ORD #0946-2019

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	$ 1,889,536.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie				
Engineer's Estimate:	$2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		$1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50				
		21.83%	-100.00%				

PART IA: Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder **is pre-qualified** responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES				
b	The bid **contains** the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) **FORM B1**	YES	YES				
c	The bidder **submitted**, with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) **FORM B9**	YES	YES				
d	There is **no evidence** of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	$ 1,889,536.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie				
Engineer's Estimate:	$2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		$1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50				
PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors (329.20)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	The bidder **provided a list of subcontractors** with bid or indicated there were not any subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1) **FORM B5**	YES	YES				
b	If subcontractors are listed, Bidder **indicated** which subcontractors are licensed construction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) **FORM B6 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")**	NA	NA				
c	If licensed trade subcontractors are listed, the bidder **proposed** pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible licensed trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h) **(If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")**	NA	NA				
d	If subcontractors are listed, the bidder listed the division/section of work under which the sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") **FORM B6**	NA	NA				
e	If subcontractors are listed and the bidder listed more than one subcontractor per division/section of work, did the bidder explain why more than one sub is listed for the division/section of work? (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA") **FORM B6**	NA	NA				
f	Bidder **stated, via affidavit**, that its proposed licensed construction trade subcontractors are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(h)(3) **Form B9 (If no licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")**	NA	NA				
g	Bidder **did not** bid subcontractors who were currently suspended or debarred by the city. (329.20)(h)(4) **(see links on Tab 5)**	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

ORD #0946-2019

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	$ 1,889,536.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie				
Engineer's Estimate:	$2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		$1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50				
PART IC: Responsiveness Criteria, Bid Specific (329.23)		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (all "yes" answers needed for responsive bid)					
a	Bidder **did not** submit more than one bid for same work. (See referenced code section for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES				
b	Bidder **acknowledged** addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) **BID SIGNATURE PAGE, page 2**	NA	NA				
c	Bidder **complied** with technical pre-qualification requirements/specification requirements where applicable. (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	YES	YES				
d	The bid **contains** no conditions or qualifications not provided in the invitation for bid. (329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES				
e	Bidder added **no** provisions reserving right to accept or reject award. (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	YES	YES				
f	Bidder **submitted** a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) **FORM B2, FORM B3**	YES	YES				
g	Bidder **did not submit** an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) **FORM B2, FORM B3**	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices **are** materially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) **FORM B4**	YES	YES				
i	Bid contains **no** irregularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid amount. (329.23)(f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
j	Bidder **submitted** a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. (329.23)(f)(1)(g) **FORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter "NA")**	YES	YES				
k	Bidder **submitted** a lump sum price if **required**. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) **FORM B4 (If lump sum is not an option, enter "NA")**	YES	YES				
l	Bidder **has complied** with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. (329.23)(f)(1)(k) **FORM B6**	YES	YES				
m	Bid **does not** contain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it **does** respond to the bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid **responds** to bid documents in all material respects. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				

ORD #0946-2019

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	$ 1,889,536.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:		Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie				
Engineer's Estimate:		$2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			$1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50				
o	Bid **is** complete. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)		YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

ORD #0946-2019

Construction Contract Evaluation Spreadsheets per Columbus City Code Section 329

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	$ 1,889,536.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie				
Engineer's Estimate:	$2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		$1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50				

PART ID: Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior to contract execution.					
a	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES				

Bid Responsivness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	$ 1,889,536.00	← Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Travco	← Manually Enter Information

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):	$ 1,889,536.00

CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	$ 2,009,573.50	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		$ 1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50	0	0	0	0

PART IIA: 329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria		INPUT "YES" FOR POSITIVE RESPONSE OR "NO" FOR NEGATIVE RESPONSE (1 point for each "yes", 0 for "no")					
a	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). **FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount**	YES	NO				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. **FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources**	YES	YES				
c	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. **FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources**	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. **FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources**	YES	YES				
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. **FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources**	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. **FORM B7**	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. **FORM B7**	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. **FORM B8**	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	7	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES				

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II):	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :	$ 1,889,536.00

CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	$ 2,009,573.50	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		$ 1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50	NA	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 329.(01)(u) and 329.212 Local Bidder							

	IS BID LOCAL?	NO	YES				

To look up if a bidder is local, use the Office of Construction Prequalification's list located at X:\Construction Prequalification

PART IIIA:	
step 1	IF **APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL** STOP. Skip steps 2-5 and enter data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TAB IV. IF **APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL**, CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2 (see above for apparent low bid and bidder information)

Part IIIB:							
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent **NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.**	0.000%	21.826%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 3	Is amount in prior step **WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?**	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 4	If ***step 3*** is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO ($0)						

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	$ 1,889,536.00	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	Travco	Manually Enter Information

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PROJECT:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	Bid Date:	March 20, 2019

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I, II and III):	Travco
Section:	Distribution	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :	$ 1,889,536

CIP No.	690395-100002	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Travco	Conie	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	$ 2,009,573.50	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		$ 1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50	NA	NA	NA	NA
PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference							
Apparent Low Bid:	$ 1,889,536.00	Apparent Low Bidder:	Travco				

PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference								
step 1	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer **"YES"** or **"NO"** for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input **"NA"**	YES	NA				
step 2	**Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder** submit "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	YES				
step 3	STOP. If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5. If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.						
step 4	Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non-environmental low bid, for a maximum of $20,000 per bid.	0.000%	21.826%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).	$ -	$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim enviornmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both	$ 1,889,536.00	$ 2,281,942.50	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount: $ 1,889,536.00 — Low Bidder:	Travco					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Travco	$ 1,889,536.00
Project:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Travco	Conie	0	0	0	0
Bid	$ 1,889,536.00	$ 2,301,942.50	$ -	$ -	$ -	$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	21.83%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder? YES
If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h? YES
If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

Bid Gurantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid? YES
Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted? YES

Bid Bond	Letter of Credit	Certified/Cashier's Check
Bond on City's bond form	LOC on City's LOC form	Drawn on a solvant bank
Surety power of attorney		
Most recent surety financial statement		
Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance		

Contract Compliance

Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed. YES
If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp

Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio? NO

If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio: N/A

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: 2019 Main Line Valve Replacements
Recommended Bidder: Travco Construction, Inc.
Contract Amount: $ 1,889,536.00

Evaluator's Name: Missy Smith
Evaluation Completion Date: 3/22/2019

Additional Information for Departments:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery" https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Travco	$ 1,889,536.00
Project:	2019 Main Line Valve Replacements	

Federal - System for Award Management

This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery" https://www.sam.gov/portal/SAM/#1

City of Columbus

Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.

State of Ohio Debarment

This is the link to multiple state agencies that lists debarred companies. http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx

OSHA

This is the link to the US Department of Labor's website for OSHA violations https://www.osha.gov

City of Columbus Office of Prequalifications

Pre-Qualification Office email: prequalification@columbus.gov
Pre-Qualification Office phone no: 645-0359

TAB VII: Notes

Overall bid questions:		**PM's responses:**
(IC-c):	1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?	Bidder meets the requirements

Conie:

(IIA a):	Statistically Comparable? Marked "No" since they are 21.8% higher than lowest bidder.	
(IIA f-g):	Meet deadlines & costs? Conie only listed Main Line Valve Replacements - Part V contract which is still active; makred "Yes" since PM was ok with them being awarded the 2019 Fire Hydrant Replacements Contract.	No concerns with deadlines and costs