Instructions for Construction Bid Evaluations Effective 2/22/2017

1. Read and become knowledgeable of the requirements of Columbus City Code section 329 as it pertains to construction advertising, evaluation, and contracting.

Here is a link to City Code Columbus City Code

- 2. Enter information into the cells that are blank and grey. Do not enter info to cells that are blank and white as there may be a formula in that cell.
- 3. If you have questions about using the spreadsheet, contact Suzanna Gussler or Alex Cofield.
- 4. If you print the workbook in its entirety from the print screen as opposed to printing each worksheet separately ("active sheets"), you will print this page and the evaluation will begin on page 2 and go through page 13. If you print each workbook separately, the page numbering is different.

PROJECT:	Summit View Detent	ion Basin Improvements Bid Date:			January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparer	t Low Bidder:	F	acemyer Landscaping
Section:	STORM	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	519,117.18

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Mike Griffiths	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company			
Engineer's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56			
		16.29%	12.73%	-100.00%			

PART IA:	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONSI	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	Yes	Yes	Yes			
c	date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible.	Yes	Yes	Yes			
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
е	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	Yes	Yes	Yes			
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	Yes	Yes	Yes			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Summit View Detent	ion Basin Improvements	Bid Date:	January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparei	nt Low Bidder:	Facemyer Landscaping
Section:	STORM	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 519,117.18

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Mike Griffiths	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company			
	's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
	o Louiniato.		\$ 519,117.18			miliai Bia / modile	mitiai Bia / imount	militar Bia / mioant
PART IR: R	Responsiveness Cr	iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)				IVE RESPONSE (all "ve	s" answers needed for	responsive hid)
а	The bidder provide	ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			,
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors ruction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
С	qualified responsib	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors	NA	NA	NA			
d	If subcontractors a work under which t	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
е	subcontractor per of more than one sub (329.20)(h)(5) (lf r "NA") FORM B5	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontracto responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 20)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
g	Bidder did not bid	subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Summit View Detent	ion Basin Improvements	Bid Date:		January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Facemyer Landscaping
Section:	STORM	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	519,117.18

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager: Mike Griffiths	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company			
Engineer'	's Estimate:	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56			
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" FO	DR POSITIVE RESPONSE	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	Bidder did not submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowledged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
С	Bidder complied with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid contains no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added no provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not submit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES	YES			
i	Bid contains no irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j	Bidder submitted a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) FORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
k	Bidder submitted a lump sum price if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) FORM B3 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
I	Bidder has complied with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
m	Bid does not contain alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid responds to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			

PROJECT:	Summit View Detent	ion Basin Improvements	Bid Date:		January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	F	acemyer Landscaping
Section:	STORM	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	519,117.18

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Mike Griffiths	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company			
Engineer'	's Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56			
0	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PRO	DJECT:	Summit View Detent	tion Basin Improvements Bid Date:		January 9, 2019			
Departmen	nt/Division:	Public Utilities		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Facemyer I	andscaping
Section:		STORM		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	519,117.18
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	ınager:	Mike Griffiths	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company			
Engineer's	Estimate:		Initial Bid Amount \$ 519,117.18	Initial Bid Amount \$ 603,668.03	Initial Bid Amount \$ 680,530.56	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
a	•	Criteria, Contract Compliance ow Bidder" has an active contract compliance ne of bid.	A "no" answer in Par	t IE will not necessarily YES		oonsive. Bidder must hexecution.	ave a valid contract co	mpliance no. prior to
		sponsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
l		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES			
		OWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 519,117.18		Manually Enter Amou			
L	LOV	VEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Facemyer Landscapin	g		Manually Enter Inforr	nation	

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Summit View Detent	tion Basin Improvements	Bid Date:		January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Responsive Low	Bidder (from Tab I):	Fac	emyer Landscaping
Section:	STORM	Responsive Lov	v Bid (from Tab I):	\$	519,117.18
					-

CIP No.	610792-100003	COMPANY NAME					
			Complete General				
		Facemyer	Construction	Strawser Paving			
Project Manager:	Mike Griffiths	Landscaping	Company	Company	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	-	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56	0	0	0

PART IIA:	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "Y	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6 , SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6 , SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES			
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	8	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			



TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PF	PROJECT: Summit View Detention Basin Improv		vements	Bid [Date:	January 9, 2019		
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Utilities		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II):			Facemyer L	andscaping
Section:		STORM		Evaluated Low Bid	(from Tabs I and II) :		\$	519,117.18
CIP No.		610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
			Facemyer	Complete General Construction	Strawser Paving			
Project M	lanager:	Mike Griffiths	Landscaping	Company	Company	NA	NA	NA
Engineer ¹	's Estimate:	\$ -	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
			\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 3	29.(01)(u) and 329.2	12 Local Bidder						
	IS BID LOCAL?			YES	YES			
To look up	if a hidder is local u	se the Office of Construction Prequalification's lis						
	ii a biaaci is local, t	30 and Omoc of Constitution of Tequalification 5 is	or location at	X:\Construction Prequa	innication			
PART IIIA:	IE ADDADENS	LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL STOP. S	kin stone 2.5 and					
		ter data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to	•					
	en	ter data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to	TADIV.					
step 1	LE ADDADENT LA	OW DID IN DADT II IS NOT LOCAL CONTINI	IF TO TO STED 2 (acc					
	APPARENT LO	DW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINUTION above for apparent low bid and bidder informations.	,					
		above to apparent for the and stader informs	auony					
Part IIIB:								
step 2	Percentage differen	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	16.287%	31.094%	NA	NA	NA
step 3	Is amount in prior st BID?	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW	YES	NO	NO	NA	NA	NA
	If step 3 is <u>"yes"</u> , S	EE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.						
step 4	EOU OW DDOOED	DID AGENCY						
		URES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE !! (INDICATE IF NA)?						
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						
step 5	(\$0)	MOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO						
	<u> </u>							
Part IIIC:								
step 6	REVISED LOW	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:		Manually Enter Amount				
step 7	REVISED LOW	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:			Manually Enter Informa	ation		

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PROJECT:	Summit View Detention B	Basin Improvements	Bid Date:	January 9, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Utilities	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):		0
Section:	STORM	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :		\$ -

CIP No.	610792-100003	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
			Complete General				
		Facemyer	Construction	Strawser Paving			
Project Manager:	Mike Griffiths	Landscaping	Company	Company	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	-	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56	NA	NA	NA
PART IV: 329.(17) Environment	al Preference						
Apparent Low Bid:	\$ -	Apparent Low Bidder:	\$	-			

PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmental Preference						
step 1	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer "YES" or "NO" for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input "NA"	YES	YES	YES			
step 2	Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	YES	YES			
step 3	step 3 STOP. If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5. If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.						
step 4	step 4 Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non-environmental low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.		#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 6	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim environmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount: \$ 519,117.18 Low Bidder:	Facemyer Landscaping					

Manually Enter Amount Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Facemyer Landscaping	\$	519,117.18
Project:	Summit View Detention Basin Improvements		S

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Facemyer Landscaping	Complete General Construction Company	Strawser Paving Company	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 519,117.18	\$ 603,668.03	\$ 680,530.56	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid		12.73%	-100.00%			

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for guestions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

YES YES

YES

NO

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: Summit View Detention Basin Improvements

Recommended Bidder: Facemyer Landscaping Company
Contract Amount: \$ 519,117.58

Evaluator's Name: Jeffrey Deep/MC
Evaluation Completion Date: 1/10/2019

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	

Department/Division:	Public Utilities	
Section:		

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low
CIP No.		COMPANY NAME
		Facemyer
		Landscaping
Project Manage	er:	Company
Engineer's Esti	imate:	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 519,117.18
		16.29%
Responsiveness (Criteria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance	A "NO" answer will no information submitted affect project schedule
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form	Yes
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form	Yes
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	Yes
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4	Yes
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.3% MBE and 1.0% WBE , so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE participation has been provided	Yes

Tab 6: 11 of 17

FORM B14	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 519,117.18
	Facemyer
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	Landscaping
	Company

TAB VI: DEPARTMENT SPECIFIC CRITERIA

Instructions:

If you have additional questions/documents that you require with your bids that are department

Please follow the format of the previous tabs. If you need assistance, please contact Suzanna

	Bid Date:					
Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Facemyer Landscaping Company			
Initial Apparent Low Bid :			\$	519,117.18		
2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th		
COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME		
Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount		
12.73%						
t necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have all forms completed and required prior to contract execution. Delay in providing this information may result in delay of loan award and .						

Manually Enter Amount						

Manually Enter Information

ent specific, please create your own evaluation worksheet here.

Gussler or Alex Cofield.

TAB VII: Notes

On this page, include any notes or clarification from phone calls made. Be sure to include the company you called, who you spoke with, date, time, question asked, outcome of call, and name of person who made the call.

Include any notes or clarifications from research done.

Yes

No

NA