PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DP	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$	6,948,336.60

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-1	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			
		15.92%	1.98%	-100.00%			

PART IA: F	Responsiveness Criteria, General Provisions (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	s" answers needed for	responsive bid)
а	The bidder is pre-qualified responsible or prequalified provisionally responsible at time of bid due date. (329.20)(c)	YES	YES	YES			
b	The bid contains the full name of every person or company interested in the same and such other relevant information as the city agency deems appropriate. (329.20)(g) FORM B1	YES	YES	YES			
с	The bidder submitted , with bid, an affidavit stating: (1) That as of the date of bid submission, there have been no changes in the information disclosed in its application for responsibility prequalification; or (2) That changes in the information disclosed in the bidder's application for responsibility prequalification have been reported to director of finance and management or designee and that the bidder is still prequalified responsible or provisionally responsible. (329.20)(d) FORM B9	YES	YES	YES			
d	If applicable, the bidder listed a (sub)contractor(s) with an active water or sewer contractor tappers license (CMS 107.02)	YES	YES	YES			
e	Digital ID on bid is from a person authorized to enter into contract on behalf of the company ("name of person singing contract" on Signature Affidavit must match the name on the Digital ID). Proposal Signature Affidavit	YES	YES	YES			
f	There is no evidence of collusion among the bidders. (329.20)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
	BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DPS	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	6,948,336.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-1	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project M	anager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer'	s Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			
PART IB: R	esponsiveness Crit	teria, Subcontractors (329.20)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	VE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		ed a list of subcontractors with bid or indicated subcontracting opportunities. (329.20)(h)(1)	YES	YES	YES			
b	licensed construction	e listed, Bidder indicated which subcontractors are on trade subcontractors. (329.20)(h)(2) FORM B5 de subcontractors are listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
с	qualified responsibl	becontractors are listed, the bidder proposed pre- e or provisionally responsible licensed trade 9.20)(h) (If no licensed trade subcontractors are	NA	NA	NA			
d	work under which th	e listed, the bidder listed the division/section of ne sub is performing. (329.20)(h)(5) (If no listed, enter "NA") FORM B5	NA	NA	NA			
e	subcontractor per d more than one sub	e listed and the bidder listed more than one livision/section of work, did the bidder explain why is listed for the division/section of work? o licensed trade subcontractors are listed, enter	NA	NA	NA			
f	trade subcontractor responsible. (329.2) subcontractors ar	affidavit, that its proposed licensed construction is are pre-qualified responsible or provisionally 0)(h)(3) Form B9 (If no licensed trade e listed, enter "NA")	NA	NA	NA			
g		subcontractors who were currently suspended or . (329.20)(h)(4) (see links on Tab 5)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DP	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Appar	ent Low Bid :	\$	6,948,336.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610804-1, 690236-140, 530282- 1	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project N	lanager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer	's Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
		•	\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			
PART IC:	Responsiveness Cri	teria, Bid Specific (329.23)	INPUT "YES" F	OR POSITIVE RESPONS	E OR "NO" FOR NEGAT	IVE RESPONSE (all "yes	" answers needed for r	esponsive bid)
а		mit more than one bid for same work. (See ection for full text.) (329.23)(f)(1)(a)	NA	YES	YES			
b	Bidder acknowled	ged addenda. (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
с		ith technical pre-qualification fication requirements where applicable.	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bid contains n invitation for bid. (3	to conditions or qualifications not provided in the 29.23)(f)(1)(d)	YES	YES	YES			
е	Bidder added no pr (329.23)(f)(1)(f)	rovisions reserving right to accept or reject award.	YES	YES	YES			
f	Bidder submitted a	a bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i) FORM B2	YES	YES	YES			
g	Bidder did not sub FORM B2	mit an irregular bid guarantee. (329.23)(f)(1)(i)	YES	YES	YES			
h	Bid prices are mate	erially balanced. (329.23)(f)(1)(b) FORM B3	YES	YES	YES			
i		egularities or deviations from the bid that affect bid ((1)(j) and (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
j		a unit price for each contract item listed, if required. ORM B3 (If a unit price is not an option, enter	YES	YES	YES			
k		a lump sum price if required . (329.23)(f)(1)(h) sum is not an option, enter "NA")	YES	YES	YES			
Ι	Bidder has complie (329.23)(f)(1)(k) F	ed with section 329.20(h) regarding subcontractors. ORM B5	YES	YES	YES			
m		in alterations, omissions, errors, such that it does documents. (329.23)(f)(1)(j)	YES	YES	YES			
n	Bid responds to bid (329.23)(f)(1)(e)	d documents in all material respects.	YES	YES	YES			

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DPS	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	6,948,336.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-2	COMPANY NAME					
Project M	anager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer's Estimate:		\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount					
			\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			
o	Bid is complete. (3	29.23)(f)(1)(e)	YES	YES	YES			
		BID IS:	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE	RESPONSIVE			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB I

version: 2/22/2017

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DPS	Initial Apparent Low Bidder:			Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Appare	ent Low Bid :	\$	6,948,336.60

	Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.	610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-1	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			

		A "no" answer in Pa	rt IE will not necessaril	y render a bid non-res	ponsive. Bidder must	have a valid contract co	ompliance no. prior to
PART ID: F	Responsiveness Criteria, Contract Compliance	contract execution.					
а	The "Evaluated Low Bidder" has an active contract compliance number at the time of bid.	YES	YES	YES			
-							
		Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Bid Responsive,	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation	Waiver Legislation
	Bid Responsiveness, Waiver Considerations:	Continue to Part II	Continue to Part II	Continue to Part II	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;	Required to Contract;
	Biu Responsiveness, waiver considerations.				Contact Fiscal Office	Contact Fiscal Office	Contact Fiscal Office
	Proceed to Part II?	YES	YES	YES			
	LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 6,948,336.60		Manually Enter Amount			

Manually Enter Information

Elite Excavating

TAB II: Assessing Responsibility

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Water Line & Roadway Imp's	Bid Date:	Γ	/lay 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DP	Responsive Low E	El	Elite Excavating		
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Responsive Low	\$	6,948,336.60		

CIP No.	610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-	COMPANY NAME					
Project Manager:	ject Manager: Mike Griffith, P.E.		Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount					
		\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70	0	0	0
		-					

PART IIA: 3	329.23 (2) Responsibility Criteria	INPUT "	YES" FOR POSITIVE RES	PONSE OR "NO" FOR N	EGATIVE RESPONSE (1	point for each "yes", 0 f	or "no")
а	Based on bid amount (as compared to other bids) no further documentation needed (i.e., bid statistically comparable to others). FORM B3, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	NA	NA			
b	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate SPECIALIZED EQUIPMENT for the project. FORM B6, SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
с	The bidder has demonstrated to the city's satisfaction adequate and appropriate HUMAN RESOURCES for the project. FORM B6 , SPECIFICATIONS	YES	YES	YES			
d	The bidder has actively engaged in the construction industry. FORM B6	YES	YES	YES			
е	The bidder has experience in the area of construction service for which the bid has been submitted. FORM B6	YES	YES	YES			
f	The bidder has a successful record of complying with and meeting completion deadlines. FORM B7	YES	NA	NA			
g	The bidder has a successful record of controlling costs on similar construction projects. FORM B7	YES	YES	NA			
h	The bidder has no (substantial) uncompleted work that would hinder the success of the project. FORM B8	YES	NA	YES			
j	The bidder has submitted FORM B10- Green Infrastructure Experience that meets the Department's Criteria	YES	NA	NA			
	Responsibility Score:	9	5	5	0	0	0
	Continue to TAB 3?	YES	YES	YES			

Manually Enter Information

ORD 1628-2021

TAB III. Assessing Local Bidder

PR	ROJECT:	Old Be	echwold Area SSI's,	Wat	ter Line & R	oad	oadway Imp's Bid Date:			May 12, 2021		
Departme	ent/Division:	Public Util	ities/DOSD/DOW/DP			Ev	aluated Low Bidde	r (fron	n Tabs I and II):		Elite Exc	cavating
Section:		Stormwate	er/Water/DPS			E	valuated Low Bid	(from]	Γabs I and II) :		\$	6,948,336.60
CIP No.		610804-1,	690236-140, 530282-	CO	MPANY NAME	C	OMPANY NAME	CO	MPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Ma	anager:	Mike Griff	ith, P.E.	Eli	Elite Excavating		nderground Util.	Co	omplete Gen'l	NA	NA	NA
Engineer'	's Estimate:	\$	12,665,502.00	В	Bid Amount		Bid Amount	E	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
				\$	6,948,336.60	\$	8,054,276.88	\$	8,213,478.70	NA	NA	NA
PART III: 32	29.(01)(u) and 325	9.212 Local Bidder										
		IS BID LO	CAL?		NO		NO		YES			
To look up i	if a bidder is loca	I, use the Office of Co	onstruction Prequalification's list	located	at	<u>X:\C</u>	onstruction Prequa	lificatio	<u>on</u>			
PART IIIA:												
	IF <u>APPAREN</u>		TII IS LOCAL STOP. Skip s 6 & 7 and continue to TA									
step 1	IF <u>APPAREN</u>		RT II IS NOT LOCAL, CONTINU arent low bid and bidder information		TO STEP 2 (see							

Part IIIB:	Part IIIB:									
step 2	Percentage difference of bid from apparent NON-LOCAL, LOW BID.	0.000%	15.917%	18.208%	NA	NA	NA			
step 3	Is amount in prior step WITHIN ONE PERCENT (1%) OF THE LOW BID?	YES	NO	NO	NA	NA	NA			
step 4	If <i>step 3</i> is <u>"yes"</u> , SEE PROCEDURES ON SHAREPOINT SITE. DID AGENCY FOLLOW PROCEDURES FOR BIDDER RELATING TO CITY CODE SECTIONS 329.212 (INDICATE IF NA)?									
step 5	INPUT NEW BID AMOUNT FOR BIDDER, IF APPLICABLE, OR ZERO (\$0)									

Part IIIC:			
step 6	REVISED LOW BID AMOUNT, TAB IIIB:	\$ 6,948,336.60	Manually Enter Amount
step 7	REVISED LOW BIDDER, TAB IIIB:	Elite Excavating	Manually Enter Information

TAB IV. Calculating Environmental Preference

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's, Wat	Bid Date:	May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DPS	Evaluated Low Bidder	(from Tabs I, II and III):	Elite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Evaluated Low Bid (from Tabs I, II and III) :		\$ 6,948,337

CIP No.	610804-1, 690236-140, 530282-17	C	OMPANY NAME	CON	IPANY NAME	С	OMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
Project Manager:	Mike Griffith, P.E.		Elite Excavating	Und	erground Util.		Complete Gen'l	NA	NA	NA
Engineer's Estimate:	\$ 12,665,502.00		Bid Amount	В	id Amount		Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount	Bid Amount
		\$	6,948,336.60	\$	8,054,276.88	\$	8,213,478.70	NA	NA	NA
PART IV: 329.(17) Environmenta	PART IV: 329.(17) Environmental Preference									
Apparent Low Bid:	\$ 6,948,336.60	Арр	arent Low Bidder:	Bidder: Elite Excavating						

PART IV:	329.(17) Environmental Preference						
step 1	Did apparent/evaluated low bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid? Answer "YES" or "NO" for apparent low bidder. For all other bidder's, input "NA"	YES	NA	NA			
step 2	Excluding apparent low bidder, did bidder submit "environmentally preferable" bid?	NA	NO	YES			
step 3	STOP. If apparent/evaluated low bidder submitted an environmentally preferable bid, then the apparent/evaluated low bidder is lead bidder for Tab 4. Ignore the data in Steps 4-6, complete Step 7, and proceed to Tab 5. If the apparent/evaluated low bidder did not submit an environmentally preferable bid, proceed to Steps 6 and 7.						
step 4	Calculate environmental preference for each bid. It is up to five percent (5%) of the non- environmental low bid, for a maximum of \$20,000 per bid.	0.000%	15.917%	18.208%	NA	NA	NA
step 5	Preference amount for each eligible bid (if 0, then no environmental preference was applied).	\$-	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	NA	NA	NA
step 6	Bid amount less environmental preference, except if both claim environmental preference; in that case, both claiming EP cancels it for both	\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,034,276.88	\$ 8,193,478.70	NA	NA	NA
step 7	Low Bid Amount: \$ 6,948,336.60 Low Bidder:	Elite Excavating					

Manually Enter Amount

Manually Enter Information

ORD 1628-2021

TAB 6: U.S. and Ohio EPA Requirements

version: April 28, 2015

PROJECT:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's,	Bid Date:		May 12, 2021	
Department/Division:	Public Utilities/DOSD/DOW/DPS	Initial Apparen	nt Low Bidder:	E	lite Excavating
Section:	Stormwater/Water/DPS	Initial Apparent Low Bid :		\$	6,948,336.60

		Bids from Apparent lowest to highest:	Apparent Low	2nd	3rd	4th	5th	6th
CIP No.		610804-1, 690236-140, 530282- 1	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME	COMPANY NAME
				Underground				
Project Manage	er:	Mike Griffith, P.E.	Elite Excavating	Util.	Complete Gen'l			
Engineer's Esti	imate:	\$ 12,665,502.00	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount	Initial Bid Amount
			\$ 6,948,336.60	\$ 8,054,276.88	\$ 8,213,478.70			
			15.92%	1.98%	-100.00%			
Responsiveness (Criteria, WPCI	F/WSRLA Compliance	A "NO" answer will no information submitted affect project schedule	prior to contract exe				
FORM B11	The "Evaluate	ed Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned r Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Certification	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B12	The "Evaluate the US EPA (ed Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned Certification Regarding Debarment, Suspension, and sibility Matters Form	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B13.2		ed Low Bidder" has provided a completed and signed n 6100-3 from each proposed subcontractor	Yes	Yes	Yes			
FORM B13.3	The "Evaluate US EPA Form	ed Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned n 6100-4	Yes	Yes	Yes			
GOOD FAITH EFFORTS			Yes	Yes	NA			
FORM B14		ed Low Bidder" has completed, signed, and returned Iron and Steel (AIS) Acknowledgement Form	Yes	Yes	Yes			

LOWEST RESPONSIVE BID, TAB I	\$ 6,948,336.60	Manually Enter Amount
LOWEST RESPONSIVE BIDDER, TAB 6	Elite Excavating	Manually Enter Information

TAB V. Miscellaneous

Apparent Low Bidder/Bid:		Elite Excavating				6,948,336.60]			
Project:		Old Beechwold Area SSI's, Water Line & Roadway Imp's								
Other "responsible" requirements 329.23(f)(2)(e)	With respect to a bidder whose bid is determined to be 10% or more below that of the next lowest bidder, [do they have] supplemental details regarding the bid and/or historical information regarding performance and costs on similar contracts to demonstrate the bidder's ability to complete the contract at the price specified.									
	Bidders	Elite Excavating	Underground Util.	Complete Gen'l		0		0		0
	Bid \$ Percent Difference btwn Bid and <u>Next Highest</u> Bid	6,948,336.60 15.92%	\$ 8,054,276.88 1.98%	\$ 8,213,478.70 -100.00%	\$	-	\$	-	- \$	-
	Is any bidder 10% or more below the If yes, does the lower bidder's TAB if If yes, low bidder is "responsible" under	2 evaluation have 'ye	es' answers for question	s c, d, g, and h?						YES YES
Bid Guarantee Requirements	Below are the required documents f Is the guarantee greater than or equal Did the bidder submit all of the required	to 10% of the bid?		ed?		YES YES				
	<u>Bid Bond</u> Bond on City's bond form Surety power of attorney Most recent surety financial statement Current Ohio Dept. of Insurance Certifi									
Contract Compliance	Are all subcontractors contract compliant? Required before the contract can be executed. YES									
Foreign/Non-Ohio Corp	Is the corporation foreign or the individ	on-resident of the State of	Ohio?		NO					
	If yes, business entity shall register wit service of summons, in any action in la					N/A				
This is required before the contract is awarded. "Awarded" means before the Director accepts/approves the bid										
	http://www.sos.state.oh.us/									
Award recommendation: After	vevaluation of the bids, I recommend th	ne following contract	tor be awarded the contr	act for:						
Project Name:	Old Beechwold Area SSI's, Water		mp's							
Recommended Bidder:	Elite Excavating Co. of Ohio, Inc.		_							
Contract Amount:	\$ 6,948,336.60		1							
Evaluator's Name:	M. Smith									
Evaluation Completion Date:	5/13/2021									

ORD 1628-2021

TAB VII: Notes

Overall bid questions:

PM's responses:

(IC-c): 1. Are there any technical requirements / specifications required? If so, does the lowest bidder meet them?

Yes

Elite Excavating Co. of Ohio

(IIA-a): Statistically comparable:
Elite is 45% lower than E.E. and 16% lower than 2nd lowest bidder.
PM please evaluate & respond.

(IIA-j): Green Infrastructure

I have no experience evaluating G.I.; PM please evaluate & respond.

(Tab 6): Loan Rath Builders (EDGE & WBE). Submitted GFE

Underground Utilities:

- (IIA-a): Statistically comparable: Underground is 36% lower than E.E. and 16% higher than lowest bidder. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.
- (IIA-f): Meet deadlines? Did not submit dates so cannot evaluate. Marked "NA".
- (IIA-h): Availability. PM would have to evaluate this. Marked "NA".
- (IIA-j): Green Infrastructure I have no experience evaluating G.I.; PM would have to evaluate. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.

Complete General Construction:

- (IIA-a): Statistically comparable: Complete General is 35% lower than E.E. and 18% higher than lowest bidder. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.
- (IIA-f & g): Meet deadlines/costs? Neither project met but CO's listed so marked "NA" to continue evaluation.
- (IIA-j): Green Infrastructure I have no experience evaluating G.I.; PM would have to evaluate. Marked "NA" to continue evaluation.
- (Tab 6): Loan Has met goals. GFE not necessary.

City PM find issue with the low bid.
NA, Low bidder has required GI

experience.

NA, Neither the project designer nor the

Tab 7: 11 of 11