

To: Tracie Davies, Director  
Department of Public Utilities

From: Trisha Wentzel, Fiscal Operating

Date: May 13, 2021

Subject: Damage Prevention Ticket Management System for the Department of Public Utilities

The Department of Public Utilities solicited proposals from qualified vendors to supply, integrate, and support a Ticket Management System (TMS) that can receive and process requests as generated by Ohio 811. Since 2014, the City of Columbus, Department of Public Utilities (DPU) has been utilizing a Damage Prevention Ticket Management System provided by UtiliSphere (Irth) to manage and track Ohio 811 tickets. This system is now out of contract and the City is soliciting for a new TMS solution.

The project was formally advertised on the Vendor Services website and Bonfire from October 14, 2020 to November 20, 2020. The City received two (2) responses. All proposals were deemed responsive and were fully evaluated when the Evaluation Committee met on November 30, 2020 and January 25, 2021.

The responding firms were:

CONSULTANT/ Subconsultant	BUSINESS ENTERPRISE STATUS	CONTRACT COMPLIANCE NO.	% OF WORK	% MAJORITY % OTHER
4iQ	MAJ	46-3885738	Not Provided	100% MAJ/ 0% Other
<i>DigTix</i>	MAJ	Not Provided	Not Provided	
Irth Solutions	MAJ	46-1568259	100.0%	100% MAJ/ 0% Other

The RFP Evaluation Committee included three (3) voting members –Ann Aubry, Jonathan Lee, and Sonia Krammes from the Department of Public Utilities. Kirsten Kinder, a non-voting member from the Department of Public Utilities, was also involved.

After reviewing the two responses, the committee conducted additional interviews/presentations and requested clarification of the proposals. These interviews/presentations were conducted in January 2021. The Evaluation Committee met again on January 25, 2021 to submit final scores.

4iQ received a score of 81 from the Evaluation Committee (out of a possible 100). The next closest firm was Irth with 77 points.

On January 26, 2021, the Committee submitted 4iQ for the Director's review and recommendation. The Committee felt that 4iQ submitted the strongest overall proposal for the following reasons:

1. Demonstrated a comprehensive product; including dashboarding and reporting capabilities.
2. Product provides out of the box functionality, no need for adding additional modules
3. System offers dedicated training platform through a management system

**The Committee is now rejecting 4iQ's proposal for good cause and in the best interests of the City is terminating contract negotiations. We were informed of a current legal settlement in May 2021 which contains a non-compete clause which does not allow any former Irth customers to contract with**

**4iQ/Digtix for 6 months. Due to the 6 month waiting period, this will not afford the City enough time to implement a new system prior to our existing Irth contract's expiration date of February 28th, 2022.**

**Pursuant to City Code section 329.28 (h), if negotiations fail, negotiations with the original offeror shall be terminated, and the city may enter into contract negotiations with another offeror as selected by the director. Therefore, the Committee is now submitting Irth's proposal for the Director's review and recommendation.**

Per City Code 329.28, please provide direction for proceeding on this project by replying to this e-mail. Four options include:

1. Approve of the committee's recommendation, Irth.
2. Reject the committee's recommendations and designate a firm.
3. Call for an oral presentation of the three highest scoring firms.
4. Other.