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent bid?	low bidder, did bidder s	ubmit "environmentally preferable"	NA		NO	YES			
step 3	bid, then the apparent in Steps 4-6, complete	/evaluated low bidder is le e Step 7, and proceed to 1 ted low bidder did not sub	ted an environmentally preferable and bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data ab 5. mit an environmentally preferable							
step 4		tal preference for each bio v bid, for a maximum of \$.	d. It is up to five percent (5%) of the 20,000 per bid.	0.000	%	6.729%	10.237%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	r each eligible bid (if 0, the	en no environmental preference was	\$	-	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, exc se, both claiming EP canc	ept if both claim enviornmental els it for both	\$ 5,32	9,500.00	\$ 5,668,100.00	\$ 5,855,100.00	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 5,329,500.00	Low Bidder:	CB&I Co	nstr.					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

#### TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	CB&I Constr.	\$ 5,329,500.00
Project:	Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storage	Tank

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	CB&I Constr.	Caldwell Tanks	Landmark Struc	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 5,329,500.00	\$ 5,688,100.00	\$ 5,875,100.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and						
Next Highest Bid	6.73%	3.29%	-100.00%			

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, q, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?

YES YES

Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form

Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Certified/Cashier's Check

Drawn on a solvant bank

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

YES

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity,

Letter of Credit

LOC on City's LOC form

or both, brought in the State of Ohio

YES

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storage Tank

Recommended Bidder: CB& I Constructors

Contract Amount: \$ 5,329,500.00

Evaluator's Name: Missy Smith
Evaluation Completion Date: 5/23/2018

Additional Information for Departments:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Proiect:	Westgate East 2 MMG Elevated Storag	e Tank
Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	CB&I Constr.	\$ 5,329,500.00

## Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

### City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

## State of Ohio Debarment

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies.

http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

### OSHA

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations

https://www.osha.gov

### City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications

Pre-Qualification Office email: <a href="mailto:prequalification@columbus.gov">prequalification@columbus.gov</a>

Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

### **TAB VII: Notes**

# **Overall bid questions:**

1. PM, SP-7 requires the contractor to be an elevated storage tank fabricator/builder meeting the experience requirements of Technical Specification Section 33 16 00, 1.02.D.2. Do I need to evaluate this or will it be done by a

(IC-c) firm?

I have evaluated this and confirmed that CB&I Constructors meets this requirement. -PAS

**PM's Responses:** 

All 3 bidders meet the min. requirements listed in the technical specifications.

(IC-c) Are there any other technical pre-qualifications / requirements / specifications?

(IIA-f) 1. PM, are you ok with the deadlines submitted by CB&I Constructors?

Yes

## **Caldwell Tanks:**

Note: Listed G & G Enterprises for Tapper's license but they are on list.

(IB-c & HVAC sub, Les Love Heating, Cooling, & Plumbing, not Prequalified. Proline Electric is. Marked "NA" since

IC-l) one is prequalified.

(IIA-

f:g) Deadlines/costs not evaluated. Marked "NA".

## **Landmark Structures:**

Note: No City Tapper's license but sub, Downing Construction, has one.

(IIA- Deadlines/costs not evaluated. Marked "NA". (did not submit deadlines/cost for evaluation, just general

f:g) statement)

(IIA-h) Several projects in progress. Marked "NA".