| General Info | |
|--------------|------------------------------------|
| Number: | 690389-100001, CT No. 2247 |
| Description: | HCWP Basin Concrete Rehabilitation |
| Deadline: | 2021-05-05 19:00:00 UTC |
| | |

| Bids | | | | |
|--------------------------------|------------------|----------------|-------------------------|------------------|
| Business | Bid Total | | Submitted at | Signed by |
| Kokosing Industrial, Inc. | \$23,653,200.00 | | 2021-05-05 18:45:07 UTC | Thomas Muraski |
| Kenmore Construction Co., Inc. | \$28,784,202.00 | | 2021-05-05 18:42:33 UTC | William A. Scala |
| | | *after bid tab | | |
| Bowen Engineering Corporation | \$29,467,188.01 | correction | 2021-05-05 18:30:39 UTC | Scot Evans |

ORD #1276-2021, Division of Water HCWP Basin Concrete Rehabilitation CIP 690389-100001, CT No. 2247 TSS 930 Bid Tabulation, Opened 5/5/21

| Did Tabulation, | | | | | | | | (local) |
|-----------------|--------|--|-------|-------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|
| - | | | | | Engineer's | s Estimate | Kokosing Ind | ustrial, Inc. |
| Ref. # | Item # | | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension |
| | | Hap Cremean Water Plant Concrete | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 1 | Rehabilitation | 1 | LS | \$26,676,960.00 | \$26,676,960.00 | \$18,129,310.00 | \$18,129,310.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 2 | Shallow Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 325 | SF | \$65.00 | \$21,125.00 | \$57.00 | \$18,525.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 3 | Deep Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 725 | SF | \$115.00 | \$83,375.00 | \$68.00 | \$49,300.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 4 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 380 | SF | \$185.00 | \$70,300.00 | \$102.00 | \$38,760.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 5 | Grout Topping Repair | 1,600 | SF | \$90.00 | \$144,000.00 | \$28.00 | \$44,800.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 6 | Deep Concrete Repair - Vertical | 6,660 | SF | \$120.00 | \$799,200.00 | \$79.00 | \$526,140.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 7 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Vertical | 3,925 | SF | \$175.00 | \$686,875.00 | \$124.00 | \$486,700.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 8 | Deep Concrete Repair - Overhead | 525 | SF | \$185.00 | \$97,125.00 | \$102.00 | \$53,550.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 9 | Overhead Concrete Beam Repair | 80 | SF | \$132.00 | \$10,560.00 | \$85.00 | \$6,800.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 10 | Pilaster/Pedestal Repair | 70 | SF | \$155.00 | \$10,850.00 | \$85.00 | \$5,950.00 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 11 | Horizontal | 245 | LBS. | \$37.00 | \$9,065.00 | \$5.00 | \$1,225.00 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - Vertical | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 12 | and Overhead | 235 | LBS. | \$32.00 | \$7,520.00 | \$5.00 | \$1,175.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 13 | Crack Repair Type 1 - Horizontal | 2,190 | LF | \$20.00 | \$43,800.00 | \$17.00 | \$37,230.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 14 | Crack Repair Type 3 - Horizontal | 300 | LF | \$12.00 | \$3,600.00 | \$3.00 | \$900.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 15 | Crack Repair Type A - Vertical | 2,570 | LF | \$85.00 | \$218,450.00 | \$45.00 | \$115,650.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 16 | Crack Repair Type B - Vertical | 485 | LF | \$70.00 | \$33,950.00 | \$62.00 | \$30,070.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 17 | Crack Repair Type C - Vertical | 130 | LF | \$18.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$12.00 | \$1,560.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 18 | Temporary Leak Repair | 275 | LF | \$55.00 | \$15,125.00 | \$62.00 | \$17,050.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 19 | Temporary Post Shore - As Directed | 49 | EA | \$650.00 | \$31,850.00 | \$155.00 | \$7,595.00 |
| | | Temporary Overhead Electric Support - As | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 20 | Directed | 20 | EA | \$1,200.00 | \$24,000.00 | \$760.00 | \$15,200.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 21 | Full Depth Pavement Replacement at Cracks | 435 | LF | \$38.00 | \$16,530.00 | \$146.00 | \$63,510.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.02 | 22 | General Cash Allowance | 1 | LS | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 |
| | | SUBTOTAL: | | | | \$29,066,600.00 | | \$19,711,000.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 23 | CONTINGENCY (20%) | | | | \$5,813,320.00 | | \$3,942,200.00 |
| | | GRAND TOTAL: | | | | \$34,879,920.00 | | \$23,653,200.00 |
| | | % DIFFERENCE FROM ENG'S EST.: | | | | | | -32.2% |
| | | % DIFFERENCE w/LOWEST BIDDER | | | | | | N/A |
| | | Contract Compliance No. | | | | | 47-2946608, 6/1 | 2/21, MAJ, 12309 |

| | | | | Engineer's Estimate | | Kokosing Indu | ustrial, Inc. | |
|--------|--------|-------------|------|---------------------|------------|----------------------|---------------------------|----------------|
| Ref. # | Item # | Description | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension |
| | | | - | | | | Kokosing Industrial, Inc. | |
| | | | | | | | 6235 Westerville Roa | |
| | | | | | | | Westerville, OH, 430 | |
| | | | | | | | Thomas G. Muraski, | President |
| | | | | | | | (614) 212-5700 | |
| | | | | | | | tgm@kokosing.biz | |
| | | | | | | | Chad R. Lampe, V.P. | . – Estimating |
| | | | | | | | crl@kokosing.biz | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | Goals: | MBE = 1.3% | MBE: see below | 2.03 |
| | | | | | Obais. | WBE = 1.0% | WBE: JADCO | 8.62 |
| | | | | | | () DL = 1.070 | | 10.65 |
| | | | | | | | | 10102 |
| | | | | | | | DBE/EDGE: | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | Foundation Steel | |
| | | | | | | | (EDGE) | \$113,500. |
| | | | | | | | Concrete Coring | ¢110,000. |
| | | | | | | | (MBR) | \$316,795. |
| | | | | | | | MVC/Multivista | . , |
| | | | | | | | (MBE) | \$49,890. |
| | | | | | | | · / | \$480,185. |
| | | | | | | | *Also submitted GF | Έ. |

ORD #1276-2021, Division of Water HCWP Basin Concrete Rehabilitation CIP 690389-100001, CT No. 2247 TSS 930 Bid Tabulation, Opened 5/5/21

| | | | | | Engineer's | s Estimate | Kenmore Cons | struction Co. |
|-----------------|--------|--|-------|-------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Ref. # | Item # | Description | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension |
| | | Hap Cremean Water Plant Concrete | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 1 | Rehabilitation | 1 | LS | \$26,676,960.00 | \$26,676,960.00 | \$22,600,000.00 | \$22,600,000.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 2 | Shallow Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 325 | SF | \$65.00 | \$21,125.00 | \$50.00 | \$16,250.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 3 | Deep Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 725 | SF | \$115.00 | \$83,375.00 | \$60.00 | \$43,500.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 4 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 380 | SF | \$185.00 | \$70,300.00 | \$90.00 | \$34,200.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 5 | Grout Topping Repair | 1,600 | SF | \$90.00 | \$144,000.00 | \$25.00 | \$40,000.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 6 | Deep Concrete Repair - Vertical | 6,660 | SF | \$120.00 | \$799,200.00 | \$70.00 | \$466,200.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 7 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Vertical | 3,925 | SF | \$175.00 | \$686,875.00 | \$110.00 | \$431,750.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 8 | Deep Concrete Repair - Overhead | 525 | SF | \$185.00 | \$97,125.00 | \$90.00 | \$47,250.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 9 | Overhead Concrete Beam Repair | 80 | SF | \$132.00 | \$10,560.00 | \$75.00 | \$6,000.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 10 | Pilaster/Pedestal Repair | 70 | SF | \$155.00 | \$10,850.00 | \$75.00 | \$5,250.00 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 11 | Horizontal | 245 | LBS. | \$37.00 | \$9,065.00 | \$10.00 | \$2,450.00 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - Vertical | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 12 | and Overhead | 235 | LBS. | \$32.00 | \$7,520.00 | \$10.00 | \$2,350.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 13 | Crack Repair Type 1 - Horizontal | 2,190 | LF | \$20.00 | \$43,800.00 | \$15.00 | \$32,850.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 14 | Crack Repair Type 3 - Horizontal | 300 | LF | \$12.00 | \$3,600.00 | \$2.70 | \$810.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 15 | Crack Repair Type A - Vertical | 2,570 | LF | \$85.00 | \$218,450.00 | \$40.00 | \$102,800.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 16 | Crack Repair Type B - Vertical | 485 | LF | \$70.00 | \$33,950.00 | \$55.00 | \$26,675.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 17 | Crack Repair Type C - Vertical | 130 | LF | \$18.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$10.00 | \$1,300.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 18 | Temporary Leak Repair | 275 | LF | \$55.00 | \$15,125.00 | \$55.00 | \$15,125.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 19 | Temporary Post Shore - As Directed | 49 | EA | \$650.00 | \$31,850.00 | \$200.00 | \$9,800.00 |
| | | Temporary Overhead Electric Support - As | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 20 | Directed | 20 | EA | \$1,200.00 | \$24,000.00 | \$700.00 | \$14,000.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 21 | Full Depth Pavement Replacement at Cracks | 435 | LF | \$38.00 | \$16,530.00 | \$65.00 | \$28,275.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.02 | 22 | General Cash Allowance | 1 | LS | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 |
| | Ī | SUBTOTAL: | | | | \$29,066,600.00 | | \$23,986,835.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 23 | CONTINGENCY (20%) | | | | \$5,813,320.00 | | \$4,797,367.00 |
| | | GRAND TOTAL: | | | | \$34,879,920.00 | | \$28,784,202.00 |
| | | % DIFFERENCE FROM ENG'S EST.: | | | | | | -17.5% |
| | | % DIFFERENCE w/LOWEST BIDDER | | | | | | 21.7% |
| | | Contract Compliance No. | | | | | 34-0802152 (6/ | 8/22, MAJ, 6456 |

| | | | | | Engineer | 's Estimate | Kenmore Cons | truction Co. |
|--------|--------|-------------|------|-------|------------|--------------------------|---|--------------------------|
| Ref. # | Item # | Description | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension |
| | | | | | | | Kenmore Construction 700 Home Rd. Akron, OH 44310 Matt Denholm, Presi (330) 762-9373 <u>mdenholm@kenmore</u> William A. Scala, Ch | dent ecompanies.com |
| | | | | | Goals: | MBE = 1.3% WBE = 1.0% | MBE: see below WBE: JADCO MBE: | 1.37 6.95 8.32 |
| | | | | | | | MVC/Multivista (MBE) | \$49,890. |
| | | | | | | | *Rath (EDGE) | \$195,000. |
| | | | | | | | JT Dillard/Zaymat | \$150,000. \$394,890. |
| | | | | | | | *Rath is also WBE. **GFE not submitted "since th met goals", per bid. | |

ORD #1276-2021, Division of Water HCWP Basin Concrete Rehabilitation CIP 690389-100001, CT No. 2247 TSS 930 Bid Tabulation, Opened 5/5/21

| | | | | | Engineer's | s Estimate | Bowen Engineerin | ng Corporation |
|-----------------|--------|--|-------|-------|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| Ref. # | Item # | Description | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension |
| | | Hap Cremean Water Plant Concrete | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 1 | Rehabilitation | 1 | LS | \$26,676,960.00 | \$26,676,960.00 | \$22,826,769.72 | \$22,826,769.72 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 2 | Shallow Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 325 | SF | \$65.00 | \$21,125.00 | \$66.41 | \$21,583.25 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 3 | Deep Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 725 | SF | \$115.00 | \$83,375.00 | \$78.49 | \$56,905.25 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 4 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Horizontal | 380 | SF | \$185.00 | \$70,300.00 | \$114.71 | \$43,589.80 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 5 | Grout Topping Repair | 1,600 | SF | \$90.00 | \$144,000.00 | \$30.19 | \$48,304.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 6 | Deep Concrete Repair - Vertical | 6,660 | SF | \$120.00 | \$799,200.00 | \$90.56 | \$603,129.60 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 7 | Full Depth Concrete Repair - Vertical | 3,925 | SF | \$175.00 | \$686,875.00 | \$138.86 | \$545,025.50 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 8 | Deep Concrete Repair - Overhead | 525 | SF | \$185.00 | \$97,125.00 | \$114.71 | \$60,222.73 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 9 | Overhead Concrete Beam Repair | 80 | SF | \$132.00 | \$10,560.00 | \$120.75 | \$9,660.00 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 10 | Pilaster/Pedestal Repair | 70 | SF | \$155.00 | \$10,850.00 | \$90.57 | \$6,339.9 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 11 | Horizontal | 245 | LBS. | \$37.00 | \$9,065.00 | \$9.59 | \$2,349.5 |
| | | Supplemental Concrete Reinforcement - Vertical | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 12 | and Overhead | 235 | LBS. | \$32.00 | \$7,520.00 | \$12.85 | \$3,019.75 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 13 | Crack Repair Type 1 - Horizontal | 2,190 | LF | \$20.00 | \$43,800.00 | \$18.11 | \$39,660.9 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 14 | Crack Repair Type 3 - Horizontal | 300 | LF | \$12.00 | \$3,600.00 | \$6.04 | \$1,812.0 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 15 | Crack Repair Type A - Vertical | 2,570 | LF | \$85.00 | \$218,450.00 | \$48.30 | \$124,131.0 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 16 | Crack Repair Type B - Vertical | 485 | LF | \$70.00 | \$33,950.00 | \$72.45 | \$35,138.2 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 17 | Crack Repair Type C - Vertical | 130 | LF | \$18.00 | \$2,340.00 | \$12.08 | \$1,570.4 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 18 | Temporary Leak Repair | 275 | LF | \$55.00 | \$15,125.00 | \$72.45 | \$19,923.7 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 19 | Temporary Post Shore - As Directed | 49 | EA | \$650.00 | \$31,850.00 | \$573.21 | \$28,087.2 |
| | | Temporary Overhead Electric Support - As | | | | | | |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 20 | Directed | 20 | EA | \$1,200.00 | \$24,000.00 | \$658.88 | \$13,177.6 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 21 | Full Depth Pavement Replacement at Cracks | 435 | LF | \$38.00 | \$16,530.00 | \$12.85 | \$5,589.7 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.02 | 22 | General Cash Allowance | 1 | LS | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.00 | \$60,000.0 |
| | | SUBTOTAL: | | | | \$29,066,600.00 | | \$24,555,990.0 |
| 01 20 00 - 1.03 | 23 | CONTINGENCY (20%) | | | | \$5,813,320.00 | | \$4,911,198.0 |
| | | GRAND TOTAL: | | | | \$34,879,920.00 | | \$29,467,188.0 |
| | | % DIFFERENCE FROM ENG'S EST.: | | | | | | -15.59 |
| | | % DIFFERENCE w/LOWEST BIDDER | | | | | | 24.6% |
| | | Contract Compliance No. | | | | | 35-1136995, 1 | MAJ, 9/1/22, 702 |

*Corrected continency & Grand Total

(difference of \$5.54)

| | | | | | Engineer's Estimate | | Bowen Engineer | ing Corporation | |
|--------|--------|-------------|------|-------|---------------------|------------|---------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| Ref. # | Item # | Description | Qty. | Units | Unit Price | Extension | Materials | Extension | |
| | | | | | | | Bowen Engineering | Corportation | |
| | | | | | | | 22 E. Gay Street Ste | 700 | |
| | | | | | | | Columbus, OH 4321 | .5 | |
| | | | | | | | contact: Jason Lami | re, P.E., Reg. Mgr. | |
| | | | | | | | (614) 230-5762 | | |
| | | | | | | | jlamire@bowenengi | neering.com | |
| | | | | | | | Scot M. Evans, Secy, Sr. VP/CFO | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | r | |
| | | | | | a 1 | | MBE: John K. | 0.000/ | |
| | | | | | Goals: | MBE = 1.3% | Leohner (EDGE) | 0.08% | |
| | | | | | | WBE = 1.0% | WBE: JADCO | 12.14% | |
| | | | | | | | | 12.23% | |
| | | | | | | | *John K. Leohner | is also WBE. | |

*Did not meet MBE 1.3% goal but submitted GFE.