TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24	4-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:		
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	E	lite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :			4,093,246.30

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$4,093,246.30	\$4,369,643.30	\$5,126,865.43			
		6.75%	17.33%	-100.00%			

PART IA: F	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES	YES			
с	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES	YES			
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	YES	NA			
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24	I-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$ 4,093,246.30

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$4,093,246.30	\$4,369,643.30	\$5,126,865.43			
PART IB: R	esponsiveness Cri	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			
b	licensed construction	e listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors are on trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM B5 de subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
с	qualified responsibl	becontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	YES	YES	YES			
d	work under which the	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
e	subcontractor per d more than one sub	e listed and the bidder listed more than one livision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction is are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade e listed, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or . (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24	Bid Date:			
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Appare	nt Low Bidder:		Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :			4,093,246.30

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.			
Engineer	s Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$4,093,246.30	\$4,369,643. <mark>3</mark> 0	\$5,126,865.43			
PART IC: F	Responsiveness Cri	iteria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for I	responsive bid)
а		mit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	YES	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowled	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
с		vith technical pre-qualification fication requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid contains r invitation for bid. (3	no conditions or qualifications not provided in the 29.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added no pr (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2	omit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES	YES			
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid ((1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES			
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
I	Bidder has compli (329.23)(f)(1)(k) F	ed with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. ORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
m		in alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does documents. $(329.23)(f)(1)(j)$	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid responds to bi (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	d documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES			

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24	I-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid:	\$ 4,093,246.30

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME					
Project M	anager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$4,093,246.30	\$4,369,643.30	\$5,126,865.43			
0	Bid is complete. (32	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

TAB I: Assessing Responsiveness

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24	4-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparer	nt Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$ 4,093,246.30

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$4,093,246.30	\$4,369,643.30	\$5,126,865.43			

		A "no" answer in Pa	rt IE will not necessaril	y render a bid non-res	ponsive. Bidder must	have a valid contract c	ompliance no. prior to	
PART ID: I	Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance	contract execution.						
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES	YES				
-								
		Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation	
	Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Continue to Part II	Continue to Part II	Continue to Part II	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	
					Contact Fiscal Office	Contact Fiscal Office	Contact Fiscal Office	
	Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES				
			1					
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 4,093,246.30		Manually Enter Amount				
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I Elite Excavating		Manually Enter Information				

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 2	4-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:	Ja	nuary 0, 1900	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Responsive Low Bidder (from Tab I):			Elite Excavating	
Section:	Distribution	Responsive Low Bid (from Tab I):			4,093,246.30	

CIP No.	690588-100001, CT No. 2230	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 4,093,246.30	\$ 4,369,643.30	\$ 5,126,865.43	0	0	0

PART IIA: 3	29.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0	for "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	NA			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6 , SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6 , SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B7	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	NA	YES			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	NA	YES			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	YES	YES			
	Responsibility Score:	8	6	7	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			



TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PR	OJECT:	Olentangy River R	oad 24	4-Inch Water N	lain (Phase 2)	ain (Phase 2) Bid Date:			January 0, 1900	
Departmei	nt/Division:	Public Utilities / Water			Evaluated Low Bidde	er (from Tabs I and II):		Elite Excavating		
Section:		Distribution			Evaluated Low Bid	(from Tabs I and II) :		\$	4,093,246.30	
CIP No.		690588-100001, CT No. 22	230	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	
Project Ma	inager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.		Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.	NA	NA	NA	
	s Estimate:	\$ 4,075,9	51.00	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	
				\$ 4,093,246.3) \$ 4,369,643.30	\$ 5,126,865.43	NA	NA	NA	
								•		
		IS BID LOCAL?		NO	YES	NO				
Γο look up if	a bidder is local	IS BID LOCAL? , use the Office of Construction Prequalific	ation's list		YES X:\Construction Prequa					
To look up if PART IIIA:	a bidder is local		ation's list							

Part IIIB:							
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	6.753%	25.252%	NA	NA	NA
eton 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	YES	NO	NO	NA	NA	NA
step 4	If step 3 is "yes", SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?						
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)						

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 4,093,246.30	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	Elite Excavating	Manually Enter Information

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24-Inc	Bid Date:	J	January 0, 1900	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):		Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Evaluated Low Bid (fr	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :		

CIP No.	690588-100001, CT No. 2230	0588-100001, CT No. 2230 COMP		COMPANY NAME	C	OMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Evan DiSanto, P.E.		Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands		Trucco Constr.	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 4,075,951.00		Bid Amount	Bid Amount		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$	4,093,246.30	\$ 4,369,643.30	\$	5,126,865.43	NA	NA	NA
PART IV: 329.(17) Environment	PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference								
Apparent Low Bid:	\$ 4,093,246.30	Арр	parent Low Bidder:	Elite Ex	cava	ting			

PART IV: 3	29.(17) Environmental Preference						
step 1	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer "YES" or "NO" for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input "NA"	YES	NA	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	YES	YES			
step 3	STOP. If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5. If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.						
step 4	Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non- environmental low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.	0.000%	6.753%	25.252%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).	\$-	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim environmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both	\$ 4,093,246.30	\$ 4,349,643.30	\$ 5,106,865.43	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount: \$ 4,093,246.30 Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	Olentangy River Road 24-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)	Bid Date:	January 0, 1900

Department/Division:	Public Utilities / Water	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating
Section:	Distribution	Initial Apparent Low Bid :	\$-

	Bids	from Apparent lowest	to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	<mark>690</mark>)588-100001, CT	No. 2230	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager	: Eva	n DiSanto, P.E.		Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.	\$-		
Engineer's Estin	nate: \$	4,	075,951.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
				\$ 4,093,246.30			\$-		
				6.75%	۶ 1 7.33 %	-100.00%			
Responsiveness Cr	iteria, WPCLF/WSRL	A Compliance			ot necessarily render a ntract execution. Dela				
FORM B10	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned			Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B11	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the US EPA Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and Other Responsibility Matters Form			Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B12.2		/ Bidder" has provided a co m 6100-3 from each propos		Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B12.3	The "Evaluated Low US EPA Form 6100	/ Bidder" has completed, sig -4	gned, and returned	Yes	Yes	Yes			
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has NOT met the EPA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Utilization Goals of 1.3% MBE and 1.0% WBE, so documentation of Good Faith Efforts to solicit DBE particiaption has been provided.		zation Goals of of Good Faith	Yes	NA	NA			
FORM B14	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned the American Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form			Yes	Yes	Yes			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 4,093,246.30	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	Elite Excavating	Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Lo	ow Bidder/Bid:		Elite Excavating		\$ 4,093,246.30)	
Project: Olentangy River Road 24-Inch Water Main (Phase 2)							
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid i regarding performance and costs or	etails regarding the bio	and/or historical information				
	Bidders	Elite Excavating	Shelly & Sands	Trucco Constr.	0	0	0
	Bid Percent Difference btwn Bid and <mark>Next Highest</mark> Bid	\$ 4,093,246.30 6.75%	\$ 4,369,643.30 17.33%	\$ 5,126,865.43 -100.00%	\$ -	\$	- \$ -
Is any bidder 10% or more below the next bidder? YE If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB 2 evaluation have 'yes' answers for questions c, d, g, and h? YE If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under this provision. YE							
Bid Guarantee Requirements	ee Requirements Below are the required documents for each bid guarantee type allowed. Is the guarantee greater than or equal to 10% of the bid? YES Did the bidder submit all of the required documents based upon the guarantee submitted? YES						
	Bid Bond Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial stateme Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Cer						
Contract Compliance	Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed. If there are not any subcontractors, choose N/A. Is the corporation foreign or the individual or partnership a non-resident of the State of Ohio? NO						
Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp							
	If yes, business entity shall register with the Ohio Secretary of State's Office for the purpose of accepting service of summons, in any action in law or equity, or both, brought in the State of Ohio. This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid						
	http://www.sos.state.oh.us/						
	evaluation of the bids, I recommend	•		act for:			
•		Water Main (Phase 2	<u>)</u>				
Contract Amount:	\$4,093,246.30						
Evaluator's Name: Evaluation Completion Date:	M. Smith 4/15/2021						
Project Name: Recommended Bidder: Contract Amount: Evaluator's Name:	Olentangy River Road 24-Inch Elite Excavating Co. of Ohio \$4,093,246.30 M. Smith	•					

TAB VII: Notes

Overall bid questions:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

Elite Excavating Co. of Ohio

Notes:

(Tab 6): Loan Rath Builders (EDGE & WBE). Submitted GFE

Shelly & Sands

(IIA-f & g): Meet costs/deadlines? Only submitted 2 projects: 50% met cost/deadlines. Marked "NA" since no add'l CO's listed to evaluate.

Trucco Construction

- (IA-e): Digital ID Randy King = V.P. (see Management Experience)
- (IIA-a): Statistically comparable:
 37% higher than E.E and 25% higher than lowest bidder. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

PM's responses:

Bidder meets the requirements