PROJECT:	Bethel Rd. Culv	vert Rehabilitation	Bid Date:	December 4, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Util./Sewers & Drains	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	Municipal Contr.
Section:	Stormwater	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 232,146.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	611700-100000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Grace McInerney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 232,146.00	\$359,333.88				
		54.79%	-100.00%				

PART IA: F	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES				
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES				
С	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES				
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES				
е	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	NA				
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	Bethel Rd. Cul	Bid Date:	December 4, 2019	
Department/Division:	Public Util./Sewers & Drains	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	Municipal Contr.
Section:	Stormwater	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$ 232,146.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		611700-100000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Grace McInerney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete				
	s Estimate:	\$ 296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 232,146.00	\$359,333.88				
PART IB: Responsiveness Criteria, Subcontractors (329.20)			INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for I	responsive bid)
а	•	ad a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES				
b	are licensed constru	le listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	YES				
С	qualified responsibl	bcontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	NA	YES				
d	work under which th	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	NA	YES				
е	subcontractor per d more than one sub	e listed and the bidder listed more than one livision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA				
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction is are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade e listed, enter "NA")	NA	YES				
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

Initial Apparent Low Bid :

\$

232,146.00

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

Stormwater

version:2/22/2017

Section:

PROJECT:	Bethel Rd. Culv	vert Rehabilitation	Bid Date:	December 4, 2019
Department/Division:	Public Htil /Sewers & Drains	Initial Annaren	nt Low Bidder:	Municipal Contr.

		Bids from A	apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		611700-100	000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	lanager:	Grace McIn	erney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete				
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$	296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
				\$ 232,146.00	\$359,333.88				
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Cr	riteria, Bid Specific	(329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		omit more than one bection for full text.) (3	id for same work. (See (29.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES				
b	Bidder acknowled	lged addenda. (329.	23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
С		with technical pre-qualification requirement		YES	YES				
d	The bid contains invitation for bid. (3		ifications not provided in the	YES	YES				
е	Bidder added no p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	provisions reserving r	ight to accept or reject award.	YES	YES				
f	Bidder submitted	a bid guarantee. (32	9.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES				
g	Bidder did not sul FORM B2	bmit an irregular bid	guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices are mat	erially balanced. (32	9.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES				
i		egularities or deviation (329.23)	ons from the bid that affect bid	YES	YES				
j			contract item listed, if required. orice is not an option, enter	YES	YES				
k		a lump sum price if i sum is not an opti	required. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) on, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
1		ied with section 329 29.23)(f)(1)(k) FORI		YES	YES				
m		ain alterations, omiss documents. (329.23	sions, errors, such that it does (f)(1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid responds to b (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all n	naterial respects.	YES	YES				

PROJECT:	Bethel Rd. Cul	Bid Date:	December 4, 2019	
Department/Division:	Public Util./Sewers & Drains	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	Municipal Contr.
Section:	Stormwater	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$ 232,146.00

		Bids from A	pparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		611700-1000	000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Grace McIne	erney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete				
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$	296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
				\$ 232,146.00	\$359,333.88				
0	o Bid is complete. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)		YES	YES					
			BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PR	OJECT:	Bethel Rd. Cul	vert Rehabilitation	1	Bid	Date:	Decemb	er 4, 2019
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Util./Sewers & Drains		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Municip	al Contr.
Section:		Stormwater		Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :		\$	232,146.00
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		611700-100000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Grace McInerney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete				
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$ 296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 232,146.00	\$359,333.88				
2		criteria, Contract Compliance ow Bidder" has an active contract compliance le of bid.	A "no" answer in Par	rt IE will not necessaril		oonsive. Bidder must hexecution.	ave a valid contract co	mpliance no. prior to
		0.210.						
	Bid Res	sponsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office			
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				
	LO	DWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 232,146.00		Manually Enter Amou	int		_
	LOV	VEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Municipal & Contract	ors Sealing Products	Manually Enter Information			

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Bethel Rd. Cul	Bid Date:		December 4, 2019			
Department/Division:	Public Util./Sewers & Drains		Responsive Low B	sidder (from Tab I):		unicipal & Contractors Sealing Produ	
Section:	Stormwater		Responsive Low	Bid (from Tab I):		\$	232,146.00
CIP No.	611700-100000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Grace McInerney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$ 232,146.00	\$ 359,333.88	0	0	0	0

PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES				
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES				

Manually Enter Information

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PROJECT:		Bethel Rd. Cul	vert Rehabilitati	on Bid Date:			December 4, 2019		
Department/Division: Public Util./Sewers & Drains Section: Stormwater		Evaluated Low Bidder (from Tabs I and II): Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I and II) :			unicipal & Contractors Sealing Productions \$ 232,146.00				
CIP No. Project M Engineer	lanager: 's Estimate:	611700-100000 Grace McInerney, PE \$ 296,994.00	COMPANY NAME Municipal Contr. Bid Amount	COMPANY NAME Proshot Concrete Bid Amount	NA Bid Amount	NA Bid Amount	NA Bid Amount	COMPANY NAME NA Bid Amount	
PART III: 3	29.(01)(u) and 329.21	2 Local Bidder	\$ 232,146.00	\$ 359,333.88	NA	NA	NA	NA	
To look up	if a hidder is local	IS BID LOCAL?	NO t located at	NO X:\Construction Pregua	lification				
step 1	step 1 IF <u>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS LOCAL</u> STOP. Skip steps 2-5 and enter data in Steps 6 & 7 and continue to TAB IV. Step 1 IF <u>APPARENT LOW BID IN PART II IS NOT LOCAL</u> , CONTINUE TO TO STEP 2 (see above for apparent low bid and bidder information)								
step 2	Percentage difference	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	54.788%	NA	NA	NA	NA	
step 3	Is amount in prior ste	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW	YES	NO	NA	NA	NA	NA	
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLL	EE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO DNS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?							
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AN (\$0)	MOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO							
Part IIIC:									
step 6	REVISED LOW	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 232,146.00		Manually Enter Amoun	t			
step 7	REVISED LOW	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products	Manually Enter Information					

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PROJECT: Bethel Rd. Culvert Re			ehabilitation		Bid I	Bid Date:		December 4, 2019	
Department/Division: Public Util./Sewers & Drains				Evaluated Low Bidder		unicipal & Contractors Sealing Produ			
Section:		Stormwater			Evaluated Low Bid (fr	om Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	232,146
CIP No.	_	611700-100000		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Grace McInerney,	PF	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete	NA NA	NA NA	NA NA	NA NA
	's Estimate:	\$	296,994.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
Liigilicoi	5 Estimate.	7	250,554.00	\$ 232,146.00		NA NA	NA NA	NA NA	NA NA
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmenta	al Preference		,	,				
Appa	arent Low Bid:	\$	232,146.00	Apparent Low Bidder:	Municipal & Contract	ors Sealing Products			
							•		
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmenta	al Preference							
step 1		ed low bidder submit "environm oparent low bidder. For all other	nentally preferable" bid? Answer er bidder's, input "NA"	NO	NA				
step 2	Excluding apparent	low bidder, did bidder submi	t "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	NO				
step 3	then the apparent/eva		an environmentally preferable bid, er for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps						
	If the apparent/evalua proceed to Steps 6 a		an environmentally preferable bid,						
step 4		ntal preference for each bid. It is d, for a maximum of \$20,000 pe	s up to five percent (5%) of the non- er bid.	0.000%	54.788%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for applied).	or each eligible bid (if 0, then no	environmental preference was	\$ -	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		ronmental preference, except if se, both claiming EP cancels it		\$ 232,146.00	\$ 339,333.88	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount	\$ 232,146.00	Low Bidder:	Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

ORD #0023-2020

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017								
PROJECT: Bethel Rd. Culv		vert Rehabilitation		Bid Date:		December 4, 2019		
Department/Divi	sion: Public Util./Sewers & Drains		Initial Apparen	t Low Bidder:		Municip	al Contr.	
Section:	Stormwater		Initial Appare	ent Low Rid:		\$	_	
ocotion.	otomwater		milai Appare	in Low Bla .		<u> </u>		
	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th	
CIP No.	611700-100000	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
			Proshot					
Project Manager	Grace McInerney, PE	Municipal Contr.	Concrete	\$ -	\$ -			
Engineer's Estin	nate: \$ 296,994.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	
		\$ 232,146.00	\$ 359,333.88	\$ -	\$ -			
		54.79%						
		A "NO" answer will not submitted prior to con-						
Pagnangiyanga C-	itoria WDCI E/WSDI A Compliance	schedule.	Hact execution. Delay	m providing this illio		— — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — —	na anect project	
responsiveness Cri	teria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance							
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification	Yes	Yes					
PORM BT0	Form	163	les					
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and	Yes	Yes					
1 014 211	Other Responsibility Matters Form	ics	ics					
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	Yes	Yes					
	So El 771 cilli o loc o licili cacin proposca cascella acion							
	The "Fusiveted Levy Didder" has accomplated signed and returned							
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4	Yes	Yes					
GOOD FAITH	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of							
EFFORTS	1.3% MBE and 1.0% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith	Yes	NA					
	Efforts to solicit DBE particiaption has been provided.							
	The "Evaluated Low Ridder" has completed signed and returned							
FORM B14	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes	Yes					
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 232,146.00	1.	Manually Entor Ama	ımt			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE DID, TAD I			Manually Enter Amo	unt			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	Municipal &		Manually Enter Infor	mation			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, IND 0	Contractors Sealing Products		ivialiually Effet HITOF	mation			
		Sealing Products	.5					

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products	\$	232,146.00	
Project:	Bethel Rd. Culvert Rehabilitation			

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Municipal Contr.	Proshot Concrete	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 232,146.00	\$ 359,333.88	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid						
and Next Highest Bid	54.79%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

YES YES

YES

NO

N/A

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting

service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: Bethel Rd. Culvert Rehabilitation

Recommended Bidder: Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products

Contract Amount: \$ 232,146.00

Evaluator's Name: M. Smith
Evaluation Completion Date: 12/9/2019

Tab 5: 10 of 11

ORD #0023-2020

TAB VII: Notes

Overall bid questions:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so,

does the lowest bidder meet them?

Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products:

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable.

Hard to tell. 21.8% lower than E.E. but 54.8% lower than next bidder.

PM probably ought to see why so much lower than E.E.

Proshot Concrete:

(IA-e): Signature Affidavit.

Would need revised affidavit. Doesn't mention person's name that

signed the bid. Marked "NA".

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable.

Hard to tell. 21% higher than E.E. and 54.8% higher than lowest bidder. Would need further evaluation in considering awarding.

PM's responses:

Yes. Municipal & Contractors Sealing Products meets the technical requirements.

No further documentation is required because bids are statiscally comparable with the average of the bids being within 0.4% of the Engineer's estimate.

No further documentation is required because bids are statiscally comparable with the average of the bids being within 0.4% of the Engineer's estimate.