PROJECT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin Clarifier Rehabilitation	Bid Date:	Se	ptember 23, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/Water	Initial Apparei	nt Low Bidder:		Kokosing
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	19,521,350.00

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690278-100005	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Mark Eppich, P.E.	Kokosing	Kenmore				
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 16,824,252.70	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25				
		10.50%	-100.00%				

PART IA: F	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder <b>is pre-qualified</b> responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES				
b	The bid <b>contains</b> the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) <b>FORM B1</b>	YES	YES				
С	The bidder <b>submitted</b> , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) <b>FORM B9</b>	YES	YES				
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES				
е	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	YES				
f	There is <b>no evidence</b> of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES				
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin Clarifier Rehabilitation	Bid Date:	Se	eptember 23, 2020
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/Water	Initial Apparei	nt Low Bidder:		Kokosing
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	19,521,350.00

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690278-100005	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anagor:	Mark Eppich, P.E.	Kokosing	Kenmore	CONFANT NAME	COMPANT NAME	CONFANT NAME	CONFANT NAME
		\$ 16,824,252.70	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
Engineer	s Estimate:	\$ 16,824,252.70		\$ 21,570,644.25	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Big Amount	initial bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 19,521,350.00					
PART IB: F	Responsiveness Crit	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		d a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES				
b	licensed construction	e listed, Bidder <b>indicated</b> which subcontractors are in trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) <b>FORM B5</b> le subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
С	qualified responsible	ocontractors are listed, the bidder <b>proposed</b> pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	YES	YES				
d	work under which th	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	YES	YES				
е	subcontractor per di more than one sub	e listed and the bidder listed more than one ivision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? blicensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA				
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.20	iffidavit, that its proposed licensed construction s are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade e listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES				
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJECT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin Clarifier Rehabilitation	Bid Date:	September 23, 2020		
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/Water	Initial Apparei	nt Low Bidder:		Kokosing	
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	19,521,350.00	

		Bids from Ap	parent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690278-1000	05	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Mark Eppich,	P.E.	Kokosing	Kenmore				
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$	16,824,252.70	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
				\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25				
PART IC: R	esponsiveness Cı	riteria, Bid Specific (32	29.23)	INPUT "YES" FO	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а		omit more than one bid ection for full text.) (329		YES	YES				
b	Bidder acknowled	iged addenda. (329.23	)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES				
С		with technical pre-qualif cification requirements v		YES	YES				
d	The bid <b>contains</b> invitation for bid. (3)		cations not provided in the	YES	YES				
е	Bidder added <b>no</b> p (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	provisions reserving righ	nt to accept or reject award.	YES	YES				
f	Bidder submitted	a bid guarantee. (329.2	23)(f)(1)(i) <b>FORM B2</b>	YES	YES				
g	Bidder did not su FORM B2	bmit an irregular bid gu	uarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES				
h	Bid prices are mat	erially balanced. (329.2	23)(f)(1)(b) <b>FORM B3</b>	YES	YES				
i		regularities or deviation: f)(1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(	s from the bid that affect bid 1)(e)	YES	YES				
j			ntract item listed, if required. ce is not an option, enter	YES	YES				
k		a lump sum price if rec sum is not an option	quired. (329.23)(f)(1)(h) n, enter "NA")	YES	YES				
I	Bidder has compl (329.23)(f)(1)(k) <b>F</b>		(h) regarding subcontractors.	YES	YES				
m		ain alterations, omissio documents. (329.23)(f	ns, errors, such that it <b>does</b> (1)(j)	YES	YES				
n	Bid <b>responds</b> to b (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	id documents in all ma	terial respects.	YES	YES				
0	Bid is complete. (3	329.23)(f)(1)(e)		YES	YES				
			BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE				

PROJEC	CT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin Clarifier Rehab	oilitation	Bid	Date:	September 23, 2020	
Department/Divis	sion:	Public Utilities/Water		Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Kokosing	
Section:		Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :				\$	19,521,350.00
		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	•	590278-100005	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
<b>Project Manager:</b>			Kokosing	Kenmore				
Engineer's Estim	gineer's Estimate: \$ 16,824,252.70		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25				
The "Eva	aluated Low I	eria, Contract Compliance Bidder" has an active contract compliance	A "no" answer in Par	rt IE will not necessarily		oonsive. Bidder must hexecution.	nave a valid contract co	empliance no. prior to
number	at the time of	f bid.						
	Bid Respo	nsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Bid Responsive, Continue to Part II	Waiver Legislation Required to Contract; Contact Fiscal Office			
		Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES				
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I			-	Manually Enter Amou	nt		
	LOWES	ST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	Kokosing		<del></del>	Manually Enter Inform	ation	

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin Clarifier Rehab	oilitation	Bid Date: September 23, 2020				
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/Water		Responsive Low E	Bidder (from Tab I):		Kokosing		
Section:	Distribution		Responsive Low	Bid (from Tab I):		\$	19,521,350.00	
CIP No.	690278-100005	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Manager:	Mark Eppich, P.E.	Kokosing	Kenmore	NA	NA	NA	NA	
Engineer's Estimate:	gineer's Estimate: \$ 16,824,252.70		Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	
		\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25	0	0	0	0	

PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	or "no")
	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others).  FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
С	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES				
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES				
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES				
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	YES				
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES				
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. <b>FORM B8</b>	YES	YES				
	Responsibility Score:	8	8	0	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES				



TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

יותם וווי.	Assessing Lo	car blader								
PF	ROJECT:	DRWP Misc. Imp's - Ba	sin	Clarifier Reh	abilit	tation	Bid I	Date:	Septembe	r 23, 2020
Departme Section:	ent/Division:	Public Utilities/Water Distribution					r (from Tabs I and II): from Tabs I and II) :		Kokosing \$ 19,521,350.00	
PART III: 3	's Estimate: i29.(01)(u) and 329.2 if a bidder is local, u	\$ step	Kokosing Kenmore NA NA NA Bid Amount Bid Amount Bid Amount Bid Amount 19,521,350.00 \$ 21,570,644.25 NA NA NA  YES YES ated at X:\Construction Prequalification  O TO STEP 2 (see				COMPANY NAME  NA  Bid Amount  NA	COMPANY NAME  NA  Bid Amount  NA		
Part IIIB:					•					
step 2	Percentage differen	ce of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.		0.000%		10.498%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 3	Is amount in prior st BID?	ep WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW		YES		NO	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 4	DID AGENCY FOLL	SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE.  OW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO ONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?								
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AI (\$0)	MOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO								
Part IIIC:					]					
step 6	REVISED LOW	BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$	19,521,350.00	¢		Manually Enter Amoun	t		
step 7	REVISED LOW	BIDDER, TAB IIIB:		Kokosing			Manually Enter Informa	ation		

**TAB IV.** Calculating Environmental Preference

Manually Enter Amount

PF	ROJECT:	DR\	WP Misc. Imp's - Basin C	larifier Rehabilitat	ion	Bid I	Date:	Septembe	er 23, 2020
Departme	nt/Division:	Public Utilities/Wa	iter		Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):	:	Kokosing	
Section:		Distribution			Evaluated Low Bid (fr	om Tabs I, II and III) :		\$	19,521,350
CIP No.		690278-100005		COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Mark Eppich, P.E.		Kokosing	Kenmore	NA	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's	s Estimate:	\$	16,824,252.70	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
				\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25	NA	NA	NA	NA
	29.(17) Environmenta								
Арра	arent Low Bid:	\$	19,521,350.00	Apparent Low Bidder:	Koko	osing			
DADT IV. 2	29.(17) Environmenta	I Duefenenee							
step 1	Did apparent/evaluate		entally preferable" bid? Answer	YES	YES				
step 2		,	t "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	NA				
step 3	then the apparent/eva 4-6, complete Step 7, If the apparent/evalua	aluated low bidder is lead bidde and proceed to Tab 5. ated low bidder did not submit a	in environmentally preferable bid, ir for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps in environmentally preferable bid,						
	proceed to Steps 6 ar	nd 7.							
step 4		tal preference for each bid. It is , for a maximum of \$20,000 pe	s up to five percent (5%) of the non- er bid.	0.000%	10.498%	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount fo applied).	r each eligible bid (if 0, then no	environmental preference was	\$ -	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 6		onmental preference, except if se, both claiming EP cancels it		\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,550,644.25	NA	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount:	\$ 19,521,350.00	Low Bidder:	Kokosing					
		•		•					

Manually Enter Information

## TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017				D: 1 D - 1 -				
PROJECT: DRWP Misc. Imp's - Bar		isin Clarifier Rehab	sin Clarifier Rehabilitation		Bid Date:		September 23, 2020	
epartment/Divi	sion: Public Utilities/Water		Initial Apparen	t Low Bidder:		Kokosing		
ection:	Distribution	Initial Appare		nt Low Bid :		\$ -		
	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th	
IP No.	690278-100005	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAM	
roject Manager		Kokosing	Kenmore	Ś -	\$ -	COMI ANT NAME	COMI AITI ITAM	
ngineer's Estim			Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amour	
ingilicoi o Lotili	10,024,232.70	\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25	\$ -	\$ -	mittal Bia Amount	mitiai Bia Amoui	
		10.50%		Y	7			
esponsiveness Cr	iteria, WPCLF/WSRLA Compliance	A "NO" answer will no submitted prior to con schedule.						
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the Contractor Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification Form	Yes	Yes					
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form	Yes	Yes					
FORM B12.2	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed US EPA Form 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	Yes	Yes					
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned US EPA Form 6100-4	Yes	Yes					
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.3% MBE and 1.0% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE particiaption has been provided.	Yes	NA					
FORM B14	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes	Yes					
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I \$ 19,521,350.00 Manually Enter Amount						
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6		Manually Enter Information					

#### TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:	Kokosing	\$ 19,521,350.00		
Project:	Project: DRWP Misc. Imp's - Basin Clarifier Rehabilitation			

Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)

With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.

Bidders	Kokosing	Kenmore	0	0	0	0
Bid	\$ 19,521,350.00	\$ 21,570,644.25	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Percent Difference btwn Bid and						
Next Highest Bid	10.50%	-100.00%				

Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder?

If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h?

If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision.

YES YES

Bid Guarantee Requirements

Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed.

Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid?

Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted?

YES YES

YES

NO

N/A

Bid Bond

Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney

Most recent surety financial statement

Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certificate of Compliance

Contract Compliance Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed.

If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A.

Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio?

If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting  $\frac{1}{2}$ 

service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio.

This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid

http://www.sos.state.oh.us/

Award recommendation: After evaluation of the bids, I recommend the following contractor be awarded the contract for:

Project Name: DRWP Misc. Imp's - Basin Clarifier Rehabilitation

Recommended Bidder: Kokosing Industrial, Inc.

Contract Amount: \$ 19,521,350.00

Evaluator's Name: Missy Smith
Evaluation Completion Date: 9/24/2020

## ORD 2304-2020

#### **TAB VII: Notes**

# **Overall bid questions:**

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so,

does the lowest bidder meet them?

# **Kokosing Industrial:**

(IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines?

Bidder supplied 3 projects that did not meet deadlines or contract costs, however, there were several CO's attached. These were ok'd by the PM on the bid Kokosing won under 690411-100013. Marked "Yes".

(Tab 6): Loan

Note: only had .23% in MBE participation but had GFE.

# **Kenmore Construction:**

(Tab 6): GFE Documentation

Marked "NA" as their paperwork said "N/A; Goals Met"

## PM's responses:

Yes there are and the Apparent Low Bidder has met them