PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 202	0 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	Febru	ary 26, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer		UCL	
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	1,493,160.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690477-100016	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		\$1,493,160.00	\$ <mark>1,864,060.88</mark>	\$1,963,998.75			
		24.84%	5.36%	-100.00%			

PART IA: R	esponsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	YES	YES	YES			
	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>	YES	YES	YES			
d	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 202	0 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	F	ebruary 26, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			UCL
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	1,493,160.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100016	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft			
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$1,493,160.00	\$1,864,060.88	\$1,963,998.75			
PART IB: R	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			
b	are licensed constr	re listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors uction trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM</b> <u>trade subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")</u>	NA	NA	NA			
с	qualified responsib	bcontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre- le or provisionally responsible licensed trade 29.20)(h) ( <b>If no licensed trade subcontractors are</b> )	NA	NA	NA			
d	work under which t	re listed, the bidder listed the division/section of he sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no licensed rs are listed, enter "NA") FORM B6	NA	NA	NA			
e	subcontractor per of more than one sub	re listed and the bidder listed more than one division/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? to licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction rs are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 20)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade re listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or y. (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 202	0 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	Feb	ruary 26, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:		UCL
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	1,493,160.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100016	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft			
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$1,493,160.00	\$1,864,060.88	\$1,963,998.75			
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а	referenced code se	mit more than one bid for same work. (See action for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowled PAGE, page 2	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e) BID SIGNATURE	YES	YES	YES			
с	requirements/speci (329.23)(f)(1)(c)	vith technical pre-qualification ification requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid <b>contains</b> r invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 329.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added <b>no</b> p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a B3	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2, FORM	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2, FORM	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) B3	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B4	YES	YES	YES			
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid )(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j	(329.23)(f)(1)(g) F "NA")	a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B4 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES			
k		a lump sum price if <b>required</b> . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
I		ied with section 329.20(h) regarding 29.23)(f)(1)(k) FORM B6	YES	YES	YES			
m		ain alterations, ommissions, errors, such that it ne bid documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid <b>responds</b> to bi (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES			

PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 202	20 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	Febru	ary 26, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer		UCL	
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	1,493,160.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690477-100016	COMPANY NAME					
Project N	lanager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft			
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$1,493,160.00	\$1,864,060.88	\$1,963,998.75			
o	Bid is complete. (3	329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 202	20 Painting Improvements	Bid Date:	Fel	bruary 26, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			UCL
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	1,493,160.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690477-100016	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$1,493,160.00	\$1,864,060.88	\$1,963,998.75			

		A "no" answer in Part IE will not necessarily render a bid non-responsive. Bidder must have a valid contract compliance no. prior				mpliance no. prior to	
PART ID: I	Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance	contract execution.					
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES	YES			

	1 /	1 7	Continue to Part II	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office
Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 1,493,160.00	 Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	UCL	 Manually Enter Information

## TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Summitview Tank 20	O Painting Improvements Bid Date:				ting Improvements Bid Date: February 26, 2020			
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water		Responsive Low I	U	CL				
Section:	Distribution		Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):				1,493,160.00		
CIP No.	690477-100016	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME		
Project Manager:	Phil Schmidt, P.E.	UCL	UCL Clearcreek Am. Suncraft NA			NA	NA		
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 1,500,175.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount Initial Bid Amount Initial Bid Amount Initial Bid Amount				Initial Bid Amount		

1,864,060.88 \$

1,963,998.75

0

0

0

1,493,160.00 \$

\$

PART IIA:	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	SPONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3- Bid Price and Amount	YES	NA	NA			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
c	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
e	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6, Experience, Comptency & Resources	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES	NA			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES	NA			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES			
	Responsibility Score:	8	7	5	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			

Manually Enter Information

# ORD #0667-2020

#### TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PR	ROJECT:	Su	mmitview Tank 202	2020 Painting Impro			ng Improvements Bid Date:			February 26, 2020		
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Uti	ities / Water			Ev	aluated Low Bidde	r (fro	m Tabs I and II):		UCL	
Section:		Distributio	on			E	valuated Low Bid	from	Tabs I and II) :		\$	1,493,160.00
CIP No.		690477-10	00016	С	OMPANY NAME	C	OMPANY NAME	CC	OMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Phil Schmi	idt, P.E.		UCL		Clearcreek	A	.m. Suncraft	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$	1,500,175.00		Bid Amount	unt Bid Amount Bid		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	
				\$	1,493,160.00	\$	1,864,060.88	\$	1,963,998.75	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 32	29.(01)(u) and 329	212 Local Bidder										
		IS BID LO	CAL?		NO		NO		NO			
To look up i	f a bidder is local,	use the Office of C	onstruction Prequalification's list	t loca	ed at	X:\C	onstruction Pregua	ificat	ion			
PART IIIA:												
	IF APPARENT		TILIS LOCAL STOP. Skip s 6 & 7 and continue to Tr									
step 1	IF <u>APPARENT</u>		RT II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINU arrent low bid and bidder information		``							

Part IIIB:	Part IIIB:								
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	24.840%	31.533%	NA	NA	NA		
step 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	YES	NO	NO	NA	NA	NA		
step 4	If step 3 is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?								
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)								

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 1,493,160.00	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	UCL	Manually Enter Information

### TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PF	ROJECT:	S	ummitview Tank 2020 P	ainting Improvem	ents	Bid Date:		February 26, 2020	
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities	/ Water		Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):		UCL	
Section:		Distribution			Evaluated Low Bid (f	rom Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	1,493,160
CIP No.		690477-100016		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M		Phil Schmidt, P.		UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft	NA	NA	NA
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$	1,500,175.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
	00 (47) E · · · · ·			\$ 1,493,160.00	\$ 1,864,060.88	\$ 1,963,998.75	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmental	S S	1,493,160.00	Apparent Low Bidder:		CL			
Арра	arent Low Bid:	Ş	1,495,160.00	Apparent Low Bloder:	U				
PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmental	Preference							
step 1	Did apparent/evaluate	d low bidder submit "envir	onmentally preferable" bid? Answer other bidder's, input "NA"	NO	NA	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent bid?	low bidder, did bidder su	bmit "environmentally preferable"	NA	NO	NO			
step 3	bid, then the apparent in Steps 4-6, complete	/evaluated low bidder is le e Step 7, and proceed to T ted low bidder did not subl	ed an environmentally preferable ad bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data ab 5. mit an environmentally preferable						
step 4		tal preference for each bid v bid, for a maximum of \$2	. It is up to five percent (5%) of the 20,000 per bid.	0.000%	24.840%	31.533%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for applied).	r each eligible bid (if 0, the	n no environmental preference was	\$-	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, exce se, both claiming EP cance	ept if both claim enviornmental els it for both	\$ 1,493,160.00	\$ 1,844,060.88	\$ 1,943,998.75	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 1,493,160.00	Low Bidder:	UCL					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

# ORD #0667-2020

#### **TAB V. Miscellaneous**

Apparent Lo	ow Bidder/Bid:		UCL		\$ 1,493,160.00			
Pr	oject:	Summ	itview Tank 2020					
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid is d information regarding performance and						e bid and/or hist	orical_
	Bidders	UCL	Clearcreek	Am. Suncraft	0	0		0
	Bid \$ Percent Difference btwn Bid and Next Highest Bid	1,493,160.00 24.84%	\$ 1,864,060.88 5.36%	\$ 1,963,998.75 -100.00%	\$-	\$	- \$	-
	Is any bidder 10% or more below the If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under	evaluation have 'ye	es' answers for question	ns c, d, g, and h?				YES YES
Bid Gurantee Requirements       Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.         Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?       YES         Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarentee submitted?       YES								
	<u>Bid Bond</u> Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statement Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certific	Bond on City's bond form         LOC on City's LOC form         Drawn on a solvant bank           Surety power of attorney         Drawn on a solvant bank         Drawn on a solvant bank						
Contract Compliance Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp	Are all subcontractors contract complia If there are not any subcontractors, cho	ose N/A.			N/A NO	] 1		
	Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio? NO If yes, then did they file with the Secretary of State a power of attorney designating them or their agent or the Secretary of State, as agent, for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid <a href="http://www.sos.state.oh.us/">http://www.sos.state.oh.us/</a>							
Award recommendation: After Project Name: Recommended Bidder: Contract Amount: Evaluator's Name:	evaluation of the bids, I recommend th Summitview Tank 2020 Painting I UCL, Inc. \$ 1,493,160.00 M. Smith	-	tor be awarded the cont	ract for:				

Additional Information for Departments:

Evaluation Completion Date:

State of Ohio - Ohio Auditor

2/28/2020

This is the link to the State of Ohio Auditor's web site to check for "findings for recovery"

https://ohioauditor.gov/findings.html

Pre-Qualification Office phone no:

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	UCL	\$ 1,493,160.00	]				
Project:	Summitview Tank 2020 Painting Ir	Summitview Tank 2020 Painting Improvements					
	Federal - System for Award Management           This is the link to the Federal System for Awards Management site to check for "findings for recovery"         ht						
City of Columbus Contact the Purchasing Office if you	<u>City of Columbus</u> Contact the Purchasing Office if you have a question about the City's list of debarred vendors.						
State of Ohio Debarment This is the link to multiple state age	ncies that lists debarred companies.		http://ofcc.ohio.gov/Resources/Debarments.aspx				
OSHA This is the link to the US Departmen	t of Labor's website for OSHA violations		https://www.osha.gov				
City of Columbus Office of Pre-Qualification Office email:	f Prequalifications prequalification@columbus.gov						

645-0359

# ORD #0667-2020

# TAB VII:Notes

# **Overall bid questions:**

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

# **Clearcreek Coatings:**

(IIA-a): Statistically Comparable:
 Bidder is 24% higher than E.E. and 25% higher than lowest bidder. PM
 would need evaluate pricing if not going with lowest bid. Marked
 "NA" to continue evaluation.

# American Suncraft Co.

- (IIA-a): Statistically Comparable: Bidder is 31% higher than E.E. and 32% higher than lowest bidder. PM would need evaluate pricing if not going with 1st or 2nd lowest bids. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.
- (IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines?

Cannot evaluate. Bid not supply begin/dates or costs. Also listed proejcts with 2019 Finish Dates (are they finished or not?) Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

**PM's responses:** 

Low bidder meets the experience requirements listed in the technical specifications. - PAS