

BID TABULATION  
FEM 1401.4  
ELEVATOR MAINTENANCE SERVICES FOR DPU FACILITIES

Bidders Name:	Fujitec America, Inc.	Gable Elevator Inc.	Abell Elevator Service Company dba/ Oracle Elevator Company
Bidders Address:	7258 Innovation Way Mason, Ohio 45040	1509 Blatt Blvd. Suite 2201 Gahanna, Ohio 43230	771 Dearborn Park Lane Worthington, Ohio 43085
	Company address does not agree with vendor registration in DAX		
Contact Name and Phone number:	Brent Richards, 614-421-8623	Chris Riedel, 216-533-4322	Alex McIntire
Email:	<a href="mailto:brichards@fujitecamerica.com">brichards@fujitecamerica.com</a>	<a href="mailto:chris@gableelevator.com">chris@gableelevator.com</a>	<a href="mailto:alex.mcintire@oracleelevator.com">alex.mcintire@oracleelevator.com</a>
COC Contract Compliance Number (CCN):	cc001627 Vendor Account supplied by Contractor instead of Contract Compliance Number 222190686	026941 Vendor Account supplied by Contractor instead of Contract Compliance Number 341669866	cc001104 Vendor Account supplied by Contractor instead of Contract Compliance Number 201968406
CCN expiration/status:	3/21/19 MAJ	8/31/2020 MAJ	1/11/2020 MAJ
Form 1 - Contract Compliance No.? (page 6)	Yes	Yes	Yes
If no, has CCN been submitted on line? (page 6)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Form 2 - Any unsatisfactory judgments in regards to Fair Labor Standards Act? (page 7)	No	No	No
Any unsatisfactory judgments in regards to Unemployment Compensation Laws? (page 7)	No	No	No
Any unsatisfactory judgments in regards to Worker's Comp. Laws? (page 7)	No	No	No
Noncompliance with Affirmative Action? (page 8)	No	No	No
Qualify for BWC? (page 9)	YES 0.85	Yes 0.81	Yes 0.52
Bidder will provide financial records? (page 9)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Form 3 - Any OSHA judgements? (page 10)	No	No	No
Health & Safety Plan? (page 10)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provide City with copy of Safety Plan? (page 10)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provide City with copy of OSHA log? (page 10)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Any EPA violations? (page 11)	No	No	No
Form 4 - Has bidder been debarred? (page 12)	No	No	No
Form 5 - Not used			
Form 6 - Project Manager Experience & Resources? (page 14)	Yes, Branch Manager and Superintendant have the required experience - 12, and 13 years respectively. Company has the following resources: None listed	Yes, Project Manager and Lead technician have the required experience - 20+ years. Company has the following resources: None listed	Yes, General Manager and Field Operations Manager have the required experience - 20, and 16 years respectively. Company has the following resources: None listed
Form 7 - Project Experience? (page 15)	Yes, COC Central Police Station - 4 elevators/ month COC 77 N. Front St- 4 elevators/ month COC City Hall - 3 elevators/ month	Yes, Royal York Apartments - 3 elevators/ quarter Honda R&D Americas- 20 elevators/ month UHaul - 5 elevators restoration	Yes, DSCC - 20 elevators/ monthly DAS - 80+ elevators/ month Latitude Five 25 - 4 elevators + restoration
Spoke to references?	No, this company has worked for the Division previously and the current project manager Monica Powell is familiar with their ability to complete the work.	No, highest bid.	No, this company has worked for the Division previously and the current project manager Monica Powell is familiar with their ability to complete the work.
Form 8 - Availability? (page 18)	Current Workload: Ohio State University, 120 elevators/month, ongoing contract COC Dept of Finance, 34 elevators/month, ongoing contract Lazarus, 22 elevators/month, ongoing contract	Current Workload: STRS Freight Elevator Modernization, 1 elevators, ongoing contract Ohio Dept of Corrections Elevator Modernization , 1 elevators, ongoing contract UHaul Elevator modernization, 5 elevators, ongoing contract	Current Workload: 101 East Town St, modernization of 2 elevators
Form 9 - Does the bidder meet the definition of Local Bidder? (page 19)	No	No	Yes
Does the Bidder have a Local Workforce?	No	Yes	Yes
Form 10 - Environmental Preferable Bidder? (page 20)	No	No	No
Does bidder documentation meet guidelines stated in bid book? (Y/N)	No	No	No
Difference versus lowest bidder (%)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Difference versus lowest bidder (\$)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Does bidder receive environmental preference (Y/N)? Mark "Yes" if bid is within 5% AND less than \$20,000, of the lowest bid.	N/A	N/A	N/A
Contractor current with all COC income taxes? (page 22)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non Collusion statement affirmation? (page 23)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Authorization for signature? (page 24)	Yes	Yes	Yes, form states that individual that will sign the proposal is Alex McIntire
Proposal Affidavit? (page 25)	Yes	Yes	Yes, but affidavit is signed by Alex McIntire.
Proposal Names and addresses of all parties(pages 26,27)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Addendum Acknowledgement (page 28)	N/A	N/A	N/A
Bid Schedule: (page 29)			
Yearly Maintenance Sevices for SWWTP: (Labor/Materials/Total)	\$16,800.00/ \$0.00/ \$16,800.00	\$45,593.00/ \$9,281.00/ \$54,874.00	\$11,283.36/ \$594.00/ \$11,877.36
Yearly Maintenance Sevices for JPWWTP: (Labor/Materials/Total)	\$2,700.00/ \$0.00/ \$2,700.00	\$4,241.00/ \$1,011.00/ \$5,252.00	\$997.50/ \$52.50/ \$1,050.00
Yearly Maintenance Sevices for SMOC: (Labor/Materials/Total)	\$1,500.00/ \$0.00/ \$1,500.00	\$4,241.00/ \$1,011.00/ \$5,252.00	\$1,681.50/ \$88.50/ \$1,770.00
Allowance/ Contingency (Labor/Materials/Total)	\$25,000.00/ \$35,000.00/ \$60,000.00	\$25,000.00/ \$35,000.00/ \$60,000.00	\$25,000.00/ \$35,000.00/ \$60,000.00
Total (Labor/ Materials/ Total)	\$46,000.00/ \$35,000.00/ <b>\$81,000.00</b>	\$79,074.00/ <b>\$46,303.00/ \$125,377.00</b>	\$38,962.36/ \$35,735.00/ <b>\$74,697.36</b>
Numbers in red have been corrected by City's Project Manager * = mathematical correction			
Proposal Signature (page 30)	YES	YES	Yes, but the proposal is signed by Greg Burnett.
RANKING (INCLUDING ALL CREDITS AND EVALUATION FACTORS):	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>
AWARD RECOMMENDATION:			On 9/6/18, Sarah Harrell (City Attorney) was contacted about the discrepancy between who signed the Proposal (page 30) and the individual listed on the Authorization for Signaturate form (page 24). On 9/7/18, the City Attorney stated that there is not an issue with the bid since the individual signing the Proposal is an officer of the company and does not require a signature affidavit. Therefore, I recommend that the bid be awarded to the lowest, most responsible, most responsive bidder - Oracle Elevator Company.