Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations Effective 2/22/2017

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code section 329 as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Here is a link to City Code <u>Columbus City Code</u>

2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.

3. If you have questions about using the spreadsheet, contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.

4. If you print the workbook in its entirety from the print screen as opposed to printing each worksheet separately ("active sheets"), you will print this page and the evaluation will begin on page 2 and go through page 13. If you print each workbook separately, the page numbering is different.

version:2/22/2017				
PROJECT:	ntonville 1, Overbrook/ Chatha	m & Lateral Lining - Clintonville 1, C	Bid Date:	August 1, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparent Lov	v Bidder:	BLD Services, LLC
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Initial Apparent Lo	ow Bid :	\$ 2,974,061.68

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650871-110175 & 650872-11017	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Mark Timbrook	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,238,184.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57				
		22.61%	-100.00%				

Part IA: I	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	Yes				
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	Yes				
c	date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible.	YES	Yes				
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	Yes				
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	Yes				
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	Yes				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

version:2/22/2017	
-------------------	--

PROJECT:	ntonville 1, Overbrook/ Chatham & Lateral Lining - Clintonville 1, C Bid Date:		Bid Date:	August 1, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparent Lo	w Bidder:	BLD Services, LLC
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Initial Apparent I	.ow Bid :	\$ 2,974,061.68

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650871-110175 & 650872-11017	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Mark Timbrook	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.				
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 4,238,184.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57				
PART IB: R	esponsiveness Cri	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES				
b	are licensed constru	e listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	YES				
с	qualified responsibl	becontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors IA ")	NA	YES				
d	work under which th	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	YES	YES				
e	subcontractor per d more than one sub (329.20)(h)(5) (If n "NA") FORM B5	e listed and the bidder listed more than one ivision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	YES				
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction is are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade e listed, enter "NA")	NA	YES				
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or /. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	ntonville 1, Overbrook/ Chatham & Lateral Lining - Clintonville 1, C Bid Date:			August 1, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparent Lo	w Bidder:	BLD Services, LLC
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Initial Apparent L	ow Bid :	\$ 2,974,061.68

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		650871-110175 & 650872-11017	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Mark Timbrook	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.				
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$ 4,238,184.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57				
		teria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" FC	OR POSITIVE RESPONSE	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	VE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а		mit more than one bid for same work. (See ction for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES				
b	Bidder acknowledg	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
с	requirements/specif (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	ith technical pre-qualification fication requirements where applicable.	YES	YES				
d	The bid contains n invitation for bid. (32	o conditions or qualifications not provided in the 29.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES				
е	Bidder added no pr (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	ovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES				
f	Bidder submitted a	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES				
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2	mit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices are mate	rially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES				
i		gularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid (1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if)(1)(g) FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an ')	YES	YES				
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	NA	NA				
I		ed with section 329.20(h) regarding 9.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5	YES	YES				
m		in alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid responds to bid (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	d documents in all material respects.	YES	YES				
0	Bid is complete. (32	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

version:2/22/2017				
PROJECT:	ntonville 1, Overbrook/ Chatha	m & Lateral Lining - Clintonville 1, C	Bid Date:	August 1, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparent Low	Bidder:	BLD Services, LLC
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Initial Apparent Lov	v Bid :	\$ 2,974,061.68

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	650871-110175 & 650872-11017	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Mark Timbrook	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,238,184.50	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57				

PART ID:	Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance	A "no" answer in Pa	rt IE will not necessar	ily render a bid non-res contract	ponsive. Bidder must execution.	have a valid contract c	ompliance no. prior to
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES				
	Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office			
	Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 2,974,061.68	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	BLD Services, LLC	Manually Enter Information

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	intonville 1, Overbrook/ Chatha	n & Lateral Lining - Clintonville 1, O	Bid Date:	August 1, 2018
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Responsive Low Bidder (fr	om Tab I):	BLD Services, LLC
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Responsive Low Bid (from	m Tab I):	\$ 2,974,061.68

CIP No.	650871-110175 & 650872-11017		COMPA	OMPANY NAME COMPANY NAME C		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Manager:	Mark Timbrook		BLD Sei	rvices, LLC	Mus	son Bros. Inc.	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$	4,238,184.50	Initial Bid Amount		Initial Bid Amount		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$2,	,974,061.68	\$	3,646,568.57	0	0	0	0

PART IIA: 3	29.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "'	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
с	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES				
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES	YES		

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT:	nville 1, Overbrook/ Chatha	am & Lateral Lining - Clintonville	Bid Date:	Aug
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Evaluated Low Bidde	er (from Tabs I and II):	BLD S
Section:	Sewers & Drains	Evaluated Low Bid	(from Tabs I and II) :	\$

CIP No.	650871-1101	75 & 650872-1101	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAM
Project Manager:	Mark Timbro	ok	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,238,184.50		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
			\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57	0	0	NA
PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 329.	212 Local Bidder						

	IS BID LOCAL?	NO	NO		
To look up i	f a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's	ist located at	X:\Construction Prequa	<u>lification</u>	
PART IIIA:					
step 1	IF <u>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL</u> STOP. Skip data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to T IF <u>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL</u> , CONTINU above for apparent low bid and bidder inform	AB IV. JE TO TO STEP 2 (see			

Part IIIB:	Part IIIB:									
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	22.612%	NA	NA	NA	NA			
step 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA	NA			
step 4	If <i>step 3</i> is <u>"yes"</u> , SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?									
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)	\$ -	\$-	\$-	\$-					

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 2,974,061.68	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	BLD Services, LLC	Manually Enter Information

gust 1, 2018								
Serv	vices, LLC							
	2,974,061.68							
ME	COMPANY NAME							
	NA							
t	Bid Amount							
	NA							

PF	ROJECT:	ի - Clintonville 1, Օve	erbrook/ Chatham & I	Lateral Lining - Cli	ntonville 1, Overb	Bid	Date:	August 1, 2018	
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities			Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III)	:	BLD Services, LLC	
Section:		Sewers & Drains			Evaluated Low Bid (fi	rom Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	2,974,062
CIP No.		650871-110175 & 6	50872-110175	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M		Mark Timbrook		BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$	4,238,184.50	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
PART IV: 3	329.(17) Environmen	ntal Preference		\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,646,568.57	0	0	NA	NA
	arent Low Bid:	\$	2,974,061.68	Apparent Low Bidder:	BLD Serv	rices, LLC			
		- I ·	· ·		1	•			
ART IV: 3	329.(17) Environmen	ntal Preference						1	
step 1		ated low bidder submit "environme apparent low bidder. For all other		NO	NA	NA	NA		
step 2	Excluding apparer	nt low bidder, did bidder submit	"environmentally preferable" bid?		NO	NO	YES		
step 3	then the apparent/e	evaluated low bidder submitted an valuated low bidder is lead bidder e Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5.							
	If the apparent/evalue proceed to Steps 6	uated low bidder did not submit an and 7.	environmentally preferable bid,						
step 4		ental preference for each bid. It is low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000	,	0.000%	22.612%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount applied).	for each eligible bid (if 0, then no e	environmental preference was	\$-	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		vironmental preference, except if b case, both claiming EP cancels it fo		\$ 2,974,061.68	\$ 3,626,568.57	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amoun	t: \$ 2,974,061.68	Low Bidder:	BLD Services, LLC					
				•					

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Lo	ow Bidder/Bid:		BLD Services, LLC	, ,	\$	2,974,061.68]	
Pro	oject:	lintonville 1, Ove	rbrook/ Chathan	n & Lateral Linir	ng - Cli	ntonville 1, C)	
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid information regarding performance							oid and/or histor
	Bidders	BLD Services, LLC	Musson Bros. Inc.	0		0	0	
	Bid Percent Difference btwn Bid and <mark>Next Highest</mark> Bid		\$ 3,646,568.57 -100.00%	\$-	\$	-	\$	- \$
	Is any bidder 10% or more below If yes, does the lower bidder's Ta If yes, low bidder is "responsible" u	AB 2 evaluation have 'y	es' answers for questi	ons c, d, g, and h?				Y Y
Bid Guarantee Requirements	Below are the required document Is the guarantee greater than or equilating Did the bidder submit all of the required Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statem Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Co	ual to 10% of the bid? uired documents based u		itted?		YES YES]	
Contract Compliance Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp	Are all subcontractors contract con If there are not any subcontractors Is the corporation foreign or the ind	npliant? Required before , choose N/A.				YES]	
	If yes, business entity shall register service of summons, in any action This is required before the contract http://www.sos.state.oh.us/	in law or equity, or both,	brought in the State of O	hio.	ne bid	YES		
Award recommendation: After Project Name: Recommended Bidder: Contract Amount:	evaluation of the bids, I recommend Downspout Redirection - Clin BLD Services LLC \$ 2,974,061.68	•			e 1, Ove	erbrook/ Chatham	n Project	
Evaluator's Name: Evaluation Completion Date:	Mike Pettiford 8/2/2018							

nistorical

0	
	-
YES	
YES	

Tab 5: 9 of 18

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	spout Redirection and Lateral Lining Clintonville 1
Department/Division:	Public Utilities

Department/Division.	rubiic Otilities	
Section:	Sewers and Drains	

		Bids from Appar	ent low	est to highest	:	Apparent Low
CIP No.		650871-110	175 /	650872-1 1	L 017 !	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager: Engineer's Estimate:		Mark Timbrook \$ 4,238,184.50		BLD Services LLC Initial Bid Amount \$ 2,261,588.73		
	_			_	_	22.61%
Responsiveness Crit	eria, WPCLF/\	VSRLA Complianc	e			A "NO" answer will not information submitted affect project schedule
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form			Yes		
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form			Yes		
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor			Yes		
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4			Yes		
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.3% MBE <u>and</u> 1.0% WBE , so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE particiaption has been provided.			Yes		
FORM B14	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form		Yes			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 2,261,588.73
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	BLD Services LLC

TAB VI: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are departmen

Please follow the format of the previous tabs. If you need assistance, please contact Suzanna Gu

Overbrook / Cha	Bid Date:		August 1, 2018		
Initial Apparent Low Bidder:		BLD Services LLC			
Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	2,261,588.73		

2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Musson Bros.				
Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
\$ 2,808,241.70				
-100.00%				
t necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required				

prior to contract execution. Delay in providing this information may result in delay of loan award and

Yes		



t specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

ussler or Alex Cofield.

Verify DBE Subcontra	ctors using the following links (in order) and save results found
Search & Verify MBE:	https://eodreporting.oit.ohio.gov//searchMBE.aspx
Search & Verify EDGE:	https://eodreporting.oit.ohio.gov//searchEDGE.aspx
Search & Verify ODOT DBE Database:	http://www.dot.state.oh.us/Divisions/ODI/SDBE/Pages/DBE-Director

Г

<u>ry.aspx</u>

۱.

TAB VII: Notes

On this page, include any notes or clarification from phone calls made. Be sure to include the company you called, who you spoke with, date, time, question asked, outcome of call, and name of person who made the call.

Include any notes or clarifications from research done.

Yes No NA